

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)  |   |                                 |              |  |  |
|---|---|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|
| Department:   |   | Public Utilities                |              | CIP Number: 690472-100000                                |  |
| Division:   |   | Water                           |              | Project Name: O'Shaughnessy Dam Resurfacing              |  |
|   |   |                                 |              | Funding Source: Water Works Enlargement Voted Bond Funds |  |
|   |   |                                 |              | Bid Opening Date: 9/8/10                                 |  |
| Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$94,900.45                     |              | Engineer's Estimate: \$76,070.00                         |  |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$94,900.45                     |              |  |  |
| Original Bid Amount:  |   | Decker Construction \$94,900.45 |              | Shelly & Sands \$166,968.50                              |  |
| Local Company?  |   | yes                             |              | yes  |  |
| <b>FACTORS</b>  |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| <b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>   |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive   | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                                  | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                    | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency                          | no                              | no           |  |  |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses   | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                           | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| Proceed to Tier II?   |   | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| <b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>   |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)                           | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit   | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                                       | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit  | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
|   | % of insurance provided by company  | 100.00%                         | 100.00%      |  |  |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit  | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
|   | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   | 100.00%                         | 100.00%      |  |  |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference   | yes                             | yes          |  |  |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)</b>  |   | 10.00%                          | 10.00%       |  |  |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>  |   | \$9,490.05                      | \$9,490.05   |  |  |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>   |   | \$85,410.41                     | \$157,478.46 |  |  |
| <b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>  |   | \$85,410.41                     | \$157,478.46 |  |  |
| <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>  |   | 0.00%                           | 84.38%       |  |  |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)</b>  |   | yes                             | no           |  |  |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>   |   | yes                             | no           |  |  |
| <b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>  |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 | no                              |              |  |  |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no                              |              |  |  |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no                              |              |  |  |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no                              |              |  |  |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes                             |              |  |  |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes                             |              |  |  |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no                              |              |  |  |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no                              |              |  |  |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>   |   | 0                               | 0            |  |  |
| <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>  |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>  |   | yes                             |              |  |  |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>  |   | yes                             | no           |  |  |
| <b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>   |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |   |                                 |              |  |  |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  | yes                             |              |  |  |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                   | yes                             |              |  |  |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                           | yes                             |              |  |  |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                        | yes                             |              |  |  |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                          | yes                             |              |  |  |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>  |   | 5                               | 0            |  |  |
| <b>Division's Recommendation:</b>   |   | Decker Construction Company     |              |  |  |