

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: DOPW (Power)

Project: St. Ltg. Impr's for OSU Off-Campus UIRF
Funding Source: Fund 553, OCA 440008
Bid Opening Date: 4/18/07

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 667,662.19
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 818,759.99

Company Name:	<u>Comp Gen Constr Co</u>	<u>Jess Howard Electr Co</u>	<u>US Utility Contr. Co</u>	<u>Perram Electric</u>	<u>MP Dory Company</u>	<u>Settle-Muter electric</u>
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 667,662.19	\$ 794,312.55	\$ 818,759.99	\$ 828,626.66	\$ 849,233.12	\$ 1,008,499.66
Local Company?	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)

M-1	Bid is responsive and meets technical requirements met; affidavit signed (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with a govt. contracting agency (no needed)	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder and proposed subcontractors hold valid and applicable licenses and certifications (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder and proposed subcontractors have a valid contract compliance no. or application is attached (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

C-1	Bidder is eligible for local business credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	5.00%	4.00%	3.00%	3.00%	5.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	33,383	39,716	32,750	24,859	25,477	50,425
	Bid Total:	\$ 634,279.09	\$ 754,596.95	\$ 786,009.59	\$ 803,767.86	\$ 823,756.12	\$ 958,074.66
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ <u>634,279.09</u>	\$ 754,596.95	\$ 786,009.59	\$ 803,767.86	\$ 823,756.12	\$ 958,074.66
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	18.969%	23.922%	26.721%	29.873%	51.049%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	no	no	no	no

Tier III - History Experience Factors

HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with the requirements of the City's affirmative action programs (yes gives d)	no					
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with all federal, state and local affirmative action programs (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-3	Bidder has a record of successful claims against performance bonds (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-4	Bidder has a record of liquidated damages paid within the last 3 years (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-5	Bidders principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:						
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act (yes gives debit)	no					
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws (yes gives debit)	no					
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no					
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (yes gives debit)	yes					
HE-9	Bidder has a health and safety plan that is compliant with current OSHA standards (no gives debit)	yes					
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for a Bureau of Workers Compensation Experience Modification Rating (no gives debit)	no					
HE-11	Bidder has a record of Environmental Protection Agency violations (yes gives debit)	no					
HE-12	Bidder has supplied satisfactory information on last three completed projects (no gives debit)	yes					
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	0	0	0	0	0
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited						
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?						
	Proceed to Tier IV?	no	no	no	no	no	no

Tier IV - Resource Factors

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R1	Bidder has identified adequate equipment for this project (yes gives one point credit)						
R2	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced management for this project (yes gives one point credit)						
R3	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced workforce for this project (yes gives one point credit)						
R4	Bidder has identified safety personnel for this project (yes gives one point credit)						
R5	Bidder has identified top five current public or private projects currently in progress (yes gives one point credit)						
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	0	0	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: **Comp Gen Constr Co**