

OF COLUMBUS  
VALUATION FORM  
TRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department: Public Utilities CIP Number:  
Division: Power Project Name:  
Funding Source:  
Bid Opening Date:  
Engineer's Estimate

670867-10000  
Nationwide Duct & Manhole  
12/23/14  
\$1,724,982.60

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Amount: \$1,913,135.40

|                 |                   |                    |                         |                 |
|-----------------|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|
|                 | <u>US Utility</u> | <u>Jess Howard</u> | <u>Complete General</u> | <u>J. Ranck</u> |
| Bid Tab Amount: | \$1,913,135.40    | \$2,265,582.40     | \$2,374,750.00          | \$2,538,050.00  |

| FACTORS   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|---|---|------------------|----------------|-------------|----------------------------|
| <i>(Pgs. 2-3) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</i>                              | Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)   | yes              | No             | yes         | No                         |
| <i>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</i>   | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)         | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | -1             | 0           | -1                         |
| <i>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</i> |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):                                     |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | 2. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | 4. Workers' Compensation Laws   | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)         | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | 0              | 0           | 0                          |
| <i>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</i>                                 |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)        | yes              | yes            | no          | yes                        |
|   | 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)  | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | Negative Factors:   | -1               | -1             | 0           | -1                         |
| <i>Form 5 - Debarment</i>   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | 0              | 0           | 0                          |
| <i>Form 6 - Local Workforce</i>   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties                     | 65.0%            | 95.0%          | 59.0%       | TBD                        |
|   | Negative Factors:   |                  |                |             |                            |
| <i>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</i>                               |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:   | ER:75% EE: 25%   | ER:32% EE: 68% | ER: 100%    | ER:75% EE: 25%             |
|   | 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:   | ER: 3% EE: 1-10% | 3%             | ER: 100%    | 10%                        |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | 0              | 0           | 0                          |
| <i>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</i>   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)   | YES              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | 0              | 0           | 0                          |
| <i>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</i>                   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)  | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
| <i>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</i>                      |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
| <i>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</i>   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)  | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
| <i>Form 12 - Availability</i>   |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
| <i>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</i>  |   |                  |                |             |                            |
|   | Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)   | yes              | yes            | yes         | yes                        |
|   | Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)  | no               | no             | no          | no                         |
|   | License and/or Certificate No:  | Electric #24800  | Electrical     | None Listed | Ohio Electrical Contractor |
|   | Negative Factors:   | 0                | 0              | 0           | 0                          |
|   | Lowest Bid Dollar Amount  | \$1,913,135.40   |                |             |                            |
|   | Percent Over Low Bid:   | 0%               | 18%            | 24%         | 33%                        |

|   |  | US Utility     | Jess Howard    | Complete General | J. Ranck       |
|---|--|----------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|
| <b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>  |  | \$1,913,135.40 | \$2,265,582.40 | \$2,374,750.00   | \$2,538,050.00 |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>   |  | yes            | no             | no               | no             |
| <b>Pg. 32 - Environmental Preference</b>  |  |                |                |                  |                |
| Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)   |  | yes            | no             | yes              | no             |
| Difference versus lowest bidder (%)   |  | NA             | 18.42%         | 24.13%           | 32.66%         |
| Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)  |  | NA             | \$352,447.00   | \$461,614.60     | \$624,914.60   |
| Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid. |  | no             | no             | no               | no             |
| <b>Pgs. 33-36 - Statements and Affidavits</b>   |  |                |                |                  |                |
| <b>Statement 1:</b> Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Statement 2:</b> Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Statement 3:</b> Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Affidavit</b> Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Negative Factors:</b>  |  | 0              | 0              | 0                | 0              |
| <b>Pg. 7 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>  |  |                |                |                  |                |
| Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)   |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Proposal (Pg. 8) - Proposal Signature</b>  |  |                |                |                  |                |
| Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)   |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| <b>Negative Factors:</b>  |  | 0              | 0              | 0                | 0              |
| <b>Pg. 47 - Proposal Bond</b>   |  |                |                |                  |                |
| Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | yes            |
| Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)  |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | no             |
| Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)   |  | yes            | yes            | yes              | no             |
| <b>Negative Factors:</b>  |  | 0              | 0              | 0                | -2             |
| <b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>  |  | -1             | -2             | 0                | -4             |
| <b>Division's Recommendation:</b>   |  |                |                |                  |                |

**Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.**

|                          |   |     |     |     |    |
|--------------------------|---|-----|-----|-----|----|
| 1)                       | Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)   | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| 2)                       | Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)   | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| 3)                       | Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)                                   | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| 4)                       | Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) | YES | YES | YES | NO |
| 5)                       | Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award?  | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| 6)                       | Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)   | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| 7)                       | Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)  | NO  | NO  | NO  | NO |
| <b>Negative Factors:</b> |   | 0   | 0   | 0   | -1 |