

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Water

Lowest Bidder: \$2,147,043.91
 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: N/A

	Kenmore	Darby Creek	Conie
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,147,043.91	\$2,272,044.35	\$2,461,739.50

FACTORS				
Form 1 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		no	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1
Form 5 - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	80.0%	100.00%	62.00%
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	58%-42%	90%-10%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	varies	see comment
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	-1	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes

		Kenmore	Darby Creek	Conic
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0230	SW0075	SW0035
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$2,147,043.91		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	6%	15%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	no
Page 36 - Environmental Preference				
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	5.82%	14.66%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$125,000.44	\$314,695.59
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
Pages 37 - 40 - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Page 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
Page 49 - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1
Pages 50-51 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-4
Division's Recommendation:				

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: CIP Number: 690236-100038
Division: Project Name: Main Street WL Imp's
Funding Source: Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds
Bid Opening Date: 11/28/12
Lowest Bidder: Engineer's Estimate \$2,424,524.30
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:

	Eramo & Sons	Columbus Asphalt	McDaniel's
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,520,958.00	\$2,532,062.34	\$2,548,555.13

FACTORS				
Form 1 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	yes	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	82.00%	80.00%	64.6%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	80%-20%	100%-ER	75%-25%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	3%-ER
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	"TBD"	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	yes	yes
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes

		Eramo & Sons	Columbus Asphalt	McDaniel's
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0004	SW0010	SW0199
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	17%	18%	19%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
Page 36 - Environmental Preference				
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	17.42%	17.93%	18.70%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$373,914.09	\$385,018.43	\$401,511.22
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
Pages 37 - 40 - Statements and Affidavits				
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Page 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	no	no
Page 49 - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1
Pages 50-51 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-4	-1	-1
	Division's Recommendation:	KENMORE CONSTR		

Department:

Division:

Lowest Bidder:

Non-Local Lowest Bidder:

	Igel	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,937,022.50	\$3,015,335.90	\$3,024,883.18

FACTORS				
Form 1 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	-1
Form 5 - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	54%	30%	0%
Negative Factors:		0	-1	-1
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	see comment
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	4%-ER-up to 15% de
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comments	yes
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes

		Igel	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	G3949, SW0067, D00	No City # listed	SW0088, G4169
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	37%	40%	41%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
Page 36 - Environmental Preference				
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	36.79%	40.44%	40.89%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$789,978.59	\$868,291.99	\$877,839.27
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
Pages 37 - 40 - Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
Page 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	no	yes	no
Page 49 - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	-1
Pages 50-51 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-2	-5	-3
Division's Recommendation:		CTION CO., INC.		

Department: Division:				
Lowest Bidder: Non-Local Lowest Bidder:				
		Fields Excavating	Savko & Sons	Trucco
Bid Tab Amount:		\$3,271,268.00	\$3,291,629.66	\$3,545,601.40
FACTORS				
Form 1 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	0
Form 5 - Debarment				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce				
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	3%	72%	70%
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	60%-40%	68%-32%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	see comment
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	yes	see comment
Form 12 - Availability				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes

		Fields Excavating	Savko & Sons	Trucco
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0013	G2745, SW0028, G59	SW0102, G7045
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	52%	53%	65%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
Page 36 - Environmental Preference				
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		yes	see comment
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	52.36%	53.31%	65.14%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$1,124,224.09	\$1,144,585.75	\$1,398,557.49
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	see comment	no	no
Pages 37 - 40 - Statements and Affidavits				
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Page 48 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	no	yes	no
Page 49 - Proposal Signature				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	-1
Pages 50-51 - Proposal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-3	-1	-2
	Division's Recommendation:			