

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Monday, September 19, 2011 5:31 PM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: Re: RECOMMENDATION: UIRF - General Engineering Services

I approve of the recommended consultant for award
Mark Kelsey sent from my blackberry

From: Cofield, Alex A.
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Sent: Mon Sep 19 14:57:14 2011
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: UIRF - General Engineering Services

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: September 19, 2011

Subject: UIRF – General Engineering Services

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the UIRF – General Engineering Services. The budget is \$500,000; amount of the contract shall be \$500,000 funded by a Department of Development 2011 bonds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Department of Development (through the Department of Public Service) with continuing, contractual access to additional resources that are necessary to perform various professional engineering, survey and technical expertise to implement projects through the City's UIRF program.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from August 3, 2011, to September 1, 2011. The city received eleven (11) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on September 16, 2011. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT

Sub-consultant Business Enterprise Status Contract Compliance Number Active % of Work % Majority

% Other

DYNOTEC MBE 311319961 Y 60% 35% Majority

65% Other

EMH&T Majority 310685594 Y 35%

DLZ Ohio, Inc. ASN 311268980 Y 5%

PRIME ENGINEERING & ARCHITECTURE FBE 311373357 Y 50% 15% Majority

85% Other

TranSystems PHC 430839725 Y 20%

Lawhon &

Associates FBE 311153141 Y 5%
CTL Engineering,

Inc. AS1 310680767 Y 10%
W.E. Stilson Majority 311702689 Y 10%
Kinzelman, Kline,

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 5%

RESOURCE INTERNATIONAL

(percentages provided total 107%) FBE 310669793 Y 67%* 37% Majority 70% Other

URS Corp. Majority 340939589 Y 32%
Kinzelman, Kline,

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 5%
Policy-works, LLC MBE 300193496 Y 3%

WD TRANSPORTATION Majority 311451869 Y 50% 90% Majority

10% Other

URS Corporation Majority 340939859 Y 40%

CTL Engineering AS1 310680767 Y 10%

WOOLPERT Majority 201391406 Y 70% 75% Majority

25% Other

Ribway Engineering

Group, Inc. MBE 311406579 Y 20%
BBC&M

Engineering Majority 311166709 Y 5%
Lawhon &

Associates FBE 311153141 Y 5%
MOODY NOLAN MBE 311256984 Y 60% 15% Majority

85% Other
Resource

International FBE 310669793 Y 25%
Trans Associates Majority 251634385 Y 15%
MS CONSULTANTS Majority 346546916 Y 95% 95% Majority

5% Other

DHDC, Inc. MBE 311227692 Y 5%
COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS (CEC) AS1 310716498 Y 75% 14% Majority 86% Other
W.E. Stilson Majority 311702689 Y 6%
Traffic Engineering

Services MBE 311178383 Y 5%
CTL Engineering,

Inc. AS1 310680767 Y 3%
ASC Group, Inc. FBE 311167506 Y 3%
MSI Design Group Majority 311310090 Y 3%
Ralph & Curl

Engineers Majority 311067613 Y 5%
SHAFFER POMEROY LTD. Unknown 202996708 N 80% 15% Majority

5% FBE

80% Unknown

Trans Associates Majority 251634385 Y 10%
BBC&M

Engineering Majority 311166709 Y 5%
Advanced

Engineering

Consultants FBE 311612308 Y 5%
URS CORPORATION Majority 340939859 Y 57% 100% Majority
BBC&M

Engineering Majority 311166709 Y 5%
WD Transportation Majority 311451869 Y 38%
RIBWAY ENGINEERING GROUP MBE 311406579 Y 75% 17% Majority

83% Other
Gannett Fleming,

Inc. Majority 232935505 Y 10%
CTL Engineering,

Inc. AS1 310680767 Y 5%
Benchmark

Surveying &

Mapping Co., Inc. Majority 371539711 Y 7%
Ohio Geomatics,

Ltd. FBE 223899748 Y 3%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran, and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

Dynotec, Inc. received 87.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Prime Engineering and Architecture with 84.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the eleven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Dynotec, Inc.	87.33
Prime Engineering & Arch.	84.33
Resource International	84.00
WD Transportation	84.00
Woolpert	84.00
Moody-Nolan	82.00
MS Consultants	82.00
Columbus Engineering Con.	80.67
Shaffer Pomeroy	80.00
URS Corporation	80.00
Ribway	78.33

The Committee would like to submit Dynotec, Inc. for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Dynotec submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Dynotec had good relevant prior experience.
2. Dynotec's proposal had a good project manager.
3. Dynotec has previous experience with UIRF contracts.
4. Dynotec assembled a strong team for the project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Dynotec
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager

City of Columbus

Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services

109 N. Front St. Ground Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov