

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:       SSES        
 Division:       Sewerage & Drainage      

Project:       BROAD MEADOWS AREA SAN SWR IMPVMTS        
 Funding Source:       OWDA Market Rate Loan        
 Bid Opening Date:       28-Feb-07        
 Engineer's Estimate:       \$1,441,298.80      

Low Bid at Opening: \$       895,097.24        
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$       895,097.24      

|                         | <u>Insituform (MO)</u> | <u>Reynolds Inliner</u> | <u>COMPANY NAME</u><br><u>Kokosing Const Co</u> | <u>Visu-Sewer</u> | <u>Performance Site</u> |
|-------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|---|-------------------|-------------------------|
| Original Bid Amount: \$ | 895,097.24             | \$ 912,410.80           | \$ 985,245.17                                   | \$ 1,002,121.69   | \$ 1,608,559.57         |
| Local Company?          | NO                     | YES                     | NO  | No                | Yes                     |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

|  |            |            |            |            |            |
|--|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| M-1 Bid is responsive  | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        |
| M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits         | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        |
| M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request           | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        |
| M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | No         | No         | No         | No         | No         |
| M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses  | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        |
| M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one  | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        | Yes        |
| <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> |

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|  |            |                   |            |            |              |
|--|------------|-------------------|------------|------------|--------------|
| C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)      | No         | Yes               | No         | No         | Yes          |
| C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit                              | No         | Yes               | Yes        | No         | Yes          |
| C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                  | No         | No                | Yes        | No         | No           |
| C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit                             | Yes        | Yes               | Yes        | Yes        | Yes          |
| <i>% of insurance provided by company</i>                                      | 80.00%     | 70.00%            | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 50.00%       |
| C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit                   | Yes        | Yes               | Yes        | Yes        | Yes          |
| <i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>                     | 3.00%      | 4.00%             | 100.00%    | Unknown    | 5.00%        |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b> | 2.00%      | 4.00%             | 4.00%      | 2.00%      | 4.00%        |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>   | 17,902     | 35,804            | 35,804     | 17,902     | 35,804       |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>  | 877,195.30 | <b>876,606.91</b> | 949,441.28 | 984,219.75 | 1,572,755.68 |

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

\$       876,606.91      

|   |            |            |            |           |           |
|---|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>  | 0.067%     | 0.000%     | 8.309%     | 12.276%   | 79.414%   |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> | <b>no</b> |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> | <b>no</b> |

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|  |            |      |      |     |     |
|--|------------|------|------|-----|-----|
| HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action p      | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative ac    | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds                               | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years                                | no         | no   | yes  | no  | no  |
| HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.     | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 ye        | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:       |            |      |      |     |     |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act  | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws  | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws  | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws  | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 year   | no         | no   | no   | yes | no  |
| HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation            | yes        | yes  | yes  | yes | yes |
| HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                           | no         | 0.39 | 0.61 | no  | no  |
| HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                        | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable                                   | no         | no   | no   | no  | no  |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>                                      | <b>-1</b>  |      |      |     |     |
| <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b> |            |      |      |     |     |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>                   |            |      |      |     |     |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>   | <b>yes</b> |      |      |     |     |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

|  |          |          |          |          |          |
|--|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g. | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      |
| R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      |
| R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project              | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      |
| R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project           | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      |
| R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project             | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      | yes      |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>   | <b>5</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> |

Division's Recommendation:

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Division: \_\_\_\_\_

Project: Betterments  
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise  
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00  
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

|                      | COMPANY NAME  |               |               |           |           |
|----------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|-----------|-----------|
|                      | Company A     | Company B     | Company C     | Company 4 | Company 5 |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 500,000.00 | \$ 490,000.00 | \$ 525,000.00 | \$ -      | \$ -      |
| Local Company?       | yes           | no            | yes           | no        | no        |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

|  |            |            |            |           |           |
|--|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| M-1 Bid is responsive  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits         | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request           | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no         | no         | no         |           |           |
| M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one  | yes        | yes        | yes        |           |           |
| <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>   | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>yes</b> | <b>no</b> | <b>no</b> |

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|  |                      |                   |                   |                |                |
|--|----------------------|-------------------|-------------------|----------------|----------------|
| C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)      | yes                  | no                | yes               | no             | no             |
| C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit                              | yes                  | no                | yes               |                |                |
| C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                  | no                   | no                | yes               |                |                |
| C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit                             | yes                  | yes               | yes               |                |                |
| % of insurance provided by company   | 50.00%               | 50.00%            | 50.00%            |                |                |
| C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit                   | yes                  | yes               | yes               |                |                |
| % of retirement or pension plan provided by company                            |                      |                   |                   |                |                |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b> | <b>4.00%</b>         | <b>3.00%</b>      | <b>4.00%</b>      | <b>NA</b>      | <b>NA</b>      |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>   | <b>19,900</b>        | <b>15,000</b>     | <b>19,900</b>     | <b>NA</b>      | <b>NA</b>      |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>  | <b>480,100.00</b>    | <b>475,000.00</b> | <b>505,100.00</b> | <b>NA</b>      | <b>NA</b>      |
| <b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>                                     | <b>\$ 475,000.00</b> |                   |                   |                |                |
| <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>   | <b>1.074%</b>        | <b>0.000%</b>     | <b>6.337%</b>     | <b>#VALUE!</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b> | <b>yes</b>           | <b>yes</b>        | <b>yes</b>        | <b>#VALUE!</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>  | <b>yes</b>           | <b>yes</b>        | <b>yes</b>        | <b>#VALUE!</b> | <b>#VALUE!</b> |

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|  |          |           |           |          |          |
|--|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|
| HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no       | no        | yes       |          |          |
| HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 | no       | yes       | yes       |          |          |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes      | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                     | yes      | yes       | no        |          |          |
| HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                  | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no       | no        | no        |          |          |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>  | <b>0</b> | <b>-1</b> | <b>-3</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> |
| <b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>           |          |           |           |          |          |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>                             | yes      | yes       | no        |          |          |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>   | yes      | yes       | no        | no       | no       |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

|   |          |          |          |          |          |
|---|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |          |          |          |          |          |
| R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project  | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project  | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project   | yes      | yes      |          |          |          |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>  | <b>5</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> |

Division's Recommendation: \_\_\_\_\_

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience