

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	Public Utilities	CIP Number:	CIP Number:	690414
Division:	Water	Project Name:	Project Name:	Parsons Avenue Water Plant Sludge Disposal - Lagoon 2
		Funding Source:	Funding Source:	OWDA Loan
Low Bid at Opening:	\$2,576,755.32	Bid Opening Date:	Bid Opening Date:	9/23/09
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$2,576,755.32	Engineer's Estimate:	Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,662,655.70
Original Bid Amount:	Burch Hydro \$2,576,755.32	Kokosing Construction \$2,615,704.96	Haynes Construction \$2,745,613.42	Metropolitan Environ. \$4,385,139.70
Local Company?	no	yes	no	?
<b>FACTORS</b>				
<b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>				
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	yes	yes	yes
<b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (C1-C5 each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>				
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	yes	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	no	yes	no
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes	no
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes
	<b>% of insurance provided by company</b>	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	no	yes	yes
	<b>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</b>	0.00%	100.00%	10% of gross pay
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	yes
	<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)</b>	1.00%	10.00%	7.00%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$20,000.00	\$120,000.00	\$60,000.00
	<b>Bid Total:</b>	2,556,755.32	2,495,704.96	2,685,613.42
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	\$2,495,704.96		
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	2.45%	0.000%	7.609%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 5% of low bid after credits)</b>	yes	yes	no
	<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	yes	yes	no
<b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>				
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prog	no	no	
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action	no	no	
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	yes	
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no	
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (C	no	yes	
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	0	-2	0
	<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>			
	<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	yes	yes	
	<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	yes	yes	no
<b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>				
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).				
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., ec	yes	yes	
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	5	5	0
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.		