

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)				
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>		CIP Number:		
Division: <u>Water</u>		Project Name:		
Lowest Bidder: <u>\$770,770.00</u>		Funding Source:		
		Bid Opening Date:		
		Engineer's Estimate:		
Bid Tab Amount:		<u>Conie Constr.</u> \$770,770.00	<u>Precision Grading</u> \$797,555.00	<u>Danbert</u> \$837,637.90
FACTORS				
<u>Pgs. 6-7 & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	yes	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no	no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		yes	no	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)		yes	no	no
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment				
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		63.0%	80.0%	90.0%
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	no	yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		90 / 10 %		100 / 0 %
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	no	yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		see comment		100 / 0%
Negative Factors:		0	-2	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs				
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		no	no	yes
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Water

CIP Number:
 Project Name:
 Funding Source:
 Bid Opening Date:
 Engineer's Estimate

Lowest Bidder: \$770,770.00

		Conie Constr.	Precision Grading	Danbert
Bid Tab Amount:		\$770,770.00	\$797,555.00	\$837,637.90
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	???	???
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	???	see comment
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)		see comment	see comments	see comments
Form 12 - Availability				
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)		no	no	no
License and/or Certificate No:		SW0035	see comment	ST0716
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		\$770,770.00		
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	3%	9%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes	yes
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference				
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		yes	no	yes
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)		NA	3.48%	8.68%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)		NA	\$26,785.00	\$66,867.90
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.		not applicable since lowest	no	no
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Affidavit: Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Pg. 39 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		n/a	n/a	n/a
Pg. 40 - Proposal Signature				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Pgs. 41-42 - Proposal Bond				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-3	-4	0
Division's Recommendation:		CONIE CONSTRUCTION CO.		

Department:	690527		
Division:	Fire Hydrant Replacements - 2013		
	Water Bonds		
	3/13/13		
Lowest Bidder:	\$800,000.00		
	Eramo & Sons	Cols. Asphalt Paving	
Bid Tab Amount:	\$862,928.00	\$896,885.00	

FACTORS			
<u>Pgs. 6-7 & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	yes	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	82.0%	75.0%
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	80 / 20 %	100 / 0 %
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100 / 0 %	100 / 0 %
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED			

Department:		690527	
Division:		Fire Hydrant Replacements - 2013	
		Water Bonds	
		3/13/13	
Lowest Bidder:		\$800,000.00	
Bid Tab Amount:		Eramo & Sons \$862,928.00	Cols. Asphalt Paving \$896,885.00
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED			
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		"TBD"	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control			
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)		see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability			
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates			
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)		no	no
License and/or Certificate No:		SW0004	SW0010
Negative Factors:		0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
Percent Over Low Bid:		12%	16%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		no	no
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference			
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		no	no
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)		11.96%	16.36%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)		\$92,158.00	\$126,115.00
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.		no	no
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Pg. 39 - Addenda Acknlgmt.			
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		n/a	n/a
Pg. 40 - Proposal Signature			
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Pgs. 41-42 - Proposal Bond			
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-3	0
Division's Recommendation:		CONIE CONSTRUCTION	

(
Department: Division:		
Lowest Bidder:		
Bid Tab Amount:		Darby Creek \$993,465.00
FACTORS		
<u>Pgs. 6-7 & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:		
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		yes
Negative Factors:		0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)		no
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 5 - Debarment		
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 6 - Local Workforce		
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		100.0%
Negative Factors:		0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		58 / 42 %
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		"varies"
Negative Factors:		0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs		
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		yes
Negative Factors:		0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		

Department: Division:		
Lowest Bidder:		
Bid Tab Amount:		Darby Creek \$993,465.00
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes
Form 12 - Availability		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0075
	Negative Factors:	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount		
Percent Over Low Bid:		29%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		no
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	28.89%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$222,695.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Pg. 39 - Addenda Acknlgmt.	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a
Pg. 40 - Proposal Signature	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Pgs. 41-42 - Proposal Bond		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		0
Division's Recommendation:		CO.