

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Monday, January 25, 2010 3:55 PM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Togni, Carl S.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bobay, Andrew V.; Wilfong, Gary D.
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: FRA-CR61-1.10, PID Number 17585 (Hard Road A)

[I approve the award to URS](#)

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Monday, January 18, 2010 10:33 AM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Beck, David H. (Transportation); Beckman, Amber M.; Bell, Timothy A.; Blackford, Megan D.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Lewis, William A.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Togni, Carl S.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bobay, Andrew V.; Wilfong, Gary D.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: FRA-CR61-1.10, PID Number 17585 (Hard Road A)

To: Mark Kelsey, Director, Department of Public Service
From: Alex Cofield, Contract Manager/Management Analyst II
Date: January 18, 2010
Subject: RFP – FRA-CR61-1.10, PID Number 17585 (Hard Road A)
Cc: Evaluation Committee

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the FRA-CR61-1.10, PID Number 17585 (Hard Road A) project.

This project will be for the development of Ohio Department of Transportation contract construction plans for the widening of Hard Road from two lanes to five lanes. The completed design will include sidewalks, provisions for bicycle traffic, curb, enclosed drainage, signals, street lighting, traffic control, and maintenance of traffic. The length of the project is approximately 1.2 miles, from Sawmill Road to 387 feet west of Smoky Row Road.

Funding is provided by federal and local funds. The total cost for the PROJECT is estimated to be \$10,330,000. ODOT shall provide to the LPA eighty percent (80%) of the eligible costs, up to a maximum amount of \$960,000 for the PE phase; \$704,000 for the RW phase; and \$6,600,000 for the CONS phase for a *total cap amount of \$8,264,000* in Federal funds. This maximum amount reflects the funding limit for the PROJECT set by the applicable Program Manager. Unless otherwise provided, funds through ODOT shall be applied only to the eligible costs associated with the actual construction of the transportation project improvements and construction engineering/inspection activities.

The project was formally advertised on the City's Vendor Services web site and ODOT's web site from November 17, 2009, to December 29, 2009. The city received eleven (11) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on January 15, 2010. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT	FID NUMBER	MBE/FBE	% OF	% Maj
------------	------------	---------	------	-------

Sub-consultant		STATUS	WORK	% Other
Parsons Brinckerhoff dba PB Americas, Inc.	111531569	MAJ Active	50-56	80% Maj 20% Other
Korda/Nemeth Engineering, Inc.	310922991	MAJ Active	12-15	
GS&P OH, Inc.	621736493	MAJ Active	12-15	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	311612308	FBE Active	6	
XYZ Survey Service, Ltd.	043846618	MBE Active	7	
Lee Testing and Engineering, Inc.	Wrong CC number given s/b 412224011	MBE Active	4	
CEC/Utilocate dba Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	FID 412224011 CC 310716498	AS Active	3	
Crawford, Murphy, and Tilly, Inc.	370844662	MAJ Active	42	66% Maj 34% Other
E.L. Robinson Engineering of Ohio	311725058	MAJ Active	12	
TranSystems Corp.	FID 311725058 CC 430839725	MAJ Active	12	
Prime Engineering and Architecture, Inc.	311373357	FBE Active	12	
Lee Testing and Engineering, Inc.	412224011	MBE Active	3	
Edsall and Associates, LLC	311022019	FBE Active	2	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	2	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	15	
EMH&T, Inc.	310685594	MAJ Active	58	73% Maj 27% Other

R.W. Armstrong and Associates, Inc.	351062227	MAJ Active	15	
Resource International, Inc.	Wrong CC number given s/b 310669793	FBE Active	20	
Miller Public Relations, LLC	710865419	AFA Active	2	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	5	
E.P. Ferris and Associates, Inc.	311194974	MAJ Active	63	75% Maj 25% Other
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	15	
GPD Group, Inc. dba Glaus, Pyle, Schomer, Burns and DeHaven	341134715	MAJ Active	10	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	AS1 Active	5	
Ohio Gematics, Ltd.	223899748	MAJ Active	2	
ASC Group, Inc.	311167506	FBE Active	5	
M-E Companies, Inc.	311442777	MAJ Active	60	90% Maj 10% Other
W.E.C. Engineers-RPM Engineers dba W.E.C. Engineers of Ohio, Inc.	341708272	MAJ Active	30	
Barr and Prevost	311347309	AS1 Active	7	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	3	
URS Corporation - Ohio	340939859	MAJ Active	58	76% Maj 24% Other
Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	112167170	MAJ Active	10	

Prime Engineering and Architecture, Inc.	311373357	FBE Active	10	
R.W. Armstrong and Associates, Inc.	351062227	MAJ Active	8	
Lee Testing and Engineering, Inc.	412224011	MBE Active	6	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	5	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Ltd.	311612308	FBE Active	3	
Korda/Nemeth Engineering, Inc.	310922991	MAJ Active	55	82% Maj 18% Other
American Structurepoint	351127317	MAJ Active	25	
Engage Public Affairs, LLC	201593274	FBE Active	5	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	2	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	AS1 Active	8	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	311612308	FBE Active	3	
Kinzelman, Kline, and Gossman, Ltd.	311654496	MAJ Active	2	
Gannett Fleming Engineers and Architects	232935505	MAJ Active	75	80% Maj 20% Other
Resource International, Inc.	310669793	FBE Active	5	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	10	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Inc.	311612308	FBE Active	5	
Kinzelman, Kline, and Gossman, Ltd.	311654496	MAJ Active	5	

Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	65	32% Maj 68% Other
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	311268980	MBR Active	25	
Myers-Schmalenberger Landscape Architects	311310090	MAJ Active	7	
ASC Group, Inc.	311167506	FBE Active	3	
W.E. Stilson	311702689	MAJ Active	65	80% Maj 20% Other
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	AS1 Active	7	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	3	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	10	
MS Consultants	346546916	MAJ Active	15	
Wilbur Smith Associates	570895106	MAJ Active	60	80% Maj 20% Other
Burgess and Niple	310885550	MAJ Active	20	
Dynotec, Inc.	311319961	MBE Active	10	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	310680767	AS1 Active	4	
Hardlines Design Company	311688928	FBE Inactive	2	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	310716498	AS1 Active	4	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Megan Blackford, Randy Bowman, and Hassan Zahran – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and myself.

The Evaluation Committee recommends URS Corporation. URS Corporation received 89 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 90). The next closest firms were Crawford, Murphy and Tilly and EMH&T with 86 points each. The Committee felt URS Corporation submitted the strongest overall proposal. URS put together a well qualified team with strong project management and team experience, presented projects that were most

similar to the scope and size of the Department's project, presented the best and reasonable schedule, and showed in-depth knowledge of the project and entire corridor.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the eleven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

URS Corp.	89
Crawford, Murphy and Tilly	86
EMH&T	86
Wilbur Smith	78
Columbus Engineering Consultants	76
Korda/Nemeth	73
WE Stilson	73
PB Americas	71
Gannett Flemmin	71
EP Ferris	67
M-E Companies	67

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve committee's recommendation (URS Corporation)
2. Reject the committee's recommendation and designate a firm. Please provide an explanation for this decision.
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Let me know if you have any questions.

Alex Cofield

Contract Manager
Office of Support Services
Department of Public Service
City of Columbus
109 N. Front St. - Ground Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

p - (614) 645-1557
f - (614) 645-7549
aacofield@columbus.gov

 please don't print this e-mail unless you really need to do so.