Department: Public Utilities
Division: Water

Lowest Bidder: \$2,147,043.91

	Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	N/A		
		T7	Danker Carela	Court.
	Bid Tab Amount:	<u>Kenmore</u> \$2,147,043.91	<u>Darby Creek</u> \$2,272,044.35	<u>Conie</u> \$2,461,739.50
	1	T		
	FACTORS			
<u>Form 1 - </u>				
Contract	Dill (0 1)1 c C c C l N 1 l N 1 l N N			
Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 2 <u>-</u> Claims &				
Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes
		0	0	
	Negative Factors:	U	U	-1
Form 3 - Con	npliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		no	
	Fair Labor Standards Act Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)			
		no	no	no
	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	1 1 \ /	yes	yes 0	yes 0
	Negative Factors:	-1	U	U
Form 1 Stat	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
rorm 4 - Stat	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3			
	years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no	NO.
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	no yes	no yes	yes
	Bluder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (1/N) Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-1
	rugative ractors.	U	v	-1
Form 5	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt.			
Debarment	contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or			
<u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors:	80.0%	100.00%	62.00%
	Negauve ractors:	U	U	U
Form 7 - Hea	alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:			90%-10%
		100%-EK	58%-42%	
Ī		100%-ER yes	58%-42% yes	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Hi yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER	yes varies	yes
Form 8 -	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Hi yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER	yes varies	yes
Apprenticeship	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	yes 100%-ER	yes varies	yes
	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Hi yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER	yes varies	yes
Apprenticeship	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	yes 100%-ER 0	yes varies 0	yes see comment 0
Apprenticeship Programs	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes varies 0	yes see comment 0
Apprenticeship Programs	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: verience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED	yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes varies 0 no -1	yes see comment 0 no -1
Apprenticeship Programs	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes varies 0	yes see comment 0 no -1
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes varies 0 no -1	yes see comment 0 no -1
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Reperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes 100%-ER 0 yes 0 yes yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes	yes see comment 0 no -1 yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Sperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes ves yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes yes yes	yes see comment no -1 yes yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp Form 10 - Ex	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes 0 yes yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes	yes see comment 0 no -1 yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp Form 10 - Ex	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) seperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes ves yes yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes	yes see comment 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp Form 10 - Ex Form 11 - De	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Seperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perdelines and Cost Control Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes ves yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes yes yes	yes see comment no -1 yes yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp Form 10 - Ex	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Seperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perdelines and Cost Control Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes ves yes yes yes	yes varies 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes	yes see comment no -1 yes yes yes yes yes

ORD# 0009-201 3		<u>Kenmore</u>	Darby Creek	<u>Conie</u>
	icenses and Certificates			
Bidde	er agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Will b	bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no
Licen	nse and/or Certificate No:	SW0230	SW0075	SW0035
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
				1
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$2,147,043.91		1
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	6%	15%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	no
D 26 E	(ID) C			1
Page 36 - Environm		1 . 1 11.04	1 . 1 . 11.04	1 . 1 . 1.114
	last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4
	s bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	yes
	erence versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	5.82%	14.66%
	erence versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$125,000.44	\$314,695.59
	bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within			
5% A	AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
D 27 40 C	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			
	tements and Affidavits			
	er is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit Propo	osal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Page 48 -				
<u>Addenda</u>				
	er has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
<u>Page 49 - </u>				
<u>Proposal</u> Signature Bidde	1			
<u>Signature</u> Blude	er has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	yes -1
	negative Factors:	U	U	-1
Pages 50-51 - Propo	osal Bond			
Bidde	er has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	ves	yes	yes
	er has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	ves	ves
	er has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	ves	yes
	er has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Constitution of D	-	1	
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-4
	Division's Recommendation:			
	Division 5 Recommendation.			

