

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			
		7.54%	5.48%	-100.00%			

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.201)(a), (329.21)(h) (<u>Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000</u>)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(e) FORM B1	YES	YES	YES			
c	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.201)(b)(1)(2) FORM B9 (329.201)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES	YES			
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person signing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	YES	YES			
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
BID IS:		RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.:	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			
PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder provided a list of first-tier subcontractors, as well as MBE/WBE subs to meet subcontracting goals. 329.20(f)(1) FORM B5 & ODI Forms	YES	YES	YES			
b	If subcontractors are listed, bidder indicated which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (329.201)(c)(1) FORM B5 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed or not required, enter "NA") (Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000)	NA	YES	YES			
c	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.201)(C)(2) FORM B9 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") (Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000)	NA	YES	YES			
d	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(f)(3) (If no subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	NA	YES	YES			
e	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(f)(3) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	NA	NA	NA			
f	Bidder and subcontractors are not suspended or debarred by the City, nor on the City's Adverse Determination list by the Wage Theft Commission. (329.20)(f)(2)	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder stated, via affidavit, proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors meet the Subcontractor Training and Benefits requirements (329.212)(d)(2)(c) FORM B14 (Only applicable for bids estimated > \$2,000,000)	NA	NA	NA			
BID IS:		RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			

PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowledged addenda. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
c	Bidder complied with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(c)	NA	NA	NA			
d	The bid contains no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Bidder added no provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(f)	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a bid guarantee. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not submit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are materially balanced. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES	YES			
i	Bid contains no irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(j) & (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j	Bidder submitted a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(g) FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
k	Bidder submitted a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(h) FORM B3 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
l	Bidder has complied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
m	Bid does not contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
-----------------	---	------------------	---------------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			
n	Bid responds to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
o	Bid is complete. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
-----------------	---	------------------	---------------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			

Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 3,733,466.91	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Underground Util.	← Manually Enter Information

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):	\$ 3,733,466.91
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25
		\$ 4,234,963.98	0
		0	0

PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")					
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
c	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	NA	YES			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	NA	YES			
Responsibility Score:		8	6	8	0	0	0

LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BID, TAB II	\$ 3,733,466.91	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BIDDER, TAB II	Underground Util.	← Manually Enter Information

TAB III: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
-----------------	---	------------------	---------------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Underground Util.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ -

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		7.54%	5.48%	-100.00%			
Responsiveness Criteria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance		A "NO" answer will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required information submitted prior to contract execution. Delay in providing this information may result in delay of loan award and affect project schedule.					
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4	Yes	Yes	Yes			
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.3% MBE and 1.0% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided. (329.20)(f)(4)	Yes	Yes	NA			
FORM B13	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes	Yes	Yes			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB 3	\$ 3,733,466.91	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 3	Underground Util.	← Manually Enter Information

TAB IV: MBE/WBE Subcontracting Goals and/or Good Faith Effort

version: 9/6/22

ODI MBE/WBE Assigned Goal: 8%

PROJECT:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	Bid Date:	September 28, 2022
-----------------	--	------------------	--------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	0
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 3,733,466.91

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690236-100107, CT No. 2131	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Bob Arnold, PE	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,256,399.14	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98			
		7.54%	5.48%	-100.00%			

Demonstrate achievement of MBE/WBE subcontracting goals or GFE.							
Appendix A (1)	"Bid Discount /Proposal Incentive Request Form/Affidavit": Bidder qualifies for Bid Discount?	NA	No	NA			
Appendix A (2)	Form has been approved & signed by ODI staff.	NA	NA	NA			
Appendix B (1)	"Declaration of Proposed MBE/WBE Utilization": Bidder meets goal?	Yes	No	Yes			
Appendix C	"Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver & Documentation of GFE": The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT the MBE/WBE goal and has completed the nine (9) "Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver and Documentation of Good Faith Effort" forms.	NA	No	NA			

LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BID, TAB II	\$ 3,733,466.91	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BIDDER, TAB II	Underground Util.	← Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Underground Util.	\$ 3,733,466.91
Project:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Underground Util.	Shelly & Sands	Danbert	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 3,733,466.91	\$ 4,014,900.25	\$ 4,234,963.98	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	-7.54%	-5.48%	100.00%	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

No
NA

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Yes
Yes

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form (Tinubu/SurePath only)

Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

Yes

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

No
NA

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

<https://businesssearch.ohiosos.gov/>

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name:	Roswell Dr. Area Water Line Improvements
Recommended Bidder:	Underground Util.
Contract Amount:	\$ 3,733,466.91

Evaluator's Name:	M. Smith
Evaluation Completion Date:	9/30/2022



NOTES:

Examples below:

Overall bid question:

PM's responses:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

No technical requirements

Underground Utilities:

(IIA-f): Meet deadlines?

Did not submit begin/end dates so cannot evaluate. Marked "YES"; see comment.

OK. Underground Utilities recently completed Thomas Lane Ph. 2 project well ahead of schedule. Bidder has also been awarded Chestershire & Ziegler Ave. Area WL Imp's.

Shelly & Sands:

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable:
X% higher than E.E. & X% lower than next lowest bidder. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

(IIA-g): Meet costs?
Only 1 of 3 listed met costs; no CO's listed; marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

(IIA-h): Availability:
3 high dollar projects listed; PM would have to evaluate this if chosen. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

(Tab 4): ODI Goals:
Lionel Constructi is an EBE and cannot be counted toward goals. Also, the GFE submitted by S&S is not a valid GFE.

Danbert:

(IIA-f): Meet deadlines?
Only met 1 of 3 deadlines listed but met 3 of 3 on Costs. Marked "Yes" as we've successfully done business with Danbert before.

OK. Danbert has successfully completed s

(Tab 3): EPA Goals:
*Submitted weak GFE (only 5 vendors contacted). Marked "NA".