

CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department: _____
 Division: Power & Water

Project: Fisher Road Booster Station
 Funding Source: _____
 Bid Opening Date: 23-Sep-06
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 2,716,448.02

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 2,519,629.48
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: _____

| | <u>Complete General</u> | <u>John Eramo Inc.</u> | <u>Savko</u> | <u>Fields</u> | <u>Trucco</u> | <u>Kokosing</u> | <u>Reynolds</u> |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Original Bid Amount: \$ | 2,519,629.48 | 2,591,103.76 | 2,735,025.37 | 2,737,474.15 | 2,824,947.68 | 3,367,229.03 | 3,929,581.26 |
| Local Company? | yes | yes | | | | | |

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

| | | | | | | | |
|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| M-1 Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

| | | | | | | | |
|--|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | yes | yes | no | no | yes | yes |
| C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | yes | yes | no | yes | yes | yes |
| C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | yes | yes | no | no | yes | yes | yes |
| C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| % of insurance provided by company | 100.00% | 80.00% | 60.00% | 100.00% | 75.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| % of retirement or pension plan provided by company | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total) | 5,000 | 5,000 | 4,000 | 2,000 | 4,000 | 5,000 | 5,000 |
| Dollar Value of Credits | 80,000 | 80,000 | 60,000 | 40,000 | 80,000 | 80,000 | 80,000 |
| Bid Total: | 2,439,629.48 | 2,511,103.76 | 2,675,025.37 | 2,697,474.15 | 2,744,947.68 | 3,287,229.03 | 3,849,581.26 |

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

| | | | | | | | |
|--|--------|--------|--------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| Percent Over Low Bid: | 0.000% | 2.930% | 9.649% | 10.569% | 12.515% | 34.743% | 57.794% |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | yes | yes | no | no | no | no |
| Proceed to Tier III? | yes | yes | yes | no | no | no | no |

Tier III - History Experience Factors

| | | | | | | | |
|--|-----|-----|-----|--|--|--|--|
| HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | no | no | no | | | | |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | | | | |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | | | | |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | | | |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | | | |
| HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years | yes | no | yes | | | | |
| HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes | no | | | | |
| HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | no | yes | yes | | | | |
| HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | yes | yes | | | | |
| HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | no | | | | |
| Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | -2 | -1 | -3 | | | | |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | | | | | | |
| Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | | | | | | | |
| Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | yes | | | | |

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

| | | | |
|--|------|-----|-----|
| R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes* | yes | yes |
| R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | yes |
| R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | yes |
| R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | yes |
| R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | yes |
| Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 5 |

* Did Not Provide A Detail List of Equipment

Division's Recommendation: Complete General

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: _____
 Division: _____

Project: Betterments
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

| | COMPANY NAME | | | | |
|----------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|-----------|-----------|
| | Company A | Company B | Company C | Company 4 | Company 5 |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 500,000.00 | \$ 490,000.00 | \$ 525,000.00 | \$ - | \$ - |
| Local Company? | yes | no | yes | no | no |

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

| | | | | | |
|--|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-----------|
| M-1 Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | | |
| M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | | |
| M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | | |
| Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | no | no |

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

| | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------|-----------|
| C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | no | yes | no | no |
| C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | no | yes | | |
| C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | no | no | yes | | |
| C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | | |
| % of insurance provided by company | 50.00% | 50.00% | 50.00% | | |
| C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | | |
| % of retirement or pension plan provided by company | | | | | |
| Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total) | 4.00% | 3.00% | 4.00% | NA | NA |
| Dollar Value of Credits | 19,900 | 15,000 | 19,900 | NA | NA |
| Bid Total: | 480,100.00 | 475,000.00 | 505,100.00 | NA | NA |

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits \$ 475,000.00

| | | | | | |
|--|------------|------------|------------|----------------|----------------|
| Percent Over Low Bid: | 1.074% | 0.000% | 6.337% | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | yes | yes | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |
| Proceed to Tier III? | yes | yes | yes | #VALUE! | #VALUE! |

Tier III - History Experience Factors

| | | | | | |
|--|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|
| HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | |
| HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | | |
| HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | | |
| HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | yes | | |
| HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | | |
| HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | no | yes | yes | | |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | | |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | | |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | | |
| HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | no | no | | |
| HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes | no | | |
| HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | no | | |
| HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | no | | |
| Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | -1 | -3 | 0 | 0 |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | | | | |
| Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes | no | | |
| Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | no | no | no |

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

| | | | | | |
|---|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | | | |
| R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | | | |
| R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | | | |
| R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | | | |
| R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | | | |
| R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | | | |
| Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Division's Recommendation: _____

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience