

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: SSES
Division: Sewerage & Drainage

Project: Livingston Ave Sewer Improvements Project
Funding Source: CIP 650635 OWDA
Bid Opening Date: 30-Nov-05
Engineer's Estimate: \$1,686,068.40

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 2,031,388.37
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ -

COMPANY NAME

Original Bid Amount: \$	<u>Complete General</u>	<u>Kokosing Const</u>	-		
	<u>2,031,388.37</u>	<u>2,256,705.17</u>	\$	-	\$
Local Company?	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	Yes	Yes	no	no
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Proceed to Tier II?	Yes	Yes	yes	yes

no

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	Yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	82.00%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	Yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
Dollar Value of Credits	80,000	80,000	80,000	80,000
Bid Total:	1,951,388.37	2,176,705.17	(80,000.00)	(80,000.00)

NA

NA

NA

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ (80,000.00)

Percent Over Low Bid:

-2539.235%

-2820.881%

0.000%

0.000%

#VALUE!

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

yes

yes

yes

#VALUE!

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

yes

yes

yes

#VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	yes	yes	no
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no	no
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:				
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	yes	yes	yes	no
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	NA	no	self-insured -.47	1.05
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-1	-3	-2	0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited				
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)				
Proceed to Tier IV?	no	no	no	no

0

no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project

0

0

0

0

0

Total Number of "Yes" Answers

Division's Recommendation:

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)									
Department: _____				Project: <u>Betterments</u>					
Division: _____				Funding Source: <u>Sewer Enterprise</u>					
Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>500,000.00</u>				Bid Opening Date: <u>26-Jan-05</u>					
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>490,000.00</u>				Engineer's Estimate: \$ <u>525,000.00</u>					
COMPANY NAME									
Original Bid Amount: \$		Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5			
Local Company?		yes	no	yes	no	no			
<p style="text-align: center;">FACTORS</p> <p>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</p> <p>M-1 Bid is responsive yes</p> <p>M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits yes</p> <p>M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request yes</p> <p>M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency no</p> <p>M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses yes</p> <p>M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one yes</p> <p>Proceed to Tier II? yes</p> <p>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</p> <p>C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) yes</p> <p>C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit no</p> <p>C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit yes</p> <p>C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit yes</p> <p><i>% of insurance provided by company</i> 50.00%</p> <p>C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit yes</p> <p><i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i> 10.00%</p> <p>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total) 4.00%</p> <p>Dollar Value of Credits 19,900</p> <p>Bid Total: 480,100.00</p> <p>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits \$ 475,000.00</p> <p>Percent Over Low Bid: 1.074%</p> <p>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) yes</p> <p>Proceed to Tier III? yes</p> <p>Tier III - History/Experience Factors</p> <p>HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs no</p> <p>HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs no</p> <p>HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds no</p> <p>HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years no</p> <p>HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. no</p> <p>HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years no</p> <p>HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: yes</p> <p style="margin-left: 20px;">A. Fair Labor Standards Act no</p> <p style="margin-left: 20px;">B. Prevailing Wage Laws no</p> <p style="margin-left: 20px;">C. Unemployment Compensation Laws no</p> <p style="margin-left: 20px;">D. Worker's Compensation Laws no</p> <p>HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years no</p> <p>HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation yes</p> <p>HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes</p> <p>HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years no</p> <p>HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable no</p> <p>Total Negative History and Experience Factors: 0</p> <p>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited -1</p> <p>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) no</p> <p>Proceed to Tier IV? no</p> <p>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</p> <p>Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).</p> <p>R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) yes</p> <p>R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project yes</p> <p>R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes</p> <p>R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes</p> <p>R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes</p> <p>Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Division's Recommendation: _____</p>									

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience