



M-1
M-2
M-3
M-4
M-5
M-6

C-1
C-2
C-3
C-4
C-5

HE-1
HE-2
HE-3
HE-4
HE-5
HE-6
HE-7

HE-8
HE-9
HE-10
HE-11
HE-12

Note:
through
R1
R2
R3
R4
R5



Department:

Division:

Low Bid at Opening:

Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:

Company Name:

Original Bid Amount:

Local Company?

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)

Bid is responsive and meets technical requirements met; affidavit signed (yes needed)

Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (yes needed)

Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes needed)

Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with a govt. contracting agency (no needed)

Bidder and proposed subcontractors hold valid and applicable licenses and certifications (yes needed)

Bidder and proposed subcontractors have a valid contract compliance no. or application is attached (yes)

Proceed to Tier II?

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

Bidder is eligible for local business credit (yes gives credit)

Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (yes gives credit)

Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (yes gives credit)

Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (yes gives credit)

Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (yes gives credit)

Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)

Dollar Value of Credits

Bid Total:

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

Percent Over Low Bid:

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

Proceed to Tier III?

Tier III - History Experience Factors

Bidder has a record of non-compliance with the requirements of the City's affirmative action programs (

Bidder has a record of non-compliance with all federal, state and local affirmative action programs (yes

Bidder has a record of successful claims against performance bonds (yes gives debit)

Bidder has a record of liquidated damages paid within the last 3 years (yes gives debit)

Bidders principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. (yes gives debit)

Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years (yes gives debit)

Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:

A. Fair Labor Standards Act (yes gives debit)

B. Prevailing Wage Laws (yes gives debit)

C. Unemployment Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)

D. Worker's Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)

Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (yes gives debit)

Bidder has a health and safety plan that is compliant with current OSHA standards (no gives debit)

Bidder qualifies for a Bureau of Workers Compensation Experience Modification Rating (no gives debit)

Bidder has a record of Environmental Protection Agency violations (yes gives debit)

Bidder has supplied satisfactory information on last three completed projects (no gives debit)

Total Negative History and Experience Factors:

A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited

Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?

Proceed to Tier IV?

Tier IV - Resource Factors

Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was
h application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors

Bidder has identified adequate equipment for this project (yes gives one point credit)

Bidder has identified an adequately experienced management for this project (yes gives one point credit)

Bidder has identified an adequately experienced workforce for this project (yes gives one point credit)

Bidder has indentified safety personnel for this project (yes gives one point credit)

Bidder has identified top five current public or private projects currently in progress (yes gives one point

Total Number of "Yes" Answers

Division's Recommendation:

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Public Utilities

Water

**Project:
 Funding Source:
 Bid Opening Date:**

\$	4,875,000.00
\$	5,960,850.00

	ACME International		ABC Industries		123 Brothers Inc.
\$	5,300,000.00	\$	5,960,850.00	\$	4,875,000.00
	yes		no		yes

yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	no
yes	yes	yes
no	no	no
yes	yes	no
yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	no

yes	no	yes
yes	yes	yes
yes	no	yes
yes	no	no
yes	yes	no

5.00%	2.00%	3.00%
100,000	40,000	60,000

\$	5,200,000.00	\$	5,920,850.00	\$	4,815,000.00
----	--------------	----	--------------	----	--------------

\$	4,815,000.00
----	---------------------

7.996%	22.967%	0.000%
yes	no	yes
yes	no	yes

yes		no
no		no
no		no
no		no
yes		no
yes		no
yes		no
yes		no
no		no
no		no
yes		no
yes		no
no		no
no		yes
yes		yes
-7	0	-3
yes	no	yes
yes	no	yes

solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined
s will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

yes		no
yes		no
yes		yes
yes		yes
yes		yes
5	0	3



New Waterline Construction

Water Operating Fund

4-Jun-03

	Constructors R Us		XYZ Construction
\$	4,900,000.00	\$	6,000,000.00
	yes		no
	yes		yes
	yes		yes
	yes		yes
	no		yes
	yes		yes
	yes		yes
	yes		no
	yes		no
	no		yes
	yes		yes
	yes		yes
	yes		yes
	4.00%		4.00%
	80,000		80,000
\$	4,820,000.00	\$	5,920,000.00
	0.104%		22.949%
	yes		no
	yes		no

yes
yes
yes
yes
no
no

no
yes
yes
yes
yes
yes
yes
yes
yes
no
-10

yes
yes

0

no
no

no
no
no
no
yes

0

1

**BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Utilities
Division: Water

Project: O'Shaugh. Dam MISC. IMP. - 48" Culvert Joint Sealing
Funding Source: 690472
Bid Opening Date: 19-Apr-06

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 35,351.00
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 35,351.00

Company Name: Larry Smith Contractors Miller Pipeline Corporation
Original Bid Amount: \$ 36,225.00 \$ 35,351.00
Local Company? no no

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)

M-1	Bid is responsive and meets technical requirements met; affidavit signed (yes needed)	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (yes needed)	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes needed)	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with a govt. contracting agency (no needed)	no	no
M-5	Bidder and proposed subcontractors hold valid and applicable licenses and certifications (yes needed)	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder and proposed subcontractors have a valid contract compliance no. or application is attached (yes needed)	yes	yes
	<i>Proceed to Tier II?</i>	yes	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit (yes gives credit)	no	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (yes gives credit)	no	no
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (yes gives credit)	no	no
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	2.00%	2.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	707	707
	Bid Total:	\$ 35,517.98	\$ 34,643.98

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 34,643.98

Percent Over Low Bid:

2.523% 0.000%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes yes

Proceed to Tier III?

yes yes

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with the requirements of the City's affirmative action programs (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with all federal, state and local affirmative action programs (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of successful claims against performance bonds (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has a record of liquidated damages paid within the last 3 years (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-5	Bidders principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act (yes gives debit)	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (yes gives debit)	yes	yes
HE-9	Bidder has a health and safety plan that is compliant with current OSHA standards (no gives debit)	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for a Bureau of Workers Compensation Experience Modification Rating (no gives debit)	yes	yes
HE-11	Bidder has a record of Environmental Protection Agency violations (yes gives debit)	no	no
HE-12	Bidder has supplied satisfactory information on last three completed projects (no gives debit)	yes	yes
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-1	-1

A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited

Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?

0

Proceed to Tier IV?

yes yes no

Tier IV - Resource Factors

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1	Bidder has identified adequate equipment for this project (yes gives one point credit)	yes	yes
R2	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced management for this project (yes gives one point credit)	yes	yes
R3	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced workforce for this project (yes gives one point credit)	UNDETERMINED	yes
R4	Bidder has identified safety personnel for this project (yes gives one point credit)	yes	yes
R5	Bidder has identified top five current public or private projects currently in progress (yes gives one point credit)	yes	yes
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	4	5

Division's Recommendation:

Miller Pipeline Inc.