

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Ordinance No. 1556-2012

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Power

CIP Number: 670767-100000
 Project Name: Street Lighting Improvements - Agler Road

Lowest Bidder: \$66,476.12
 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$66,476.12

Funding Source: _____
 Bid Opening Date: 6/27/12
 Engineer's Estimate _____

| | | | | | |
|---|---------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| | U.S. Utility | Jess Howard | Complete General | | |
| Bid Tab Amount: | \$66,476.12 | \$78,376.44 | \$77,020.90 | | |
| Local Company? (Proof s/b included.) | No | Yes | Yes | | |

| FACTORS | | | | | | |
|---|---|-------------|-------------|-------------|---------|---------|
| Tier I - Mandatory Factors | | | | | | |
| M-1 | Bid is responsive (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N) | No | No | No | | |
| M-5 | Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| M-6 | Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | no | no |
| Tier II - Creditable Factors | | | | | | |
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local business credit? - (see below for clarification) | no | yes | yes | no | no |
| | If lowest bidder's business is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder's business IS NOT local and another bidder's business is local, then the local bidder receives credit. Local credit is 1% of the apparent low, non-local bidder. | | | | | |
| C-2 | Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the lowest responsive, responsible, and best bid from any non-preferable bid, and must not exceed \$20,000 of the same. | | | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N) | | | | | |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (%) | NA | 17% | 15% | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| | Difference versus lowest bidder (\$) | NA | \$11,235.56 | \$9,880.02 | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000. of the lowest bid. | Yes | No | No | | |
| | Total Local Credit | FALSE | 1.00% | 1.00% | NA | NA |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | \$0.00 | \$664.76 | \$664.76 | NA | NA |
| | Evaluated Bid Total: | \$66,476.12 | \$77,711.68 | \$76,356.14 | NA | NA |
| | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits | \$66,476.12 | \$76,356.14 | \$76,356.14 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | 0% | 16.9% | 14.9% | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | no | no | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| | Proceed to Tier III? | yes | no | no | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| Tier III - Employer & History Factors | | | | | | |
| E-1 | Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| E-2 | Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| E-3 | Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| E-4 | Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | No | No | No | | |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | No | No | No | | |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | No | No | No | | |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | No | No | No | | |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | No | No | No | | |
| HE-6 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | | | | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | No | No | No | | |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | No | No | No | | |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | No | No | No | | |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | No | No | No | | |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) | No | No | No | | |
| HE-8 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| HE-9 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (mark "Yes" if they are self-insured) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| HE-10 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | No | No | No | | |
| HE-11 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | No | | | | |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited. | | | | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | | | | |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | no | no | no | no |
| Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) | | | | | | |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | | | | |
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | Yes | Yes | Yes | | |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 5 | 0 | 0 |
| Division's Recommendation: | | | | | | |