CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Lowest Bid Tab amount: \$918,500.00

		American Suncraft	<u>D&M</u>
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$919,875.00	\$1,510,091.00
	FACTORS		
Form 1 -	11201010		
<u>Contract</u>	Dill (0 1)1 C C (C I' N 1 I' (VA)		
Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	see comment
Form 2 - Claims &			
Liquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated		
<u>Damages</u>	damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 2 Con	unding a with Various I and State and Follows I am 9 Boordations.		
<u>rorm 3 - Cor</u>	ppliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations: Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	Trevaining wage Laws Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no no
	Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	Workers Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding	110	110
	affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes yes
	Negative Factors:	0	
	1 logan 10 2 motors	· ·	
Form 4 - Sta	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3		
	years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 5 -	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt.		
Debarment	contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
<u>Deburment</u>	Negative Factors:	0	0
	11684121014660156	U	U
Form 6 -			
Local	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or		
<u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties	0.0%	0.0%
Form 7 - Hea	lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	75% / 25%	50% / 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	4%-ER	8.25%-ER; 3%-EE
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 8 -			
Apprenticeship	1 D. 1 1 1 C.1 2 1 2 0 770 D		
<u>Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1
Form 0 - Fv	perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
1 01 III 7 * EX[Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	see comment
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes

1

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Lowest Bid Tab amount:

\$918,500.00

		American Suncraft	D&M
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$919,875.00	\$1,510,091.00
Form 10 - Exp	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 11 - Dec	adlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Ava	ailability		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Tra	ade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	see comment	(blank)
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	64%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	no
<u> Page 30 - Env</u>	rironmental Preference		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	0.00%	64.16%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$590,216.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within		
	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
Pages 31 - 34	- Statements and Affidavits		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u> Page 40 - </u>			
<u>Addenda</u>	D'11 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 (VAT)		
Acknigmt. Page 41 -	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u> Proposal</u>			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pages 42 - 43	- Proposal Bond		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	no
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-2
	Tieguare Lucios.		
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	1	3
	Division's Recommendation:		AMER

CITY BID EVA (FOR CONT CIP Number: 690477-10000 **Department:** Rome Hilliard East (2 Division: Project Name: North (2MG) Inter Water **Funding Source: Bid Opening Date:** Lowest Bid Tab amount: Engineer's Estimate \$1,267, TMI Coatings **UCL Bid Tab Amount:** \$1,635,260.00 \$5,167,470.00 **FACTORS** <u> Form 1 - </u> Contract Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) Compliance yes <u> Form 2 - </u> Claims & Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated Liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Damages no no **Negative Factors:** Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations: Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): 1. Fair Labor Standards Act no no 2. Prevailing Wage Laws no no 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws no no 4. Workers' Compensation Laws no no 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) no no 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) yes yes 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) yes yes **Negative Factors:** Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) yes yes 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) yes yes 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) ves yes 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) no no Negative Factors: Form 5 -1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. Debarment contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) nc no **Negative Factors:** 0 Form 6 -1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Local Workforce contiguous counties 0.0% 50.0% Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) yes 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 100%-ER 100%-ER 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3%-ER / 6%-EE 100%-ER **Negative Factors:** Form 8 -Apprenticeship Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) no **Negative Factors:** Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) yes yes

Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)

yes

yes

CIP Number: 690477-10000 Department:

Rome Hilliard East (2

Division: Project Name: North (2MG) Inter

Water 1/23 \$1,267, **Funding Source:**

Bid Opening Date:

Lowest Bid Tab amount: Engineer's Estimate

		TMI Coatings	<u>UCL</u>
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$1,635,260.00	\$5,167,470.00
<u> Form 10 - Exp</u>	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	(blank)
	adlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comments	yes
Form 12 - Ava			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
	ade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	"Will advise"	(blank)
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	78%	462%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		
Page 30 - Env	rironmental Preference		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	77.77%	461.76%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$715,385.00	\$4,247,595.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within	Ţ:==)====	+ -,= ,=
	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
Pages 31 - 34	- Statements and Affidavits		
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	no
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
IIIIduvit	Negative Factors:	0	-1
	Treguire I uccoss		
<u>Page 40 -</u> <u>Addenda</u>			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
Page 41 -			
Proposal	Didden has completed the Droncool Construe (VAI)		
Proposal	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
Proposal	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0
Proposal Signature	Negative Factors:	•	yes 0
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond	0	0
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes yes	0
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes yes no	yes yes yes
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes yes no	yes yes yes
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes yes no	yes yes
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes yes no -2	yes yes yes yes o
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43	Negative Factors: - Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes yes no	yes yes yes

