

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number: <u>690488-10000</u>	Project Name: <u>Parsons Avenue Water Plant (PAWP) Treatment Upgrades</u>
Division: <u>Water</u>	Funding Source: <u>Water Notes</u>	Bid Opening Date: <u>11/5/14</u>
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: <u>\$65,633,950.00</u>	Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$60,490,000.00</u>	

Vendor Name: Kokosing Construction Walsh Butt Joint Venture
Bid Tab Amount: \$65,633,950.00 \$66,137,650.00

FACTORS			
<i>(00 43 00 Pgs. 2-3) & Form 1 (Pg. 00 43 00 Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no
<i>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of violations of federal, state, or governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1
Form 5 - Debarment			
	Bidder has been debarred by any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce			
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	12.19%	60.0%
	Negative Factors:		
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 80% - EE: 20%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 4% - EE: up to Fed'l
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs			
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	"None"	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	(blank)
	License and/or Certificate No:	City license #'s not provided	SW0293
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$66,137,650.00	

Vendor Name:		Kokosing Construction	Walsh Butt Joint Venture
Bid Tab Amount:		\$65,633,950.00	\$66,137,650.00
Percent Over Low Bid:		-1%	0%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes
(00 43 00 Pgs. 23-24) - Environmental Preference			
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		yes	no
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)		-0.76%	0.00%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)		(\$503,700.00)	\$0.00
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		no; they already have acceptable environmental policy	no
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		n/a	
(00 43 00 Pgs. 25-28) - Statements and Affidavits			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes but affiant is same person signing CT	yes; see comments
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes but affiant is same person signing CT	see comment
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes but affiant is same person signing CT	see comment
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes but affiant is same person signing CT	see comment
Negative Factors:		0	0
(00 42 00 Pg. 12) Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project - Addenda Acknlgmt. (Y/N)			
		yes	yes
(00 42 00 Pg. 13) Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature - Proposal Signature (Y/N)			
		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
(00 43 00 Pg. 29) - Proposal Bond			
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		0	-2
Division's Recommendation:		KOKOSING CONSTRUCTION CO., INC.	
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.			
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0