

BID TABULATION
FEM 0102.6

Bidders Name:	AA Programmed Janitorial and Building Maintenance Inc.	Clean Guy Cleaning Services LLC	Conserve Building Maintenance LLC	JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR DP FACILITIES	Key Cleaning Connection LLC.	Master Maintenance LLC.	Stevens-Witherspoon Corp.	Viable Service Group Inc.	
Bidders Address:	1423 E. Main Street Columbus, Ohio 43205	4764 N. High Street Columbus, Ohio 43214	4200 Regent street, Suite 200 Columbus, Ohio 43219	1391 Essex Ave. Columbus, Ohio 43211	4033 A Alum Creek Drive Columbus, Ohio 43207	2999 E. Dublin Granville Road Columbus, Ohio 43231	6200 Wilcox Road Dublin, Ohio 43016	100 E. Campus View Blvd., Suite 250 Columbus, Ohio 43235	3189 Princeton Road #232 Hamilton, Ohio 45011
Contact Name and Phone number:	Nelson Okafo: 614-252-1848	Guy Walker Jr: 614-725-3326	Mike Disalio: 614-357-7786	Morris Berkley: 614-737-3750	Beth Hazel: 614-743-4256	E. Starr Yates: 614-794-2200	John Hoge: 614-734-1400	Erica Witherspoon	Derrick Wilson: 513-638-6025
Email:	nelsono@aaianitorialinc.com	gwalker@clnguy.com	comservbm@gmail.com	morris@kmcleaning.com	bhazel@convusjanitorial.com	syates@keycleaningconnection.com	marbles@columbus.rr.com	erica@stevenswitherspooncorp.com	derrick@viableservicegroup.com
COC Contract Compliance Number (CCN):	31-1190027	45-4780109	27-3600764	02-0553299	20-0111346	31-1681060	31-1585601	80-0865887	26-1685042
CCN expiration/status:	12/14/14 MBE	7/02/14 MAJ	6/11/14 MAJ	4/30/15 MBE	1/18/2014 MAJ	3/8/15 MBE	7/26/14 MAJ (Pending certification as HL1)	1/24/15 MAJ	Pending MBE
Attended mandatory Pre-Bid Meeting on 6/5/13?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Any Subcontractors declared? : (page 5)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
Form 1 - Contract Compliance No.? (page 8)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
If no, has CCN been submitted on line? (page 8)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Yes
Form 2 - Violation of Fair Labor Act? (page 9)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Violation of Unemployment Laws? (page 9)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Violation of Worker's Comp. Laws? (page 9)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Noncompliance with Affirmative Action? (page 10)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Qualify for BWC? (page 11)	No	No	No	Yes 0.56	Yes 0.47	No	Yes 1.00	No	No
Bidder will provide financial records? (page 11)	Yes	Yes	No - "Our financial records are not audited at this time".	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Field left blank **
Form 3 - Any OSHA violations? (page 12)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Health & Safety Plan? (page 12)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provide City with copy of Safety Plan? (page 12)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provide City with copy of OSHA log? (page 12)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Any EPA violations? (page 13)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Form 4 - Has bidder been debarred? (page 14)	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Form 5 - % of Employees from Franklin Co.? (page 15)	100%	100%	38%	50%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Form 6 - Bidder provide health insurance? (page 16)	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No
If yes what % employer vs employee? (page 16)	N/A	N/A	N/A	60/40	50/50	50/50	N/A	N/A	N/A
Bidder provide responsible wage? (page 16)	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
Bidder employs 25 or less full time employees and therefore exempt? (page 16)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 7 - Project Manager Experience & Resources? (page 17)	Yes, Owner and Executive Assistant have the necessary experience -15-35 years. Company has the following resources: walk behind floor scrubber, walk behind buffer, hi-speed buffer.	Yes, Owner has necessary experience -15 years. Company has the following resources: carpet extractor, carpet cleaning machine, floor buffer, floor autoscrubber, autovac.	Yes, Operations Manager has necessary experience -7 years. Company has the following resources: various floor scrubbers and buffers, janitorial carts, mops, brooms, carts.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 5 to 10 years at K & M. Company has the following resources: various floor scrubbers and buffers.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 2 to 21 years. Company has the following resources: hi and low speed floor machine and carpet tile cleaner, vacuums, restroom cleaners.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 10 to 18 years. Company has the following resources: Rotary floor scrubbers and buffers, wet vacs, carpet extractor, walk behind scrubber.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 8 to 18 years. Company has the following resources: auto scrubbers and buffers, wet vacs, sweepers.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 10 to 22 years. Company has the following resources: vacuum cleaners, carpet cleaners, buffer & scrubbers.	Yes, Project Management Team has necessary experience ranging from 13 to 15 years. Company has the following resources: Floor scrubbers and buffers, wet/dry vacs, pressure washer, vacuums.