	CITY	
	BID EV	
	(FOR CONT.	
	Department:)	4 & 100005
	2	MG) & East Broad
	Division: i	or Tank Painting
		Bonds
	\overline{I}	13
	Lowest Bid Tab amount:	90.00
	M.B	
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$918,500.00
	Did 140 illiouiti	ψ>10,500.00
	<u>FACTORS</u>	
<u>Form 1 - </u>		
<u>Contract</u>		
Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes
<u>Form 2 - </u>		
Claims &	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated	
<u>Liquidated</u>		
<u>Damages</u>	damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1
F 2 C		
Form 3 - Con	npliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:	
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding	
	affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	jes
	Negative Factors:	0
	regative ractors.	U
Form 1 Star	to and Federal Health and Cafety Laws.	
rorm 4 - Stat	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3	
	=	
	years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
	Negative Factors:	-1
Form 5 -	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt.	
Debarment	contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
	Negative Factors:	0
Form 6 -		
Local	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or	
Workforce	contiguous counties	0.0%
Form 7 - Hea	alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs	
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	"yes; some"
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	50% / 50%
-	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	30% / 30% no
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	(blank)
		,
	Negative Factors:	-1
East 0		
Form 8 -		
Apprenticeship Programs	1 Ridder has hone fide apprenticeship program? (V/M)	94.0
<u> 10grums</u>	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negotive Feature Page 1 Page 2 Page 3 Page 3	no
	Negative Factors:	-1
F 0 5	NON CRECKLY APP	
<u> </u>	perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED	
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	(blank)
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes

] Form 11 - Dea 1	Lowest Bid Tab amount: Bid Tab Amount: Bid Tab Amount: Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	M.K. Painting \$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Lowest Bid Tab amount: Bid Tab Amount: erience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	Bonds /13 090.00 M.K. Painting \$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Lowest Bid Tab amount: Bid Tab Amount: erience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	/13 090.00 M.K. Painting \$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Bid Tab Amount: Bid Tab Amount: erience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	M.K. Painting \$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Bid Tab Amount: erience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	M.K. Painting \$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	\$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	\$918,500.00
] Form 11 - Dea 1	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	. ,
] Form 11 - Dea]	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	
] Form 11 - Dea]	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	ye
]		ye
	dlines and Cost Control	
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see commer
Form 12 - Ava		
]	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	ye
	de Licenses and Certificates	
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	ye
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	n
	License and/or Certificate No:	see commer
	Negative Factors:	500 00111110
	110844110141010101	
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$919,875.00
	Percent Over Low Bid:	09
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	ye
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
Page 30 - Envi	ronmental Preference	
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	r
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	N.
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	N.
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within	·
	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	n
	Statements and Affidavits	
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	ye
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	ye
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	ye
Affidavit 1	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	ye
	Negative Factors:	
Daga 40		
<u>Page 40 -</u> Addenda		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	Ve
Page 41 -	Stader has acknowledged any addendams issued on project (1/14)	ye
Proposal	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	
Proposal	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	
Proposal	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	
Proposal Signature]	1 1 2 7	
Proposal Signature 1 Pages 42 - 43 -	Negative Factors:	Vé
Proposal Signature Pages 42 - 43 -	Negative Factors: Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	
Proposal	Negative Factors: Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	ye ye
Proposal	Negative Factors: Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	ye ye
Proposal	Negative Factors: Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	уе уе уе уе
Proposal	Negative Factors: Proposal Bond Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N) Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	ye ye ye ye

Division's Recommendation: