version: February 27, 2015

PROJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid I	Date:	July 1,
Department/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		neral Maintenanc
Section:	Treatment Engineering		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$
	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
CIP No.	650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME

	Bids from Apparent lowest to high	St: Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
CIP No.	650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
		General				
		Maintenance &	K & W Roofing,			
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	Engineering Co.	Inc.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.0	O Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00			
		19.08%	-100.00%			

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES			
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES			
_	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B10	YES	YES			
d	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

	bruary 27, 2015						
PR	OJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid I	Date:	July 1,
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		eneral Maintenanc
Section:		Treatment Engineering		Initial Appare			\$
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
CIP No.		650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Monica Powell	General Maintenance & Engineering Co.	K & W Roofing, Inc.			
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00			
PART IB: F		iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for r
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1) FORM	YES	YES			
b	subcontractors are	bcontractors are listed, Bidder indicated which licensed construction trade subcontractors. RM B6 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are)	YES	YES			
С	qualified responsib	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	YES	YES			
d	work to be subcont	more than one subcontractor for each portion of tracted. (329.20)(h)(5) FORM B6	YES	YES			
е	trade subcontracto responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 20)(h)(3) Form B10 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES			
f		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			
PART IC: F		iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for r
а		omit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES			

version: F-L	27 2015						
	OJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid I	Date:	July 1,
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		neral Maintenanc
Section:		Treatment Engineering		Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :		\$
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	
CIP No.		650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
			General Maintenance &	K & W Roofing,			
Project Ma		Monica Powell	Engineering Co.	Inc.		=	
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Initial Bid Amount \$ 1,069,312.00	Initial Bid Amount \$ 1,273,362.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
b	Bidder acknowled	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES	YES			
С		vith technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES			
d	The bid contains invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added no p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	provisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES			
f	B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sul FORM B2, FORM	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) B3	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES			
i	amount. (329.23)(f	egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid ()(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES			
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	NA	NA			
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES			
I	Bidder has compl (329.23)(f)(1)(k) F	ied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. ORM B6	YES	YES			
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it $\mbox{\bf does}$ documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES			

	oruary 27, 2015						
PR	OJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid	Date:	July 1
Departme:	nt/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		neral Maintenan
Section:		Treatment Engineering		Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
CIP No.		650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Monica Powell	General Maintenance & Engineering Co.	K & W Roofing, Inc.			
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00			
n	Bid responds to b (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all material respects.	YES	YES			
0	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			
PART ID: R	esponsiveness Cr	iteria, Other or is not currently debarred from doing business	INPUT "YES	" FOR POSITIVE RESPO	NSE OR "NO" FOR NEC	GATIVE RESPONSE (all "	yesses" needed for res
а		or more fo the following: the city, state, or federal	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			
PART IE: R		iteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Pa	rt IE will not necessaril		oonsive. Bidder must hexecution.	ave a valid contract co
а	The "Evaluated Lo number at the time	w Bidder" has an active contract compliance of bid.	YES	YES			
				_			
	Bid Res	ponsivness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES			
	LO	WEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 1,069,312.00		Manually Enter Amou	ınt	

version: February 27, 2015

PROJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid I	Date:	July 1,
Department/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		neral Maintenanc
Section:	Treatment Engineering		Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :		\$
	Dide from Annount lawest to highest					
	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
CIP No.	650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
		General				
		Maintenance &	K & W Roofing,			
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	Engineering Co.	Inc.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	General	•	Manually Enter Inforn	nation	
	COVEST RESI CHOIVE BIDDER, TABT	Maintenance &		ivialidally Eliter illioill	iation	

:e & Engineering (1,069,312.00

6th
COMPANY NAME
Initial Bid Amount

esponsive bid)

e & Engineering (1,069,312.00

6th
COMPANY NAME
COWPANT NAME
Initial Bid Amount
esponsive bid)

esponsive bid)

, 2015

:e & Engineering (1,069,312.00

6th
COMPANY NAME
Initial Bid Amount

e & Engineering (1,069,312.00

COMPANY NAME

Initial Bid Amount

onsive bid)

npliance no. prior to

Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office , 2015

:e & Engineering (1,069,312.00

6th

COMPANY NAME

Initial Bid Amount

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PR	OJECT:	ACB Roof	Replacement		Bid I	Date:	July 1	, 2015	
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities		Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):				eneral Maintenance & Engineering (
Section:		Treatment Engineering			Bid (from Tab I):		\$	1,069,312.00	
CIP No.		650234-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
			General						
			Maintenance &	K & W Roofing,					
Project M		Monica Powell	Engineering Co.	Inc.	NA	NA	NA	NA	
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	
			\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00	0	0	0	0	
PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsi	bility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 t	for "no")	
a		nonstrated to the city's satisfaction an adequate and NG CAPACITY for the project. FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES					
b		nt (as compared to other bids) no further ded (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others).	YES	YES					
С		he bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and ppropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B7, IPECIFICATIONS		YES					
d	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B7, SPECIFICATIONS		YES	YES					
е	The bidder has acti	vely engaged in the construction industry. FORM	YES	YES					
f		erience in the area of construction service for which ibmitted. FORM B8	YES	YES					
g	The bidder has a su completion deadline	accessful record of complying with and meeting es. FORM B8	YES	YES					
h	The bidder has a su construction project	accessful record of controlling costs on similar is. FORM B8	YES	YES					
i	The bidder has no ((substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the ect. FORM B9	YES	NO					
		Responsibility Score:	9	8	0	0	0	0	
PART IIB:	Responsibility Crite	eria - Serious, Willful OSHA Violations	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 t	for "no")	
а	The bidder has no 5)	serious or willful OSHA violations. (See link in Tab	YES	YES					
		Responsibility Score:	1	1	0	0	0	0	
		Total Responsibility Score:	10	9	0	0	0	0	

Manually Enter Information

Continue to TAB 3?

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

Di	O IFOT				B: 1.				
PF	ROJECT:	ACB Root	Replacement		Bid	Date:	July 1	, 2015	
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities			er (from Tabs I and II):		eneral Maintenan	ce & Engineering C	
Section:		Treatment Engineering		Evaluated Low Bid	(from Tabs I and II) :		\$	1,069,312.00	
					I	I			
CIP No.	CIP No. 650234-100002		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
		General							
			Maintenance &	K & W Roofing,					
Project M		Monica Powell	Engineering Co.	Inc.	NA Did Amaron	NA Did Amaront	NA Did Amazont	NA Did America	
Engineer	s Estimate:	\$ 1,271,000.00	Bid Amount \$ 1,069,312.00	Bid Amount \$ 1,273,362.00	Bid Amount NA	Bid Amount NA	Bid Amount NA	Bid Amount NA	
PART III: 3	29.(01)(u) and 329.2	12 Local Bidder	1,005,312.00	1,2/3,302.00	I NA	I NA	IVA	IVA	
	. ,, ,								
		IS BID LOCAL?	YES	NO					
To look up	if a bidder is local, u	se the Office of Construction Prequalification's list	t located at	X:\Construction Prequa	lification_				
PART IIIA:									
	IF APPARENT	LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. The	ere are no additional						
		steps on PART III. Continue to TAE	3 IV.						
step 1	IF <u>apparent</u>	LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTIN							
		above for apparent low bid and bidder information	ation)						
				<u> </u>					
Part IIIB:									
Part IIIB:	1			1	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	1		
step 2	Percentage differen	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	19.082%	NA	NA	NA	NA	
	Is amount in prior s	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW							
step 3	BID?	op	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA	NA	
	If ofon 2 := "" (PET DDOCEDUDES ON SUAPEROINT SITE							
step 4		SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO							
		ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?							
step 5	(\$0)	MOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO							
	(***/								
Part IIIC:				1					
				1					
step 6	REVISED LOW	BID, TAB IIIB:	\$ 1,069,312.00		Manually Enter Amoun	t			
				1					
step 7	REVISED LOW	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	GeneralMaintenanc	· ·					
			e & Fngineering	ł					

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PF	ROJECT:		acement Bid Date:		July 1, 2015					
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):					eralMaintenance 8	& Engineering Com
Section:		Treatment Engir	neering		Evalua	ated Low Bid (fr	om Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	1,069,312
CIP No.		650234-100002		COMPANY NAME	COM	PANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
				General Maintenance &	K&	W Roofing,				
Project M	lanager:	Monica Powell		Engineering Co.	. α	Inc.	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$	1,271,000.00	Bid Amount		d Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
				\$ 1,069,312.00	\$	1,273,362.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmenta	1	1.000.242.00		Canaral	Maintenanas	Engineering Company			
Appa	arent Low Bid:	\$	1,069,312.00	Apparent Low Bidder:	General	iwaintenance &	Engineering Company			
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmental	Preference								
step 1		d low bidder submit "enviro parent low bidder. For all o	onmentally preferable" bid? Answer other bidder's, input "NA"	NO		NA				
step 2	Excluding apparent bid?	low bidder, did bidder sul	bmit "environmentally preferable"	NA		NO				
step 3	bid, then the apparent in Steps 4-6, complete	/evaluated low bidder is lead e Step 7, and proceed to Ta ted low bidder did not subm	ed an environmentally preferable and bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data ab 5. nit an environmentally preferable							
step 4	Calculate environmen		It is up to five percent (5%) of the 0,000 per bid.	0.000%	:	19.082%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	r each eligible bid (if 0, ther	n no environmental preference was	\$ -	\$	20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, exce se, both claiming EP cance	pt if both claim enviornmental Is it for both	\$ 1,069,312.00	\$	1,253,362.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 1,069,312.00	Low Bidder:	Maintenance & Engineering Company						

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	General Maintenance & Engineering Company	\$ 1,069,312.00
Project:	ACB Roof Replacement	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	General Maintenance & Engineering Co.	K & W Roofing, Inc.	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 1,069,312.00	\$ 1,273,362.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next						
Highest Bid	19.08%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery" against a prime/sub contractor.

Are there any findings against the prime contractor or any of the subs?

If yes, the bid shall be deemed non-responsive. Inform the Office of Prequalification for further instruction.

Cross Referenced in Tab 1, Part ID

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery" against a prime/sub contractor.

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

Are there any findings against the prime contractor or any of the subs?

If yes, the bid shall be deemed non-responsive. Inform the Office of Prequalification for further instruction.

Cross Referenced in Tab 1, Part ID

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

Go to the US Department of Labor's web site to see if there are any serious or willful violations by the prime contractor

Cross Referenced in Tab 2. Part IIB

https://www.osha.gov

NO

Bid Gurantee Requirements

OSHA Violations

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES Certified/Cashier's Check

Drawn on a solvant bank

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	General Maintenance & Engineering Company	\$ 1,069,312.00
Project:	ACB Roof Replacement	

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: ACB Roof Replacement

Recommended Bidder: General Maintenance & Engineering
Contract Amount: \$ 1,069,312.00

Evaluator's Name: Mike Pettiford
Evaluation Completion Date: 7/29/2015

Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations Effective January 1, 2015

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code section 329 as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Here is a link to City Code

As of 1/23/15, Municode is not up to date with the new code language for Section 329.

Referer to the attachment in Ord. 2612-2014 until Municode is updated

- 2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.
- 3. If you have questions about using the spreadsheet, contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.
- 4. If you print the workbook in its entirety from the print screen as opposed to printing each worksheet separately ("active sheets"), you will print this page and the evaluation will begin on page 2 and go through page 13. If you print each workbook separately, the page numbering is different.

TAB VI: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are department specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

Please follow the format of the previous tabs. If you need assistance, please contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.

Tab 6: 17 of 18

TAB VII: Notes

On this page, include any notes or clarification from phone calls made. Be sure to include the company you called, who you spoke with, date, time, question asked, outcome of call, and name of person who made the call.

Include any notes or clarifications from research done.