Form 8 - Project Experience? (page 18)	Yes, COC Public Utilities Complex - 250,000 sf 5X/week, COC DOSD - 200,000 sf 5X/week, Ohio DOPublic Safety - 400,000 sf 5X/week	No, does not meet minimum requirements COC DOT - 21,500 sf 7X/week, Securitas Security Services- 10,000 sf 3X/week, Firefly Play Cafe - 5,000 sf 4X/week	No, does not meet minimum requirements Sandusky Bay Station, Port Clinton - 61,000 sf 7X/week, Arena Grand Movie Theater- 8,400 sf monthly, Delaware County Engineers Office - 47,500 sf 5X/week	Yes, COC Fire Academy - 127,000 sf 7X/week, COC Health Dept.- 170,000 sf 5X/week, COC DOSD - 160,000 sf 5X/week	Yes, Advance Auto Parts - 356,000 sf 3 shifts 6X/week, YRC- 350,000 sf 6X/week, Lillibridge Health Care Service - 465,000 sf 5X/week	Yes, IBM 385,000 sf 5X/week, Colliers International - 150,000 sf 5X/week, OSU - 1,235,000 sf 5X/week	Yes, UPS - 750,000 sf 7X/week, Ex - 500,000 sf 7X/week, Rea and Associates - 50,000 sf 7X/week	Yes, Upgrade Property SVC - 150,000 sf 5X/week, TW General - 240,000 sf 5X/week for 2 weeks as a sub, Unique Industries - 75,000 sf 3-4X/week	No, does not meet minimum requirements. Commercial Contractor Inc. - 11,000 sf one time cleaning Patriot Construction LLC - 5,400 sf one time cleaning Core-1 Construction - 8,000 sf one time cleaning
Spoke to references?	Yes, Reference stated that they resolved every problem that came up. Unresolved items were usually expectations that were not in the contract. Would use this entity again, reference stated they had no issues with the contract.	No	No	No	No	No	Yes, References are extremely satisfied with the company. They have stated that they have used this company for many years (10-15 years) because..." they were the best janitorial company they ever had". Would highly recommend to other entities. "They continue to impress their clients."	No	No
Form 9 - Availability? (page 21)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

BID TABULATION
FEM 0102.6

Bidders Name:	AA Programmed Janitorial and Building Maintenance Inc.	Clean Guy Cleaning Services LLC	Conserve Building Maintenance LLC	JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR DP FACILITIES	Key Cleaning Connection LLC.	Master Maintenance LLC.	Stevens-Witherspoon Corp.	Viable Service Group Inc.	
Bidders Address:	1423 E. Main Street Columbus, Ohio 43205	4764 N. High Street Columbus, Ohio 43214	4200 Regent street, Suite 200 Columbus, Ohio 43219	1391 Essex Ave. Columbus, Ohio 43211	4033 A Alum Creek Drive Columbus, Ohio 43207	2999 E. Dublin Granville Road Columbus, Ohio 43231	6200 Wilcox Road Dublin, Ohio 43016	100 E. Campus View Blvd., Suite 250 Columbus, Ohio 43235	3189 Princeton Road #232 Hamilton, Ohio 45011
Contact Name and Phone number:	Nelson Okafo: 614-252-1848 nelsono@aaianitorialinc.com	Guy Walker Jr: 614-725-3326 gwalker@clnguy.com	Mike Disallo: 614-357-7786 comservbm@gmail.com	Morris Berkley: 614-737-3750 morris@krmkleeningservice.com	Beth Hazel: 614-743-4256 bhazel@convusjanitorial.com	E. Starr Yates: 614-794-2200 syates@keycleaningconnection.com	John Hoge: 614-734-1400 marbles@columbus.rr.com	Erica Witherspoon erica@stevenswitherspooncorp.com	Derrick Wilson: 513-638-6025 derrick@viableservicegroup.com
COC Contract Compliance Number (CCN):	31-1190027	45-4780109	27-3600764	02-0553299	20-0111346	31-1681060	31-1585601	80-0865887	26-1685042
CCN expiration/status:	12/14/14 MBE	7/02/14 MAJ	6/11/14 MAJ	4/30/15 MBE	1/18/2014 MAJ	3/8/15 MBE	7/26/14 MAJ (Pending certification as HL1)	1/24/15 MAJ	Pending MBE
Environmental Preferable Bidder? (page 22)	No	No	No	Yes, documentation attached	Yes, documentation attached	No	Yes, documentation attached	Yes, documentation attached	No
