

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$1,714,662.42

| | | |
|------------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Vendor Name: | <u>Strawser</u> | <u>Decker</u> |
| Bid Tab Amount: | \$1,714,662.42 | \$1,812,268.25 |

| <u>FACTORS</u> | | |
|--|---|--------------------------------------|
| <u>(Pgs. 10-11) & Form 1 (Pg. 13) - Contract Compliance</u> | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) | |
| | | yes yes |
| <u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u> | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) | |
| | | no no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 0 |
| <u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u> | | |
| | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): | |
| | 1. Fair Labor Standards Act | no no |
| | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws | no no |
| | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no no |
| | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws | no no |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) | no no |
| | 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) | yes yes |
| | 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) | yes yes |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 0 |
| <u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u> | | |
| | 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) | no no |
| | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) | yes yes |
| | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan | yes yes |
| | 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) | yes yes |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 0 |
| <u>Form 5 - Debarment</u> | | |
| | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 0 |
| <u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u> | | |
| | 1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties | 90.0% 60.0% |
| | Negative Factors: | |

| | | <u>Vendor Name:</u> | <u>Strawser</u> | <u>Decker</u> |
|--|--|------------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| | | <u>Bid Tab Amount:</u> | \$1,714,662.42 | \$1,812,268.25 |
| <u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u> | | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% | ER: 100% |
| | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% | ER: 100% |
| | Negative Factors: | | | 0 |
| <u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u> | | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) | | no | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | | -1 | 0 |
| <u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) | | see comment | see comment |
| <u>Form 12 - Availability</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | License and/or Certificate No: | | G02223 | SW0011, G02155 |
| | Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| | Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder | | \$1,714,662.42 | |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | | 0.0% | 5.7% |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Pg. 31 - Environmental Preference</u> | | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) | | 0.00% | 5.69% |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) | | \$0.00 | \$97,605.83 |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. | | no | no |
| | If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? | | n/a | |
| <u>Pgs. 32-35 - Statements and Affidavits</u> | | | | |
| Statement 1: | Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| Statement 2: | Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| Statement 3: | Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| Affidavit | Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Pg. 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |

| | | <u>Vendor Name:</u> | <u>Strawser</u> | <u>Decker</u> |
|---|---|------------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| | | Bid Tab Amount: | \$1,714,662.42 | \$1,812,268.25 |
| <u>Proposal (Pg. 49) - Proposal Signature</u> | Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Pgs. 50-51 - Proposal Bond</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| | Grand Total Negative Factors: | | -1 | 0 |
| | Division's Recommendation: | STRA | | |

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

| | | | | |
|----|--|--|-----|-----|
| 1) | Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| 2) | Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| 3) | Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| 4) | Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| 5) | Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| 6) | Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| 7) | Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N) | | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |

| | | | |
|---|--|-----------------------------|-------------------|
| Department: | | CIP Number: | <u>690384</u> |
| | | <u>Watershed Roadway]</u> | |
| Division: | | Project Name: | <u>Rese</u> |
| | | Funding Source: | <u>Water</u> |
| Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: | | Bid Opening Date: | <u>11/1</u> |
| | | Engineer's Estimate | <u>\$2,163</u> |
| Vendor Name: | | <u>Cols. Asphalt Paving</u> | <u>Shellv Co.</u> |
| Bid Tab Amount: | | \$1,828,815.16 | \$1,936,547.98 |

| FACTORS | | | |
|---|---|----------|-----------|
| <u>(Pgs. 10-11)</u> <u>& Form 1</u> <u>(Pg. 13) -</u> <u>Contract</u> <u>Compliance</u> | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 2 -</u> <u>Claims &</u> <u>Liquidated</u> <u>Damages</u> | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): | | |
| | 1. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no |
| | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no |
| | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws | no | no |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) | no | no |
| | 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u> | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) | no | yes |
| | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan | yes | yes |
| | 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | -1 |
| <u>Form 5 - Debarment</u> | | | |
| | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no | no |
| Negative Factors: | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u> | | | |
| | 1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties | 50.0% | 17.55% |
| Negative Factors: | | | |

| | | Vendor Name: | Cols. Asphalt Paving | Shelly Co. |
|--|--|--|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Bid Tab Amount: | \$1,828,815.16 | \$1,936,547.98 |
| <u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u> | | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% | ER: 70% - EE: 30% |
| | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% | ER: 75% - EE: 25% |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u> | | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) | | yes | see comment |
| | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| <u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) | | yes | see comment |
| <u>Form 12 - Availability</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N) | | yes | see comment |
| <u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N) | | no | yes |
| | License and/or Certificate No: | | SW00079 | No City license # listed. |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | | Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder | | |
| | | Percent Over Low Bid: | 6.66% | 12.94% |
| | | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid) | yes | no |
| <u>Pg. 31 - Environmental Preference</u> | | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) | | no | yes |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) | | 6.7% | 12.9% |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) | | \$114,152.74 | \$221,885.56 |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. | | no | no |
| | If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? | | | |
| <u>Pgs. 32-35 - Statements and Affidavits</u> | | | | |
| Statement 1: | Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| Statement 2: | Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) | | yes; not dated | yes |
| Statement 3: | Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) | | yes; not dated | yes |
| Affidavit | Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) | | yes | yes |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Pg. 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u> | | | | |
| | Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) | | yes | yes |

