

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities	CIP Number:	650344-100001
Division:	Sewerage & Drainage	Project Name:	Southerly Wastewater Treatment Plant
		Funding Source:	WPCLF/OWDA
		Bid Opening Date:	8/12/09
Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 10,744,413.00	Engineer's Estimate:	\$12,937,500.00
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 11,657,366.00		

	COMPANY NAME									
	Miles-McClellan Construction Co.	Elford, Inc.	Kokosing	Kenmore	PAE	Dugan & Meyers	Messer	Robertson		
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 10,744,413.00	\$ 10,780,100.00	\$ 11,556,350.00	\$ 11,657,366.00	\$ 11,899,050.00	\$ 12,075,000.00	\$ 12,080,750.00	\$ 13,171,438.70		
Local Company?	Yes	Yes	yes	No	No	yes	no	no		

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors										
M-1	Bid is responsive	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	No	No	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (possible percentage credits listed below)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) (If yes = 1%)	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	no	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (If yes = 1%)	Yes	Yes	yes	Yes	no	yes	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (If yes = 1%)	No	Yes	yes	Yes	no	no	yes	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (If yes = 1%)	yes	Yes	yes	Yes	Yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	80.00%	100.00%	Union 100% & Admin 80%	100.00%	Salary 75% & Hourly 50%	69.00%	25%-100%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (If yes = 1%)	Yes	Yes	yes	Yes	Yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	0.00%	100.00%	50.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference (If yes = 1%-5%)	No	Yes	no	no	no	yes	yes	no
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	4.00%	10.00%	5.00%	4.00%	2.00%	9.00%	9.00%	4.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$80,000.00	\$120,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$80,000.00
	Bid Total:	10,664,413.00	10,660,100.00	11,456,350.00	11,577,366.00	11,859,050.00	11,975,000.00	11,980,750.00	13,091,438.70
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 10,660,100.00							
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.0%	0.0%	7.5%	8.6%	11.2%	12.3%	12.4%	22.8%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	no

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no				
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	No	no	no	no				
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	No	no	no	no				
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	yes	no				
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no				
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	No	no	no	no				
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:								
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no				
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no				
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no				
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no				
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov)	no	no	yes	yes				
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	Yes	yes	yes	yes				
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	Yes	yes	yes	no				
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no				
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no				
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	-2	-2	0	0	0	0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited								
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	Yes	yes	yes	yes				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	Yes	yes	No	Yes				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	Yes	yes	yes	Yes				
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	Yes	yes	yes	Yes				
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	Yes	yes	yes	Yes				
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	Yes	yes	yes	Yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	4	5	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation:	CONTRACTOR'S NAME									
----------------------------	-------------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Sewerage and Drainage

CIP Number: 610744
 Project Name: Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp
 Funding Source: Storm Sewer Bond Fund
 Bid Opening Date: 08/31/2005
 Engineer's Estimate: 1,998,675.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 554,187.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 883,207.20

Original Bid Amount: Local Company?	COMPANY NAME				
	<u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u>	<u>Double Z Constr Co.</u>	<u>Complete General</u>	<u>Nickolas Savko</u>	<u>Trucco Construction</u>
\$ 554,187.00	\$ 671,967.00	\$ 677,561.40	\$ 869,980.56	\$ 883,207.20	\$ 671,967.00
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes
					\$ 671,967.00
					Yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

Proceed to Tier II?

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	5.00%	10.00%	5.00%	9.00%	3.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	31,000	51,000	31,000	45,458	16,626	31,000	31,000	31,000	31,000
	Bid Total:	523,187.45	620,967.45	646,561.85	824,522.88	866,581.59	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45	640,967.45

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 523,187.45

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

18.689%

23.581%

57.596%

65.635%

22.512%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

no

no

no

no

no

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

no

no

no

no

no

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:									
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: Storts Excavation, Inc.