

**From:** [Davies, Tracie R.](#)  
**To:** [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)  
**Cc:** [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Bauman, Max A](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#); [Young, James D.](#); [Schmidt, Steven M.](#)  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway, Bikeway, and Pedestrian Improvements - General Engineering (2014)  
**Date:** Wednesday, October 01, 2014 11:56:29 AM

---

I approve of the committee's recommendations- Dynotec, Prime AE Group and TranSystems.

Thanks,

Tracie

---

**From:** Crawford, Thomas L.

**Sent:** Wednesday, October 1, 2014 10:16 AM

**To:** Davies, Tracie R.

**Cc:** Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bauman, Max A; Cofield, Alex A.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Moran, Alan P.; Mackey, David B.; Sexton, Michael E.; Young, James D.; Schmidt, Steven M.

**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Roadway, Bikeway, and Pedestrian Improvements - General Engineering (2014)

**To:** Tracie Davies, Director

Department of Public Service

**From:** Tom Crawford

Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** September 30, 2014

**Subject:** Roadway, Bikeway, and Pedestrian Improvements – General Engineering (2014)

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway, Bikeway, and Pedestrian Improvements – General Engineering (2014) contract. The recommendation is to award Dynotec, Prime AE Group, and TranSystems, the consultants

that were scored the highest by the selection committee. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommendation or stating how you would like it awarded. Please provide an explanation if we are to make an award different from the committee's recommendation.

TC

The Department of Public Service initiated a procurement effort that will result in the award and execution of multiple general engineering contracts whereby each contract will include engineering services for roadway, bikeway, and pedestrian projects. The intent of this project is to provide the Department of Public Service with continuing, contractual access to additional resources including professional engineering and surveying services and technical expertise necessary for the Department to complete its Capital Budget commitments.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from August 28, 2014, to September 18, 2014. The city received seventeen (17) responses. Sixteen (16) proposals were deemed responsive and were evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on September 29, 2014, and again on September 30, 2014. The responding firms were:

**CONSULTANT**

<b>Sub-consultant</b>	<b>Business Enterprise Status</b>	<b>Contract Compliance Number</b>	<b>Active</b>	<b>% OF WORK</b>	<b>% MAJ.</b>	<b>% OTH.</b>
<b>ADR &amp; ASSOCIATES, LTD.</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>31-1499809</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>55%</b>	<b>55% MAJ</b>	<b>45% OTH</b>
Smart Services, Inc.	FBE	31-1456994	Y	30%		
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	ASN	31-0716498	Y	5%		
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	31-0680767	Y	5%		
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FBE	31-1612308	Y	5%		
<b>KORDA/NEMETH ENGINEERING INC.</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>31-0922991</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>85% MAJ</b>	<b>15% OTH</b>
Burgess & Niple, Inc.	MAJ	31-0885550	Y	15%		
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	8%		
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	7%		
<b>DYNOTEC, INC.</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>31-1319961</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>85%</b>	<b>0% MAJ</b>	<b>100% OTH</b>
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	31-1268980	Y	15%		
<b>PRIME AE GROUP, INC.</b>	<b>ASN</b>	<b>26-0546656</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>50-60%</b>	<b>0% MAJ</b>	<b>75-85% OTH</b>
						<b>15-25% PHC</b>

TranSystems Corporation of Ohio PHC 43-0839725 Y 15-25%  
 XYZ Survey Services, Ltd. MBE 04-3846618 Y 10-15%  
 DHDC Engineering Consulting Services ASN 32-0376762 Y 5-10%  
**STONE ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING & SCIENCE, INC. FBE 31-1262683 Y**  
**65% 35% MAJ**

**65% OTH**

ms consultants inc. MAJ 34-6546916 Y 35%  
**PARSONS TRANSPORTATION GROUP INC. MAJ 31-1358938 Y 60% 60% MAJ**

**40% OTH**

Resource International, Inc. FBE 31-0669793 Y 30%  
 Lawhon & Associates, Inc. FBE 31-1153141 Y 4%  
 CCI Engineering Services (CAD Concepts Inc.) FBE 31-1390280 Y 4%  
 Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc. FBE 31-1612308 Y 2%  
**COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS, INC. ASN 31-0716498 Y 74% 2%**  
**MAJ**

**78% OTH 22% PHC**

Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc. PHC 11-1531569 Y 22%  
 ASC Group, Inc. FBE 31-1167506 Y 2%  
 Professional Service Industries, Inc. MAJ 37-0962090 Y 2%  
**CHA CONSULTING, INC. MAJ 16-0966259 Y 50% 75% MAJ**

**25% OTH**

MKSK (MSK2, LLC) MAJ 45-3413259 Y 25%  
 Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc. FBE 31-1612308 Y 8%  
 Barr & Prevost MBR 31-1347309 N 15%  
 Lawhon & Associates, Inc. FBE 31-1153141 Y 2%  
**AMERICAN STRUCTUREPOINT, INC. MAJ 35-1127317 Y 80% 80% MAJ**

**20% OTH**

Resource International, Inc. FBE 31-0669793 Y 17%  
 Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc. FBE 31-1612308 Y 3%  
**M-E/IBI GROUP MAJ 31-1442777 Y 80% 80% MAJ**

**20% OTH**

CCI Engineering Services (CAD Concepts Inc.) FBE 31-1390280 Y 20%  
**CRAWFORD, MURPHY & TILLY, INC. MAJ 37-0844662 Y 70-75% 80% MAJ**

**20% OTH**

Dynotec, Inc. MBE 31-1319961 Y 15%  
 Carpenter Marty Transportation Inc. MAJ 46-0918246 Y 5-10%

Resource International, Inc. FBE 31-0669793 Y 5%  
**TRANSYSTEMS CORPORATION OF OHIO PHC 43-0839725 Y 60% 20% MAJ**

**20% OTH**

**60% PHC**

Dynotec, Inc. MBE 31-1319961 Y 20%  
 Alta Planning + Design MAJ 68-0465555 Y 5%  
 OHM Advisors MAJ 38-1691323 Y 15%  
**STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES INC. MAJ 11-2167170 Y 75% 75% MAJ**

**25% OTH**

Resource International, Inc. FBE 31-0669793 Y 5%  
 Dynotec, Inc. MBE 31-1319961 Y 15%  
 Engage Public Affairs FBE 20-1593274 Y 5%  
**STRAND ASSOCIATES INC. MAJ 39-1020418 Y 65% 65% MAJ**

**35% OTH**

Dynotec, Inc. MBE 31-1319961 Y 30%  
 Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc. FBE 31-1612308 Y 5%  
**MICHAEL BAKER JR., INC. MAJ 25-1228638 Y 70% 67% MAJ**

**33% OTH**

CAD Concepts Inc. FBE 31-1390280 Y 25%  
 XYZ Survey Services, LTD MBE 04-3846618 Y 5%  
 Engage Public Affairs FBE 20-1593274 Y 3%  
**RESOURCE INTERNATIONAL, INC. FBE 31-0669793 Y 10% 26% MAJ 74% OTH**  
 GPD Group MAJ 34-1134715 Y 15%  
 OHM Advisors MAJ 38-1691323 Y 11%  
 Dynotec, Inc. MBE 31-1319961 Y 10%  
 PolicyWorks, LLC MBE 30-0193496 Y 4%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service, Patti Austin, Randall Bowman, and Hassan Zahran. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer. Duane Parks, a representative from EBOCO, also attended the first day of deliberations.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the sixteen evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Dynotec 89.67  
 Prime AE Group 87.33

TranSystems	87.33
Resource International	84.33
American Structurepoint	84.00
Columbus Engineering Consultants	81.67
Michael Baker Jr.	81.67
ADR & Associates	81.33
Stantec Consulting Services	81.33
Crawford, Murphy & Tilly	81.00
Strand Associates	80.33
Korda/Nemeth Engineering	77.00
M-E/IBI Group	79.00
Parsons Transportation Group	77.33
Stone Environmental Engineering	69.67
CHA Consulting	67.67

The Committee would like to submit Dynotec, Prime AE Group, and TranSystems for further consideration for the following reasons:

Dynotec

1. Dynotec mentioned various options for Best Management Practices (BMPs) early in design.
2. Their proposed project manager has performed this type of work for the City of Columbus and other municipalities.
3. Dynotec provided a good description of task sharing with its sub-consultants.
4. Dynotec also designated a team member to perform quality control tasks.

Prime AE Group

1. Prime AE Group assembled a good project team with a breadth of skills and experience that would enable them to perform various tasks.

2. Their proposed project team also was structured to allow for good utilization of its sub-consultants and sharing tasks amongst the team.
3. Prime AE Group also demonstrated a strong understanding of the project.
4. Prime AE Group also mentioned the quick-to-construct project in its proposal.

#### TranSystems

1. TranSystems selected a strong project manager with good communication skills.
2. Their proposal reflected a well-thought-out understanding of the project.
3. That proposal also included a good explanation as to how TranSystems intends to utilize its sub-consultants.
4. TranSystems also mentioned the quick-to-construct project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendations
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

**Tom Crawford**

**Fiscal Manager**

<< OLE Object: Picture (Device Independent Bitmap) >>

50 W. Gay Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

**Direct:** 614.645.1687

**Fax:** 614.645.7549

[www.columbus.gov](http://www.columbus.gov)