

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)  |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
|---|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| Department:   | Public Utilities   | CIP Number:                    | 690236                                |                        |                        |                        |
| Division:   | (Power & Water)  | Project Name:                  | Far East Columbus W.M. Imp's, Part II |                        |                        |                        |
|   |  | Funding Source:                | WSRLA                                 |                        |                        |                        |
|   |  | Bid Opening Date:              | 2/13/08                               |                        |                        |                        |
| Low Bid at Opening:   | \$ 2,587,933.32  | Engineer's Estimate:           | \$2,633,137.00                        |                        |                        |                        |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:   | \$ 3,128,413.14  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
|   |  | COMPANY NAME                   |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
|   | Columbus Asphalt Paving  | Shelly & Sands                 | Reynolds, Inc.                        | George J. Igel & Co.   | Fields Excavating      |                        |
| Original Bid Amount:  | \$ 2,587,933.32  | \$ 2,794,279.49                | \$ 3,128,413.14                       | \$ 3,154,801.96        | \$ 3,421,501.07        |                        |
| Local Company?  | yes  | yes                            | no                                    | yes                    | no                     |                        |
| <b>FACTORS</b>  |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| <b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>   |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive  | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                               | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                 | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. age                          | no                             | no                                    | no                     | no                     | no                     |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses  | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                        | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
|   | <b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>   | <b>yes</b>                     | <b>yes</b>                            | <b>yes</b>             | <b>yes</b>             | <b>yes</b>             |
| <b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>   |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)                        | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | no                     |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit  | yes                            | yes                                   | no                     | yes                    | no                     |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                                    | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit   | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
|   | % of insurance provided by company   | 100.00%                        | 100.00%                               | 100.00%                | 100.00%                | 100.00%                |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit                                     | yes                            | yes                                   | yes                    | yes                    | yes                    |
|   | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company  | 100.00%                        | 100.00%                               | 100.00%                | 100.00%                | 100.00%                |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference  | n                              | yes                                   | no                     | yes                    | yes                    |
|   | <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)</b>               | <b>5.00%</b>                   | <b>10.00%</b>                         | <b>4.00%</b>           | <b>10.00%</b>          | <b>8.00%</b>           |
|   | <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>   | <b>\$ 100,000.00</b>           | <b>\$ 120,000.00</b>                  | <b>\$ 80,000.00</b>    | <b>\$ 120,000.00</b>   | <b>\$ 80,000.00</b>    |
|   | <b>Bid Total:</b>  | <b>\$ 2,487,933.32</b>         | <b>\$ 2,674,279.49</b>                | <b>\$ 3,048,413.14</b> | <b>\$ 3,034,801.96</b> | <b>\$ 3,341,501.07</b> |
|   | <b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>   | <b>\$ 2,487,933.32</b>         |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
|   | <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>   | <b>0.000%</b>                  | <b>7.490%</b>                         | <b>22.528%</b>         | <b>21.981%</b>         | <b>34.308%</b>         |
|   | <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid afte</b>                        | <b>yes</b>                     | <b>yes</b>                            | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              |
|   | <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>  | <b>yes</b>                     | <b>yes</b>                            | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              |
| <b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>  |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirm                           | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local                          | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds                                      | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years                                       | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, cc                         | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s)                            | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the f                       | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act  | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws  | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws  | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws  | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within th                       | no                             | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting doc                             | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                   | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable  | no                             | no                                    |                        |                        |                        |
|   | <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>  | <b>0</b>                       | <b>-1</b>                             | <b>0</b>               | <b>0</b>               | <b>0</b>               |
|   | <b>(A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited)</b> |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
|   | <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user in</b>                         | <b>yes</b>                     | <b>yes</b>                            |                        |                        |                        |
|   | <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>   | <b>yes</b>                     | <b>yes</b>                            | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              | <b>no</b>              |
| <b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>   |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |  |                                |                                       |                        |                        |                        |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete thi                          | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completi                             | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this projec                         | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this p                           | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this proj                          | yes                            | yes                                   |                        |                        |                        |
|   | <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>   | <b>5</b>                       | <b>5</b>                              | <b>0</b>               | <b>0</b>               | <b>0</b>               |
|   | <b>Division's Recommendation:</b>  | <b>Columbus Asphalt Paving</b> |                                       |                        |                        |                        |

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities  
Division: Sewerage and Drainage

CIP Number: 610744  
Project Name: Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp  
Funding Source: Storm Sewer Bond Fund  
Bid Opening Date: 08/31/2005  
Engineer's Estimate: 1,998,675.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 554,187.00  
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 883,207.20

| Original Bid Amount:<br>Local Company? | COMPANY NAME                   |                            |                         |                       |                            |
|--|--------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|
|  | <u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u> | <u>Double Z Constr Co.</u> | <u>Complete General</u> | <u>Nickolas Savko</u> | <u>Trucco Construction</u> |
| \$ 554,187.00                          | \$ 671,967.00                  | \$ 677,561.40              | \$ 869,980.56           | \$ 883,207.20         | \$ 671,967.00              |
| Yes                                    | Yes                            | Yes                        | Yes                     | No                    | Yes                        |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | \$ 671,967.00              |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | Yes                        |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | \$ 671,967.00              |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | Yes                        |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | \$ 671,967.00              |
|  |                                |                            |                         |                       | Yes                        |

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

|     |  |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |
|-----|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| M-1 | Bid is responsive  | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits         | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request           | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses  | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one  | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |

Proceed to Tier II?

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

|     |   |            |            |            |            |            |            |            |            |            |
|-----|---|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)   | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit                           | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit               | yes        | yes        | yes        | no         | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit                          | yes        | yes        | yes        | no         | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        |
|     | % of insurance provided by company                                      | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 60.00%     | 75.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit                | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        |
|     | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company                     | 3.00%      | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 50.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    |
| C-6 | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference                         | no         | yes        | no         | yes        | no         | no         | no         | no         | no         |
|     | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) | 5.00%      | 10.00%     | 5.00%      | 9.00%      | 3.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      |
|     | Dollar Value of Credits   | 31,000     | 51,000     | 31,000     | 45,458     | 16,626     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000     |
|     | Bid Total:  | 523,187.45 | 620,967.45 | 646,561.85 | 824,522.88 | 866,581.59 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 |

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 523,187.45

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

18.689%

23.581%

57.596%

65.635%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

yes

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

Proceed to Tier III?

yes

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

no

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

|       |   |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |
|-------|---|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |
|       | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
|       | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
|       | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
|       | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
|       | Total Negative History and Experience Factors:  | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   |
|       | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited             | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
|       | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)                               | yes | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |
|       | Proceed to Tier IV?   | yes | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  | no  |

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

|     |  |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |     |
|-----|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                  | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                          | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                       | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                         | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
|     | Total Number of "Yes" Answers  | 5   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   | 0   |

Division's Recommendation:

Storts Excavation, Inc.