

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Power & Water

Project: DRWP Raw Water Intake Improvements
 Funding Source: Public
 Bid Opening Date: 13-Jun-07
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 3,620,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 4,689,806.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 4,689,806.00

	<u>Righter Company</u>	<u>Kokosing</u>	<u>CJ Mahan</u>
Original Bid Amount:	\$4,689,806.00	\$ <u>5,715,600.00</u>	\$ 5,898,948.00
Local Company?	yes	yes	yes

COMPANY NAME

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	no***	yes	yes
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes
Proceed to Tier II?	no	yes	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)		yes	yes
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit		yes	yes
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit		yes	yes
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit		yes	yes
<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>		100.00%	100.00%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit		yes	yes
<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>		100.00%	100.00%
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)		5.00%	5.00%
Dollar Value of Credits		100,000	100,000
Bid Total:		5,615,600.00	5,798,948.00

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 5,615,600.00

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

3.265%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

yes

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

yes

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs		no	no
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs		no	no
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds		no	no
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years		no	no
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.		no	no
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years		no	no
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:			
A. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no
B. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no
D. Worker's Compensation Laws		no	no
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years		yes	no
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation		yes	yes
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR		yes	yes
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years		no	yes
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable		no	no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:		-1	-1
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited			
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)		yes	yes
Proceed to Tier IV?		yes	yes

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)		yes	yes
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project		yes	yes
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project		yes	yes
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project		yes	yes
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project		yes	yes
Total Number of "Yes" Answers		5	5

Division's Recommendation: KOKOSING

*** The Righter Company did not provide or submit an application for a valid contract compliance number for one of their sub-contractors: Proline Electric, Inc. As per Mandatory Factor: M-6 Contract Compliance, "All bidder(s) and subcontractor(s) that do not have a contract compliance number or include an application to secure a contract compliance number with the bid may be deemed non-responsive and not to be considered for the bid award."

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: _____
 Division: _____

Project: Betterments
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

	COMPANY NAME				
	Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 490,000.00	\$ 525,000.00	\$ -	\$ -
Local Company?	yes	no	yes	no	no

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes		
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes		
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes		
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no		
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes		
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes		
Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	no	no

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no	yes		
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	no	yes		
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes		
% of insurance provided by company	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%		
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes		
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company					
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	4.00%	3.00%	4.00%	NA	NA
Dollar Value of Credits	19,900	15,000	19,900	NA	NA
Bid Total:	480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00	NA	NA

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits \$ 475,000.00

Percent Over Low Bid:	1.074%	0.000%	6.337%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	yes	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	yes	#VALUE!	#VALUE!

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no		
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	yes		
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no		
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	yes	yes		
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no		
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no		
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	no	no		
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	no		
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no		
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no		
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	-1	-3	0	0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited					
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes	no	no	no
Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes			
R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes			
R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes			
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes			
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes			
Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: _____

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience