

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)				
Department:		Public Utilities	CIP Number:	650260-102001
Division:		DOSD	Project Name:	JPWWTP Maintenance Building Renovations
			Funding Source:	GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND FUND, FUND 664
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:		\$470,848.40	Bid Opening Date:	2/12/14
			Engineer's Estimate	\$380,000.00
Vendor Name:		Elford, Inc.	Ulliman Schutte Construction	
Bid Tab Amount:		\$470,848.40	\$536,000.30	
FACTORS				
<u>(Pgs. X-X) & Form 1 (Pg. X) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	Yes	Yes	
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	No	No	
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		No	No	
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		No	No	
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		No	No	
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		No	No	
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		No	No	
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)		No	No	
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		No	No	
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment				
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		No	No	
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		85.0%	0.0%	
Negative Factors:				
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		75%	75.0%	
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		5%	4.0%	
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs				
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		Yes	No	
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		TBD	Yes	
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		Yes	Yes	
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		TBD	Yes	

ORD#					
	Vendor Name:	Elford, Inc.	Ulliman Schutte Construction		
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$470,848.40	\$536,000.30		
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes		
Form 12 - Availability					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	Yes	Yes		
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	Yes	Yes		
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	Yes	Yes		
	License and/or Certificate No:	G-5636	TBD		
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$470,848.40	\$536,000.30		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	14%	-100%	-100%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes	no	yes	yes
Pg. X - Environmental Preference					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)				
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	0.00%	13.84%	-100.00%	-100.00%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$65,151.90	(\$470,848.40)	(\$470,848.40)
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	No			
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?				
Pgs. X-X - Statements and Affidavits					
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	Yes			
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Yes			
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Yes			
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	Yes			
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. X - Addenda Acknlgmt.					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	Yes			
Proposal (Pg. X) - Proposal Signature					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	Yes			
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. X - Proposal Bond					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	Yes			
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	Yes			
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	Yes			
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	Yes			
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0
	Division's Recommendation:				
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.					
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)				
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)				
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)				
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)				
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)				
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)				
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)				
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0

NOTE: Apparent low bidder - Elford, Inc.