

From: [Kelsey, Mark](#)
To: [Cofield, Alex A.](#)
Cc: [Wayton, Daniel J.](#); [Gordon, Jamie S.](#); [Atkinson, Jennifer L.](#); [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Lundine, Mark A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Robinson, Valuise E.](#); [Steege, Jerry K.](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Intersection Improvements - Gender Road at Refugee Road
Date: Friday, November 16, 2012 10:07:34 AM

I approve of the recommended consultant for selection

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Thursday, November 15, 2012 4:10 PM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Wayton, Daniel J.; Gordon, Jamie S.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Intersection Improvements - Gender Road at Refugee Road

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: November 15, 2012

Subject: Intersection Improvements – Gender Road at Refugee Road

CIP No. 530086-100023

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Intersection Improvements – Gender Road at Refugee Road project. The contract shall be funded by ODOT (90%) and the Department of Public Service (10%, cash).

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Department of Public Service with completion of the Project Development Process (PDP) for improvements to the intersection of Gender Road at Refugee Road. The purpose of the project is to reduce congestion at the intersection of Gender and Refugee, improve safety, and address deficiencies in the pedestrian and bikeway system

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from October 12, 2012, to November 8, 2012. The city received four (4) responses. Three of the four proposals were deemed responsive. The proposal from ADR & Associates was deemed non-responsive due to their not meeting all required ODOT pre-qualification categories.

The responsive proposals were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on November 15, 2012. The responsive firms are:

CONSULTANT

Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number
Active % OF WORK	% MAJ.	

% OTH.

ME COMPANIES, INC.	Unknown 311442777	NO	80%	80% Unknown
20% Other				

Resource International	FBE	310669793	YES	12%
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	YES	8%

MICHAEL BAKER JR., INC.	Unknown 251228638	NO	60%	20% Majority
60% Unknown				
20% Other				

RW Armstrong	PHC	351062227	YES	20%
Resource International	FBE	310669793	YES	10%
XYZ Survey Service	MBE	43846618	YES	8%
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Ltd.	FBE	311612308	YES	2%

HDR ENGINEERING, INC.	PHC 470680568	YES	70%	90% Majority
10% Other				

Resource International	FBE	310669793	YES	5%
Burgess & Niple, Inc.	MAJ	310885550	YES	20%
Dynotec, Inc.	MBE	311319961	YES	5%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Alex Cofield, Jerry Steege, and Duane Parks.

M-E Companies received 75.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 90). The next closest firm was Michael Baker Jr., Inc. with 72.00 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the three evaluated proposals for your final selection.

M-E Companies 75.00

Michael Baker, Jr. 72.00

HDR Engineering, Inc. 68.33

The Committee would like to submit M-E Companies for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that M-E Companies submitted the strongest overall

proposal for the following reasons:

1. M-E Companies offered a strong project manager and team.
2. M-E Companies suggested ways to reduce schedule and cost.
3. M-E Companies discussed the importance of public involvement.
4. M-E Companies did the PE and ESA.
5. M-E Companies has direct experience with ODOT funded projects.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, M-E Companies
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager

City of Columbus

Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services

109 N. Front St. Ground Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov