

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: <b>Public Utilities</b>				Project: <b>Westside Waterline Improvements</b>			
Division: <b>Power and Utilities</b>				Funding Source:			
				Bid Opening Date: <b>07/11/2007</b>			
Low Bid at Opening: \$ <b>961,419.30</b>				Engineer's Estimate: \$ <b>1,429,000.00</b>			
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ <b>-</b>							
		<b>COMPANY NAME</b>					
Original Bid Amount: \$		Danbert	Fields Excavating	Loveland	Nickolas Savko	Darby Creek	Tata Excavating
Local Company?		no	no	no	Yes	No	Yes
		\$ 961,419.30	\$ 1,101,997.44	\$ 1,119,522.96	\$ 1,296,757.25	\$ 1,684,234.90	\$ 1,783,284.70
<b>FACTORS</b>							
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>							
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>							
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	no	no	yes	no	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes	no	no	yes	n
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
% of insurance provided by company		100.00%	100.00%	30.00%	60.00%	58.00%	75.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company		100.00%	100.00%	0.00%	100.00%	varies	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	no	yes	yes	no
<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)</b>		3.00%	8.00%	1.00%	9.00%	9.00%	4.00%
<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>		28,843	48,843	9,614	48,843	58,457	28,843
<b>Bid Total:</b>		932,576.72	1,053,154.86	1,109,908.77	1,247,914.67	1,625,778.13	1,754,442.12
<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>		\$ <b>932,576.72</b>					
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		0.000%	12.930%	19.015%	33.814%	74.332%	88.128%
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>		yes	no	no	no	no	no
<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>		yes	no	no	no	no	no
<b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>							
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no					
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no					
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no					
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no					
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no					
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no					
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:						
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no					
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no					
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no					
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no					
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no					
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes					
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes					
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no					
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no					
<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>		0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>							
<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>		yes					
<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>		yes	no	no	no	no	no
<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>							
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).							
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes					
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes					
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes					
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes					
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes					
<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>		5	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		<b>Danbert, Inc.</b>					