

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities			Project:	Taylor Road 2MG Water Storage Tank
Division:	Power & Water			Funding Source:	Water Works Enlargement Voted 1991 Bonds Fund
Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 4,442,900.00			Bid Opening Date:	2/21/07
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:				Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,092,100.00
COMPANY NAME					
	CB&I , Inc.	Cladwell Tanks, Inc.			
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 4,442,900.00	\$ 4,647,500.00			
Local Company?	no	no			
FACTORS					
Tier I - Mandatory Factors					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes		
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes		
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes		
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no		
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes		
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes*	yes		
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes		
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	no		
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	no	no		
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes		
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes		
	<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	77.00%	100.00%		
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes		
	<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	5.00%	100.00%		
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	2.00%	3.00%		
	Dollar Value of Credits	40,000	60,000		
	Bid Total:	4,402,900.00	4,587,500.00		
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 4,402,900.00			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	4.193%		
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes		
Tier III - History Experience Factors					
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no		
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	yes	yes		
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no		
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no		
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no		
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no		
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	yes		
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes		
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes		
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no		
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no		
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-1	-2		
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited				
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)				
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes		
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)					
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes		
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes		
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes		
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes		
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes		
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5		
* United Coatings & Linings, a subcontractor to CB&I CCN is inactive. CB&I has been notified.					
Division's Recommendation:			CB&I Constructors Inc.		