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department:

CIP Number: Project Name: 690236-100038

Division:

Main Street WL Imp's
Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds

Funding Source: Bid Opening Date:

11/28/12

Lowest Bidder: Engineer's Estimate

\$2,424,524.30

Non-Local Lowest Bidder:

o & Sons Columbus Asphalt

		Eramo & Sons	Columbus Asphalt	McDaniel's
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,520,958.00	\$2,532,062.34	\$2,548,555.13
	EACTORS			
orm 1 -	<u>FACTORS</u>			
Contract				
ompliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
'orm 2 <u>-</u> laims &				
iquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated			
amages	damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
orm 3 - Coi	mpliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	yes	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		n-	
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	no	no ves	no vos
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make imancial statements available upon request (1/N) Negative Factors:	yes -1	yes 0	yes
	Regative Factors:	-1	U	
orm 1 Sta	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
91111 4 - 514	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3			
	years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	VOC	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes yes	no yes	ye
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye.
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	(
	1 II. bill be delegated from the best of the second of the			
orm 5 <u>-</u> ebarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt.		200	200
<u>varmeni</u>	contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors:	0	0	0 no
<u>orm 6 -</u>	1 What percentage of hidder's emlevees is drawn from Columbus Frenklin Co. or			
<u>ocal</u> orkforce	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or			
		92.000/	90.000/	
<u>OTRJOTCE</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors:	82.00%	80.00%	64.6%
	Negative Factors:	82.00% 0	80.00%	64.6%
	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs	0	0	0
	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	(yes
	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 80%-20%	yes 100%-ER	0
	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes 80%-20% yes	yes 100%-ER yes	yes 75%-25% yes
	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 80%-20%	yes 100%-ER	yes 75%-25% yes
orm 7 - Hed	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 80%-20% yes	yes 100%-ER yes	yes 75%-25% yes
orm 7 - Hee	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 80%-20% yes	yes 100%-ER yes	yes 75%-25% yes
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: **Derience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED**	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0
orm 7 - Heo orm 8 - orm 8 - orms	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: **alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs** 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: **Derience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED** Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0 yes 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER () yes ()
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: Auth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0 no -1	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER (yes yes yes yes
orm 7 - Hee	Negative Factors:	9 yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes "TBD"	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0 yes 0
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	9 yes 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes "TBD"	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0 yes 0 yes yes
orm 7 - Hea	Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	9es 80%-20% yes 100%-ER 0 no -1 yes yes yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes yes yes	yes 75%-25% yes 3%-ER 0 yes yes yes yes yes

ORD# 0009-2		Eramo & Sons	Columbus Asphalt	McDaniel's
	le Licenses and Certificates			
P	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
V	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	no
L	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0004	SW0010	SW0199
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	17%	18%	19%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
	ronmental Preference			
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #4
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	no
Γ	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	17.42%	17.93%	18.70%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$373,914.09	\$385,018.43	\$401,511.22
Γ	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within			
	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
Pages 37 - 40 -	Statements and Affidavits			
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Airidavit	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	rugative i actors.	· ·	V	
Page 48 -				
Addenda				
Acknlgmt. B	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	no	no
Page 49 -				
Proposal				
Signature B	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1
20 21 1				
Pages 50-51 - P				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
P	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-4	-1	-1
	Grand Total regainer Pactors.		-1	-1
	Division's Recommendation:			KENMORE CONSTR

Department: Division:

Lowest Bidder: Non-Local Lowest Bidder:

		<u>Igel</u>	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,937,022.50	\$3,015,335.90	\$3,024,883.18
	<u>FACTORS</u>			
Form 1 - Contract				
Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
Form 2 -	•	-		,
Claims & Liquidated	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated			
Damages	damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
		0	•	
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
F 2 G	The state of the s			
Form 3 - Con	Inpliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations: Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding			
	affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	no -1	yes 0
	Negative Factors:	U	*1	U
Form 4 - Stat	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
201111 31111	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3			
	years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1
Form 5 -	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt.			
Debarment	contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Earm (
<u>Form 6 - </u>				
Local	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or	540	2004	200
	contiguous counties	54%	30%	0%
Local		54%	30%	0%
Local Workforce	contiguous counties Negative Factors:			
<u>Local</u> <u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties			
<u>Local</u> <u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors: ulth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs	0	-1	-1
<u>Local</u> <u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors: alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes 100%-ER yes	yes see comment yes
<u>Local</u> <u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors: lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER	yes 100%-ER yes	-1 yes
<u>Local</u> <u>Workforce</u>	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ath Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes	yes 100%-ER yes	yes see comment yes
Local Workforce Form 7 - Hea	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes see comment yes
Local Workforce Form 7 - Head Form 8 -	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes see comment yes
Local Workforce Form 7 - Head Form 8 - Apprenticeship	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec
Local Workforce Form 7 - Head Form 8 -	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER	yes see comment yes
Local Workforce Form 7 - Head Form 8 - Apprenticeship	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: verience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Derience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0 yes 0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0 yes
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0 yes 0 yes yes yes
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec yes 0 yes yes yes yes
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER yes 0 yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0 yes 0 yes yes yes
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Derience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Dependence, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Parallel Section 1. Section 2. Section 2. Section 3. Sec	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes ves ves yes yes yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec 0 yes yes yes yes yes
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	contiguous counties Negative Factors: Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Perience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) Padlines and Cost Control Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes	yes 100%-ER yes 100%-ER 0 yes yes yes yes	yes see comment yes 4%-ER-up to 15% dec yes yes yes yes yes yes

ORD# 0009-		<u>Igel</u>	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating
	de Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	G3949, SW0067, D00	No City # listed	SW0088, G4169
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	37%	40%	41%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	no
	ironmental Preference			
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	36.79%	40.44%	40.89%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$789,978.59	\$868,291.99	\$877,839.27
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within			
	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
Pages 37 - 40	- Statements and Affidavits			
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
Page 48 -				
<u>1 uge 48 -</u> Addenda				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	no	yes	no
Page 49 -	in the second production of the second product		,	
Proposal				
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	-1
Pages 50 51	Proposal Bond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	****	****	****
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
		yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-2	-5	-3
	Division's Recommendation:	UCTION CO., INC.		

Department: Division:

Lowest Bidder: Non-Local Lowest Bidder:

Fields Executing Say 27, 268,00 \$3,201,020,66 \$35,545,001.
Form 1 - Contact Complained: Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N) yes yes
Earm 1 Complaince Complai
Contract. Complaince Commelance C
Earth 2
Calains & Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0 0
Liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (V/N) Negative Factors: 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Damages damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0 0 0
Negative Factors: 0 0 0
Bidder has a record of with various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations; Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): 1. Fair Labor Standards Act no no no no no no no n
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): 1. Fair Labor Standards Act 1. Fair Labor Standards Act 1. For Manage Wage Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder past a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. State and Federal Health and Safety Laws; 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA,gov) (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety Laws; 1. Bidder has a health and safety Laws; 1. Bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety Dan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any gov. 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any gov. 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Washington Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contiguous counties 1. What percentage paid into plan: 1. What per
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): 1. Fair Labor Standards Act 1. Fair Labor Standards Act 1. For Manage Wage Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder past a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 8. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. State and Federal Health and Safety Laws; 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA,gov) (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety Laws; 1. Bidder has a health and safety Laws; 1. Bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety Dan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Stader has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any gov. 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any gov. 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Washington Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contiguous counties 1. What percentage paid into plan: 1. What per
1. Fair Labor Standards Act
2. Prevailing Wage Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws 4. Workers' Compensation Laws 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Negative Factors: 9. O 9. O 1. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 9. Ses yes 9. Ses yes 9. Negative Factors: 9. O 9. O 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA-gov) (Y/N) 9. Ses yes 9. Ses
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws no no ho
4. Workers' Compensation Laws 5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Negative Factors: 0 0 0 Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA,gov) (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a health and safety plan (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Ves 9. Ves 9. Sidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Negative Factors: 1. Las bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 1. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Negative Factors: 1. Las bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bid
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Yes 1. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Negative Factors: 9. 0 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA,gov) (Y/N) 9. 2. Bidder has a nealth and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. 2. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 9. 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 1. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 1. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contiguous counties 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Contiguous counties 1. What percentage paid into plan: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes
affirmative action programs (Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Yes 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify no OSHA_eyor) (Y/N) 9. Yes 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. Yes 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 9. Yes 4. Would bidder provide CoBAL 200-300 (gu pto 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 9. Yes 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 2. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or 8. Negative Factors: 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9. Yes 1. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Jes Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Jes Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Jes Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Jes Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 9. Jes Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9. Yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. yes 9. yes 9. yes 1. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) 8. Negative Factors: 9. 0 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) 9. 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 9. yes 9. yes 9. 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 9. yes 9. yes 9. 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Bidder has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3 years (Y/N) 9. Regative Factors: 9. Debarment on the last 3
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0 0 0 Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 4. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 6. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 7. Debarment 7. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 8. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 8. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 8. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 8. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) 8. Beative Factors: 9 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 8. Regative Factors: 9 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 8. Regative Factors: 9 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 1. Wegative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 1. Regative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 9 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 1. Regative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9 1. Bidder has a record of "Wilfful or "Serious" Osh Apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9 9 9 1. Bidder has a record of "Wilfful or "Serious" Osh Apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9
Negative Factors: 0 0 0 O
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) yes yes yes 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) yes yes yes 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) yes yes yes 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) yes yes yes 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) no no Negative Factors:
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) yes yes yes 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) yes yes 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) yes yes yes 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) yes yes yes 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) no no no no no
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) yes yes yes 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) yes yes 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) yes yes yes 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) yes yes yes 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) no no no no no
years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0 0 Form 6 - Local 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has retirement Programs 1. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Wes yes 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Wes yes 1. Bidder has bealth insurance? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Wes yes 1. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 60%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 60%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 100%-ER 50%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 100%-ER 50%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 100%-ER 50%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 100%-ER 50%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors: 1. Dow-ER 50%-40% 689 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: 1. Negative Factors:
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N) 3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0. 0. Negative Factors: 0. 0. Negative Factors: 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or workforce contiguous counties Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 1. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N) 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Workforce Negative Factors: 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or Workforce Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) yes yes 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) yes yes 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: 0 0 Form 6 - Local Workforce 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) Prom 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) Pograms 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Pograms
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors:
Negative Factors:
Form 5 - Debarment 1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. no no no
Contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors: O O
Negative Factors: 0 0 0 Negative Factors: 0 0 0
Form 6 - Local Workforce 1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 3% 72% Negative Factors: -1 0 Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs
1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 3% 72%
1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 3% 72%
Negative Factors: 1 0
Negative Factors: -1
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs 1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan? (Y/N) yes yes
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes yes 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors: Negative Factors: 100%-ER 0 0 Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
Negative Factors: 0 0 0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
Apprenticeship Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
Programs 1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) yes yes
Negative Factors: 0 0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) yes yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N) yes yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) yes yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) yes yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N) see comment yes see cor
see comment yes
Form 12 - Availability

ORD# 0009-1		Fields Excavating	Savko & Sons	Trucco
Form 13 - Trad	de Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
1	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	n
]	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0013	G2745, SW0028, G59	SW0102, G704
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	52%	53%	65%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no	n
Page 36 - Envi	ironmental Preference			
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	no; but ackn add #4	no; but ackn add #
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	•	yes	see commer
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	52.36%	53.31%	65.14%
]	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$1,124,224.09	\$1,144,585.75	\$1,398,557.49
]	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within	. , ,	. , ,	. / /
:	5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	see comment	no	no
	- Statements and Affidavits Diddenia and Affidavits			
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes 0	yes 0	ye
	Negative Factors:	U	U	
Page 48 -				
Addenda				
	Bidder has acknowledged any/all addendums issued on project (Y/N)	no	yes	n
Page 49 -	in the state of th		,	
Proposal				
Signature [Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	
Pages 50-51 -	Proposal Bond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	y
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	ves	ves	y. Vi
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye.
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	ves	ves	V
	Negative Factors:	0	0	y
	S			
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-3	-1	-
	District D. 1.4			
	Division's Recommendation:			