Vendor Name: **Cols. Asphalt Paving** **Shelly Co.**
Bid Tab Amount: \$1,828,815.16 \$1,936,547.98

| | | | |
|---|---|----------------------------|-----------|
| <u>Proposal</u> <u>(Pg. 49) -</u> <u>Proposal</u> <u>Signature</u> | Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| <u>Pgs. 50-51 - Proposal Bond</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |
| | Grand Total Negative Factors: | 0 | -1 |
| | Division's Recommendation: | WSER PAVING COMPANY | |

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section

| | | | |
|-----------|--|----------|----------|
| 1) | Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N) | no | no |
| 2) | Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N) | no | no |
| 3) | Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) | no | no |
| 4) | Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) | yes | yes |
| 5) | Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) | no | no |
| 6) | Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N) | no | no |
| 7) | Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N) | no | no |
| | Negative Factors: | 0 | 0 |

| | |
|--|--|
| Department: <u>-100002</u> | |
| <u>Imp's - Part 2 Hoover</u> | |
| Division: <u>rvoir</u> | |
| <u>Bonds</u> | |
| <u>9/14</u> | |
| Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: <u>,145.40</u> | |
| Vendor Name: <u>Shelly & Sands</u> | |
| Bid Tab Amount: <u>\$2,064,113.21</u> | |

| <u>FACTORS</u> | |
|--|---|
| <u>(Pgs. 10-11) & Form 1 (Pg. 13) - Contract Compliance</u> | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) yes |
| <u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u> | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) no |
| Negative Factors: 0 | |
| <u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u> | |
| | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): no |
| | 1. Fair Labor Standards Act no |
| | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws no |
| | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws no |
| | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws no |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) no |
| | 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) yes |
| | 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) yes |
| Negative Factors: 0 | |
| <u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u> | |
| | 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) yes |
| | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) yes |
| | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan yes |
| | 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) yes |
| | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) no |
| Negative Factors: -1 | |
| <u>Form 5 - Debarment</u> | |
| | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) no |
| Negative Factors: 0 | |
| <u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u> | |
| | 1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 52.0% |
| Negative Factors: 0 | |

| | | | |
|--|--|------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Vendor Name: | Shelly & Sands |
| | | Bid Tab Amount: | \$2,064,113.21 |
| <u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u> | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) | | yes |
| | 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% |
| | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) | | yes |
| | 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: | | ER: 100% |
| Negative Factors: | | | 0 |
| <u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u> | | | |
| | 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) | | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | | 0 |
| <u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes |
| <u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) | | yes |
| <u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) | | see comment |
| <u>Form 12 - Availability</u> | | | |
| | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N) | | yes |
| <u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u> | | | |
| | Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N) | | yes |
| | License and/or Certificate No: | | no City license # listed |
| Negative Factors: | | | 0 |
| Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder | | | |
| Percent Over Low Bid: | | | 20.38% |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid) | | | no |
| <u>Pg. 31 - Environmental Preference</u> | | | |
| | Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N) | | see comment |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%) | | 20.4% |
| | Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$) | | \$349,450.79 |
| | Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid. | | no |
| | If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified? | | |
| <u>Pgs. 32-35 - Statements and Affidavits</u> | | | |
| Statement 1: | Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N) | | yes |
| Statement 2: | Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) | | yes |
| Statement 3: | Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N) | | yes |
| Affidavit | Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N) | | yes |
| Negative Factors: | | | 0 |
| <u>Pg. 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N) | | yes |

| | | | |
|---|--|--------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Vendor Name: | Shelly & Sands |
| | | Bid Tab Amount: | \$2,064,113.21 |
| <u>Proposal (Pg. 49) - Proposal Signature</u> | Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) | | yes |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 |
| <u>Pgs. 50-51 - Proposal Bond</u> | | | |
| | Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) | | yes |
| | Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) | | yes |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 |
| | | Grand Total Negative Factors: | -1 |
| | | Division's Recommendation: | |
| Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section | | | |
| 1) | Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N) | | no |
| 2) | Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N) | | no |
| 3) | Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) | | no |
| 4) | Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) | | yes |
| 5) | Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) | | no |
| 6) | Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N) | | no |
| 7) | Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N) | | no |
| | | Negative Factors: | 0 |