

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities  
Division: Water

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 2,324,262.23  
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 2,745,013.28

Project: State Route 317 - London/Groveport 24" Water Main - Part 3  
Funding Source: Contract No. 913, Project No. 690383  
Bid Opening Date: December 28, 2005  
Engineer's Estimate: \$ 3,508,897.70

	COMPANY NAME									
	Kokosing Construction Co., Inc.	Complete General Construction Co.	John Eramo & Sons, Inc.	Trucco Construction Co., Inc.	Fields Excavating, Inc.	George J. Igel & Co., Inc.	Nickolas Savko & Sons, Inc.	Reynolds, Inc.	Tata Excavating, Inc.	Glenn Johnston, Inc.
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 2,324,262.23	\$ 2,513,520.35	\$ 2,615,083.20	\$ 2,745,013.28	\$ 2,787,089.76	\$ 2,818,921.77	\$ 2,819,322.99	\$ 3,079,426.85	\$ 3,395,326.20	\$ 4,604,539.50
Local Company?	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	80.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	50.00%	75.00%	0.00%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	15.00%	100.00%	0.00%
<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	4.00%	3.00%	5.00%	4.00%	5.00%	4.00%	0.00%
<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	100,000	100,000	100,000	80,000	60,000	100,000	80,000	100,000	80,000	-
<b>Bid Total:</b>	2,224,262.23	2,413,520.35	2,515,083.20	2,665,013.28	2,727,089.76	2,718,921.77	2,739,322.99	2,979,426.85	3,315,326.20	4,604,539.50

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	<u>\$ 2,224,262.23</u>									
Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	8.509%	13.075%	19.816%	22.606%	22.239%	23.156%	33.951%	49.053%	107.014%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative act	no	no								
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative	no	no								
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no								
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	yes	no								
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc	no	no								
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(ies) in past 3	no	no								
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:										
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no								
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no								
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no								
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no								
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 y	yes	yes								
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes								
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	no	yes								
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no								
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no								
<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	-3	-1								
<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>										
<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	yes	yes								
<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	yes								

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (t	yes	yes								
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of proje	yes	yes								
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes								
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes								
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes								
<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	5	5								

Division's Recommendation:

\* Bidder answered yes to meeting the definition of "local business", but company address is located outside of the City of Columbus and Franklin County.

