

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Lowest Bid Tab amount: \$918,500.00

	<b>American Suncraft</b>	<b>D&amp;M</b>
Bid Tab Amount:	\$919,875.00	\$1,510,091.00

**FACTORS**

<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	see comment
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	0.0%
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	75% / 25%	50% / 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	4%-ER	8.25%-ER; 3%-EE
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	see comment
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes

Department: Public Utilities

Division: Water

Lowest Bid Tab amount: \$918,500.00

		American Suncraft	D&M
Bid Tab Amount:		\$919,875.00	\$1,510,091.00
<b><u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u></b>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u></b>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment
<b><u>Form 12 - Availability</u></b>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u></b>			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	see comment	(blank)
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>			
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		<b>0%</b>	<b>64%</b>
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>		<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>
<b><u>Page 30 - Environmental Preference</u></b>			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	<b>0.00%</b>	<b>64.16%</b>
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$590,216.00</b>
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
<b><u>Pages 31 - 34 - Statements and Affidavits</u></b>			
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Page 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u></b>			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Page 41 - Proposal Signature</u></b>			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Pages 42 - 43 - Proposal Bond</u></b>			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	no
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-2</b>
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>		<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		<b>AMER</b>	

**CITY  
BID EV/  
(FOR CONT**

**Department:** CIP Number: 690477-1000  
**Division:** Project Name: Rome Hilliard East (  
North (2MG) Inter  
**Funding Source:** Water  
**Bid Opening Date:** 1/23  
**Lowest Bid Tab amount:** Engineer's Estimate \$1,267,

	<b>TMI Coatings</b>	<b>UCL</b>
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$1,635,260.00	\$5,167,470.00

**FACTORS**

<b><u>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</u></b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u></b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</u></b>			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u></b>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Form 5 - Debarment</u></b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u></b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	50.0%
<b><u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u></b>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	3%-ER / 6%-EE	100%-ER
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u></b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u></b>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes

		TMI Coatings	UCL
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		<b>\$1,635,260.00</b>	<b>\$5,167,470.00</b>
<b><u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u></b>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	(blank)
<b><u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u></b>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comments	yes
<b><u>Form 12 - Availability</u></b>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u></b>			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	"Will advise"	(blank)
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>			
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		<b>78%</b>	<b>462%</b>
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>		<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b><u>Page 30 - Environmental Preference</u></b>			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	77.77%	461.76%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$715,385.00	\$4,247,595.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
<b><u>Pages 31 - 34 - Statements and Affidavits</u></b>			
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	no
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Page 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u></b>			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b><u>Page 41 - Proposal Signature</u></b>			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Pages 42 - 43 - Proposal Bond</u></b>			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	no	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	no	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>		<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Division's Recommendation: ICAN SUNCRAFT CO., INC.</b>			

CITY BID EV/ (FOR CONT)		
<b>Department:</b> <b>4 &amp; 10005</b> <b>2MG) &amp; East Broad</b> <b>Division:</b> <b>ior Tank Painting</b> <b>Bonds</b> <b>/13</b> <b>Lowest Bid Tab amount:</b> <b>090.00</b>		
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		<b>M.K. Painting</b> \$918,500.00
<b>FACTORS</b>		
<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>		
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	"yes; some"
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	50% / 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	no
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	(blank)
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	(blank)
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes

Department: **14 & 100005**  
 (MG) & East Broad  
 Division: **ior Tank Painting**  
**Bonds**  
**/13**

Lowest Bid Tab amount: **090.00**

Bid Tab Amount: **M.K. Painting**  
**\$918,500.00**

<b><u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u></b>		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
<b><u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u></b>		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment
<b><u>Form 12 - Availability</u></b>		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes
<b><u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u></b>		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	see comment
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>	<b>\$919,875.00</b>
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	<b>0%</b>
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>	<b>yes</b>
<b><u>Page 30 - Environmental Preference</u></b>		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no
<b><u>Pages 31 - 34 - Statements and Affidavits</u></b>		
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Page 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u></b>		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes
<b><u>Page 41 - Proposal Signature</u></b>		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Pages 42 - 43 - Proposal Bond</u></b>		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	<b>4</b>
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>	