

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Water

CIP Number:
Project Name:
Funding Source:
Bid Opening Date:
Engineer's Estimate

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,160,620.98

Vendor Name:	<u>Underground Util.</u>	<u>Beheler</u>	<u>Conic</u>	<u>Eramo & Sons</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,160,620.98	\$2,423,208.06	\$2,636,214.00	\$2,749,843.98

FACTORS					
<u>(Pgs.6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	Yes	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regu</u>					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with t				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	No	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	No	Yes
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	No	No
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No	No	No	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	-1
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	Yes	No	No	Yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSH	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	-1
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>					
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	4.0%	0.0%	43.0%	82.0%
	Negative Factors:				
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes	ER: 100%	Yes	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	100%	ER: 100%	80% - 20%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 3% match up to 3% of gross	ER: 100%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	Yes	No	No	No
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	-1
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	"TBD"
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	"N/A"	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construct	Yes	see comment	see comment	see comment
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing require	Yes	Yes	No	No
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0106	SW0196, SW0295	SW0035	SW0004
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,160,620.98			

Vendor Name:		Underground Util.	Beheler	Conic	Eramo & Sons
Bid Tab Amount:		\$2,160,620.98	\$2,423,208.06	\$2,636,214.00	\$2,749,843.98
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	12%	22%	27%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	no	no	no
Pg. 30- Environmental Preference					
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		No	No	Yes	No
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		0.00%	12.15%	22.01%	27.27%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		\$0.00	\$262,587.08	\$475,593.02	\$589,223.00
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		No	No	No	No
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?					
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits					
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 41 - Addenda Acknlgmt.					
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Pg. 42) - Proposal Signature					
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Pg. 43 - Proposal Bond					
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-1	-2	-2	-3
Division's Recommendation: Award to Underground Utilities Inc.					

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	No	No	No	No
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0

Department: <u>690236-100047</u> Division: <u>Sexton Drive Area WL Imp's</u> <u>Water Bonds</u> <u>12/11/13</u> Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: <u>\$3,461,379.90</u>				
Vendor Name: <u>Elite Excavating</u> <u>Shelly & Sands</u> <u>Cols. Asphalt Pav.</u> Bid Tab Amount: \$2,798,017.33 \$2,852,588.23 \$2,911,501.00				
FACTORS				
<u>(Pgs.6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes	No	Yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	No
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations</u>				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	No	No	No
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	No	No	No
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	No	No	No
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	No	No	No
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	No	No	No
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	Yes	Yes	Yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	Yes	Yes	No
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	Yes	Yes	Yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	No	No	No
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	No	No	No
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>				
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	52.0%	75.0%
Negative Factors:				
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	see comment	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 4%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects	see comment	see comment	see comment
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements?	(blank)	No	No
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0088, G4169	No City License listed	SW0010
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder				

Vendor Name:		Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Cols. Asphalt Pav.
Bid Tab Amount:		\$2,798,017.33	\$2,852,588.23	\$2,911,501.00
Percent Over Low Bid:		30%	32%	35%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		no	no	no
Pg. 30- Environmental Preference				
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		see comment	see comment	see comment
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		29.50%	32.03%	34.75%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		\$637,396.35	\$691,967.25	\$750,880.02
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		No	No	No
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?				
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes	No	Yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Pg. 41 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Pg. 42) - Proposal Signature				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Pg. 43 - Proposal Bond				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	Yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-1	-2	0
Division's Recommendation:				
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 153.12				
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	No	No	No
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	No	No	No
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	No	No	No
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	Yes	No	Yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	No	No	No
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	No	No	No
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	No	No	No
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0