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)				Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes	
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)				32.90%	36.50%		4.80%	18.70%	
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)				\$54,700.67	\$60,667.20		\$7,946.40	\$31,046.40	
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.				NO	NO		YES	NO	
Contractor current with all COC income taxes? (page 23)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non Collusion statement affirmation? (page 24)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Authorization for signature? (page 25)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Proposal Affidavit? (page 26)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Addendum Acknowledgement (page 29)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Required Company Information: (page 29)									
Total Number of company employees	11	2	8	62	583	38	200	7	6
Total number of employees working in columbus	11	2	3	31	176	26	200	7	0
Additional number of employees due to this contract	0	14	11.5	10	6	9	10	17	4
Bid Schedule: (page 30)									
Monthly Janitorial Services for JPWWTP/ total for 12 months:	\$2,005.00/\$24,060.00	\$3,370.13/\$40,441.56	\$3153.58/\$37,842.96	\$2,474.89/\$29,698.68	\$4,258.00/\$51,096.00	\$3,309.79/\$39,717.48	\$2350.00/\$28,200.00	\$4,200.00/\$50,400.00	\$2,726.74/\$32,720.88
Monthly Janitorial Services for SWWTP/ total for 12 months:	\$2,068.00/\$24,816.00*	\$2,714.80/\$32,577.60	\$4,626.25/\$55,515.00	\$3,135.81/\$37,629.72	\$3,278.00/\$39,336.00	\$3,541.47/\$42,497.64	\$3,000.00/\$36,000.00	\$3,500.00/\$42,000.00	\$2,196.52/\$26,358.24
Monthly Janitorial Services for Compost/ total for 12 months:	\$2,005.00/\$24,060.00	\$10,491.25/\$125,895.00	\$1,865.00/\$22,380.00	\$1,345.24/\$16,142.88	\$913.00/\$10,956.00	\$761.25/\$9,135.00	\$1,000.00/\$12,000.00	\$1,950.00/\$23,400.00	\$825.00/\$9,900.00
Monthly Janitorial Services for SMO/ total for 12 months:	\$6,520.00/\$78,240.00	\$466.58/\$5598.96	\$9,535.00/\$114,420.00	\$9,786.05/\$117,432.60	\$8,745.00/\$104,940.00	\$8,936.42/\$107,237.04	\$6,850.00/\$82,200.00	\$5,300.00/\$63,600.00	\$8,308.85/\$99,706.20
Subtotal	\$151,176.00*	\$204,513.12	\$230,157.96	\$200,903.88	\$206,328.00	\$198,587.16	\$158,400.00	\$179,400.00	\$168,685.32
10% Contingency:	\$15,117.60*	\$20,451.31	\$23,015.80	\$20,090.39	\$20,632.80*	\$19,858.72	\$15,840.00	\$17,940.00	\$16,868.53
Bidders Total:	\$166,293.60*	\$224,964.43	\$253,173.76	Field left blank \$220,994.27**	Field left blank \$226,960.80**	\$218,445.88	\$174,240.00	\$197,340.00	\$185,553.85
Additional site charge (lump sum):	\$25.00/hr***	\$350.00	\$125.00	\$80.00	\$0.00	\$100.00	\$750.00	\$40.00	\$65.00
Price per Square foot of additional cleaning:	\$0.09	\$1.1000	\$1.32	\$0.10	\$0.095	\$0.0902	\$0.10	\$0.12	\$0.89
Numbers in red have been corrected by City's Project Manager * = mathematical correction field left blank *** = incorrect information supplied	** =								
RANKING (INCLUDING ALL CREDITS AND EVALUATION FACTORS):	2	Non-Responsible - does not meet minimum experience qualifications.	Non-Responsible - does not meet minimum experience qualifications	5	6	4	1	3	Non-Responsible - does not meet minimum experience qualifications
AWARD RECOMMENDATION:							Environmental Preference Credit applied for the purpose of awarding the contract. Bidders documentation reviewed by City Attorney and environmental credit applies. Therefore recommendation is made that Master Maintenance LLC is the lowest responsive and responsible and best bidder.		