CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM

| Department: | : Public Utilities Water | CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source: Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate | 690236-100037 Kinnear Road Area WL Water Bonds 2/20/13 \$2,221,905.23 |
|---|---|---|---|
| | Water Bid Tab Amount: | Darby Creek \$2,690,337.49 | <u>Conie Constr.</u> \$2,796,800.00 |
| | FACTORS | | |
| | | | |
| Form 1 - Contract | | | |
| Compliance | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | | | |
| Form 3 - Coi | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): | | |
| | Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no |
| | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no |
| | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs | | |
| | (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) | yes yes | yes yes |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | | - | · · |
| Form 4 - Sta | te and Federal Health and Safety Laws: | | |
| | Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) | no | yes |
| | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 7. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) | yes yes | yes yes |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| Form 5 - | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 | | |
| Debarment | years (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| _ | | | |
| <u>Form 6 -</u> | | | |
| Local Workforce | What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties | 100.0% | 63.00% |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | | | |
| <u>Form 7 - Hee</u> | alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs | | |
| | Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee | yes | yes |
| | 2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee | 590/ / 4 2 0/ | 000/ /100/ |
| | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) | 58% / 42% yes | 90% / 10% yes |
| | 5. Blader has retirement of pension plan. (171) | yes | jes |
| | 4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee | "Varies" | see comment |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | | | |
| Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs | Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) | yes | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| | | | |
| Form 9 - Exp | perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED | | |
| | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Form 10 E. | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) xperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED | yes | yes |
| 101111 10 - E | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate project management team (1717) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Form 11 - Do | eadlines and Cost Control | | |
| | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) | yes | see comment |
| Form 12 - A1 | | | |
| I | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N) | yes | yes |

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM

| | Darby Creek | Conie Constr. |
|---|--------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Bid Tab Amoun | st: \$2,690,337.49 | \$2,796,800.00 |
| Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates | | |
| Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N) | no | no |
| License and/or Certificate No: | SW0075 | SW0035 |
| Negative Factor | s: 0 | 0 |
| | | |
| Lowest Bid Dollar Amou | nt \$2,690,337.49 | |
| Percent Over Low Bi | d: 0% | 4% |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid | d) ves | ves |
| | | , |
| | | |
| Page 42 - Environmental Preference | | |
| Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) | no | ves |
| Difference versus lowest bidder (%) | NA NA | 3.96% |
| Difference versus lowest bidder (\$) | NA NA | \$106,462.51 |
| (4) | 1,12 | \$100,102IC1 |
| Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000 |). | |
| of the lowest bid. | no | no |
| | | |
| Pgs. 43-46 Statements and Affidavits | | |
| Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) | ves | yes |
| Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) | ves | ves |
| Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) | ves | ves |
| Negative Factor | | 0 |
| Treguitte a desir | 0 | 0 |
| Page 49 - | | |
| Addenda | | |
| Acknlgmt. Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Page 56 - | yes | |
| Proposal | | |
| Signature Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) | yes | ves |
| Negative Factor | • | 0 |
| Tregative Factor | 5. | U |
| Pages 57-58 -Proposal Bond | | |
| Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) | ves | yes |
| Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) | ves | ves |
| Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) | | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Negative Factor | yes o | yes |
| Negative Factor | 5. U | |
| Grand Total Negative Factor | rs: 0 | |
| Grand Total negative ractor | 5. 0 | |
| District D. Co. | Davida C | l Enganatina I |
| Division's Recommendation | n: Darby Cree | ek Excavating, Inc. |