

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC UTILITIES
 Division: DIVISION OF SEWERAGE AND DRAINAGE

Project: 650355 SWWTP Chlorine Contact Tank No. 4
 Funding Source: OWDA Loan CS392252-02
 Bid Opening Date: 20-May-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 4,500,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 3,573,058.65
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 3,780,000.00

	<u>Kokosing Cnst. Co</u>	<u>C.J. Mahan Cnst. Co.</u>	<u>COMPANY NAME Dugan & Meyer Cnst. Co.</u>	<u>Grace Cnst. Co.</u>
Original Bid Amount: \$	3,573,058.65	\$ 3,670,590.00	\$ 3,780,000.20*	\$ 3,946,051.00
Local Company?	yes	yes	no	no

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)

M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	no	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder not currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	no	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes		no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes		no
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes		yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	Yes	yes		yes
	<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%		100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes		yes
	<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	100.00%	100.00%		100.00%
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%		3.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	100,000	100,000		60,000
	Bid Total:	3,473,058.65	3,570,590.00		3,886,051.00

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

	\$ 3,473,058.65	\$ 3,473,058.65	\$ 3,473,058.65
Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	2.808%	11.891%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	no
Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	no

Tier III - History Experience Factors (each yes answer gives 1 point debit)

HE-1	Bidder has not demonstrated a good faith effort to comply with the requirements of the City of Columbus' Equal Business Opportunity Program	no	no		
HE-2	Bidder has not complied with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no		
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no		
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	yes	no		
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no		
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no		
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no		
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no		
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	yes	yes		
HE-9	Bidder lacks an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	no	no		
HE-10	Bidder's OSHA Experience Modification Rating (EMR) is greater than 1.0	no	yes		
HE-11	Bidder has a record of violations with environmental regulations	no	yes		
HE12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no		
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	-3		0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited				
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?	yes	yes		
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes		no

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answer desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1	Bidder has sufficient resources to reasonably complete this project	yes				
R2	Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience	yes				
R3	Bidder's workforce resources have sufficient experience	yes				
R4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes				
R5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes				
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: The recommendation of this project to Kokosing Construction Co. * corrected amount