

From: [Davies, Tracie R.](#)
To: [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#); [Wilfong, Gary D.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Scioto Peninsula
Date: Tuesday, March 11, 2014 4:48:02 PM

I approve the committee's recommendation of EMH&T.

Thanks,
Tracie

From: Crawford, Thomas L.
Sent: Tuesday, March 11, 2014 1:06 PM
To: Davies, Tracie R.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bauman, Max A.; Cofield, Alex A.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Moran, Alan P.; Mackey, David B.; Sexton, Michael E.; Wilfong, Gary D.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Scioto Peninsula

To: Tracie Davies, Director
Department of Public Service
From: Tom Crawford, Capital Fiscal Manager
Date: March 11, 2014
Subject: Roadway Improvements – Scioto Peninsula

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway Improvements – Scioto Peninsula contract. The recommendation is to award EMH&T, the consultant that was scored the highest by the selection committee. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommended consultant or approving another consultant. If you approve another consultant please provide an explanation.

TC

The Department of Public Service is initiating a procurement effort that will result in the award and execution of a detailed design contract. This project involves the preparation of detailed design plans, which will include new pavement, curb, sidewalks, storm sewer, water main, sanitary sewer, street and pedestrian lighting, landscaping, signals, undergrounding overhead utilities, and all appurtenances within the Scioto Peninsula. The Scioto Peninsula is the areas bounded by the Scioto River and the Norfolk Southern Railroad. The purpose of this project is to upgrade the existing infrastructure to accommodate future development.

The contract will be funded from DPS' 2014 CIB. The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from February 11, 2014, to March 4, 2014. The city received five (5) responses. All

proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on March 11, 2014. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number	Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ. % OTH.
EMH&T	MAJ	31-0685594	Y	53.5%	61.5% MAJ 38.5% OTH
Dynotec, Inc.	AFA	31-1319961	Y	25%	
MKSK	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	8%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FBE	31-1612308	Y	8%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	ASN	31-1612308	Y	5%	
Cannell Graphics	AFA	20-1762210	Y	0.5%	
E.L. Robinson	MAJ	31-1725058	Y	60%	82% MAJ 18% OTH
URS Corporation	MAJ	34-0939859	Y	20%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	31-0680767	Y	8%	
So-Deep US, P.C.	MAJ	54-1618441	N	2%	
XYZ Professional Services, LTD	AFA	04-3846618	Y	10%	
DLZ Ohio	ASN	31-1268980	Y	51%	35% MAJ 65% OTH
CDM Smith	MAJ	04-2473650	Y	5%	
OHM Advisors	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	20%	
MKSK	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	10%	
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	5%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FBE	31-1612308	Y	6%	
Dynotec, Inc.	AFA	31-1319961	Y	3%	
Resource International,	FBE	31-0669793	Y	50%	30% MAJ

Inc.					70% OTH
ms consultants	MAJ	34-6546916	Y	25%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FBE	31-1612308	Y	10%	
The Edge Group	ASN	20-8054208	Y	10%	
CHA Consulting	MAJ	16-0966259	Y	5%	
Parsons Brinckerhoff	PHC	11-1531569	Y	66%	66% PHC 13% MAJ 21% OTH
MKSK	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	3%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	31-0716498	Y	4%	
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FBE	31-1612308	Y	7%	
Stantec Consulting Services	MAJ	11-2167170	Y	10%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service, Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran, and Patti Austin; and two (2) voting members from the Department of Public Utilities, Rob Herr and Bob Arnold. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer and Tom Crawford. Duane Parks, a representative of EBOCO, also attended the meeting.

EMH&T received 86.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firms were Parsons Brinckerhoff with 76.40 and DLZ Ohio with 76.00 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the five evaluated proposals for your final selection.

EMH&T	86.00
Parsons Brinckerhoff	76.40
DLZ Ohio	76.00
E.L. Robinson	75.00
Resource International	74.60

The Committee would like to submit EMH&T for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that EMH&T submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. EMH&T provided the most insight into the firm's proposed approach to this project, particularly from the standpoint of utilities.
2. They clearly defined the responsibilities of their project manager, how they intended to utilize their sub-consultants, and the need for cross-coordination.
3. EMH&T also understood the importance of establishing and adhering to a schedule and has previous experience overseeing critical path projects.
4. Their past performance was the most relevant to the scope of the Scioto Peninsula project and included other projects completed on an accelerated schedule.
5. Their project manager was involved in those and other notable projects, including the Riversouth project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, EMH&T
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Tom Crawford
Fiscal Manager



DEPARTMENT OF
PUBLIC SERVICE

50 W. Gay Street, 5th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Direct: 614.645.1687
Fax: 614.645.7549
www.columbus.gov