

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Water

Lowest Bidder: \$40,258.90
Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$40,258.90

	Enviro. Management Specialists	Enviro. Remediation Contractor	Water Quality Systems
Bid Tab Amount:	\$40,258.90	\$76,953.80	\$96,256.02
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	no	yes	no
	NON-RESPONSIVE		

FACTORS				
	Is bidder pre-qualified with ODOT?	(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)
Form 1 & Pg. 6 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	22.0%	100.0%	10.0%
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	-1
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	80% / 20%		50% / 50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	100%-EE		39% / 97%
	Negative Factors:	0	-2	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	(blank)	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	(blank)
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	yes
Form 12 - Availability				

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM				
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>				
Division: <u>Water</u>				
Lowest Bidder:	\$40,258.90			
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	\$40,258.90			
	Enviro. Management Specialists	Enviro. Remediation Contractor	Water Quality Systems	
Bid Tab Amount:	\$40,258.90	\$76,953.80	\$96,256.02	
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	no	yes	no	
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Form 14 - Local Bidder Credit				
Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Columbus corp. limits (1%, \$50k cap) (Y/N)	no	yes	no	no
Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Franklin Co., outside Columbus corp. limits (.5%, \$25k cap) (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
Page 37: Is local bidder affidavit signed & notarized (Y/N)	no	yes	no	no
Total Local Credit	0.00%	1.00%	0.00%	0.00%
Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00	\$402.59	\$0.00	\$0.00
Evaluated Bid Total:	\$40,258.90	\$76,551.21	\$96,256.02	\$96,256.02
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$40,258.90			
Percent Over Low Bid:	0.00%	90.15%	139.09%	139.09%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	no	no
Page 38 - Environmental Preference				
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	90.15%	139.09%	139.09%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$36,292.31	\$55,997.12	\$55,997.12
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no	no
Pgs. 39-42 Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit: Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	0
Page 47 - Addenda Ackngmt.				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Page 48 - Proposal Signature				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Page 49 - Proposal Bond				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:	-3	-3	-2	-2
Division's Recommendation:		ENVIRONMEN		

Department:				CIP Number:	<u>690446</u>
Division:				Project Name:	<u>Griggs Reservoir Envir</u>
				Funding Source:	<u>Water Works En</u>
				Bid Opening Date:	<u>11/</u>
Lowest Bidder:				Engineer's Estimate:	<u>\$218,</u>
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	<u>Enviromental</u>	<u>Conie Constr.</u>	<u>Metropolitan Enviro.</u>		
	<u>Enterprises</u>		<u>Svcs.</u>		
Bid Tab Amount:	\$106,337.99	\$110,832.70	\$113,970.87		
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	yes	yes	yes		

FACTORS						
Is bidder pre-qualified with ODOT?		(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)		
Form 1 & Pg. 6 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	yes	no		
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0		
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:						
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):						
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no		
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no		
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no		
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
Negative Factors:		0	0	0		
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:						
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no	yes	no		
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no		
Negative Factors:		0	-1	0		
Form 5 - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no		
Negative Factors:		0	0	0		
Form 6 - Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	4.0%	62.0%	76.0%		
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0		
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs						
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	70% / 30%	90% / 10%	90% / 10%		
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	0 / 100%	100% match up to 3% gro	100% / 0%		
Negative Factors:		0	0	0		
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no	no		
Negative Factors:		-1	-1	-1		
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED						
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	(blank)	yes	yes		
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED						
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes		
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control						
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see comment		
Form 12 - Availability						

Department: _____ Division: _____		CIP Number: <u>690446</u> Project Name: <u>Griggs Reservoir Envir</u> Funding Source: <u>Water Works En</u> Bid Opening Date: <u>11/</u> Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$218,</u>		
Lowest Bidder: _____ Non-Local Lowest Bidder: _____				
		<u>Enviromental Enterprises</u>	<u>Conie Constr.</u>	<u>Metropolitan Enviro. Svcs.</u>
Bid Tab Amount: _____ Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)		\$106,337.99 yes	\$110,832.70 yes	\$113,970.87 yes
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates				
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)		no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Form 14 - Local Bidder Credit				
Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Columbus corp. limits (1%, \$50k cap) (Y/N)		???	yes	yes
Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Franklin Co., outside Columbus corp. limits (.5%, \$25k cap) (Y/N)		???	no	no
Is local bidder affidavit signed & notarized (Y/N)		yes		yes
Total Local Credit		0.00%	1.00%	1.00%
Dollar Value of Credits		\$0.00	\$402.59	\$402.59
Evaluated Bid Total:		\$106,337.99	\$110,430.11	\$113,568.28
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits				
Percent Over Low Bid:		164.14%	174.30%	182.09%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)		no	no	no
Page 38 - Environmental Preference				
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		no	yes	????
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)		164.14%	174.30%	182.09%
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)		\$66,079.09	\$70,171.21	\$73,309.38
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.		no	no	no
Pgs. 39-42 Statements and Affidavits				
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Page 47 - Addenda Acknlgmt.				
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Page 48 - Proposal Signature				
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Page 49 - Proposal Bond				
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-2	-3	-1
Division's Recommendation:		TAL REMEDIATION CONTRACTOR		

<p style="text-align: right;"> Department: -10002 Division: Environmental Remediation Large Voted Bonds 7/12 Lowest Bidder: 105.00 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: Kind Development Ltd. Bid Tab Amount: \$225,701.85 Local Company? (Proof s/b included.) no </p>		
FACTORS		
Is bidder pre-qualified with ODOT?		(not req'd for DPU)
Form 1 & Pg. 6 - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:		
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 5 - Debarment		
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
Form 6 - Local Workforce		
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%
Negative Factors:		-1
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	no
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	no
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	
Negative Factors:		-2
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs		
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment
Form 12 - Availability		

Department: 10002 Division: Environmental Remediation Large Voted Bonds 7/12 Lowest Bidder: 105.00 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: Kind Development Ltd. Bid Tab Amount: \$225,701.85 Local Company? (Proof s/b included.) no		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no
	Negative Factors:	0
Form 14 - Local Bidder Credit		
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Columbus corp. limits (1%, \$50k cap) (Y/N)	no
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Franklin Co., outside Columbus corp. limits (.5%, \$25k cap) (Y/N)	no
Page 37:	Is local bidder affidavit signed & notarized (Y/N)	no
	Total Local Credit	0.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00
	Evaluated Bid Total:	\$225,701.85
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	
	Percent Over Low Bid:	460.63%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	no
Page 38 - Environmental Preference		
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	460.63%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$185,442.95
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no
Pgs. 39-42 Statements and Affidavits		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Page 47 - Addenda Acknlgmt.		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes
Page 48 - Proposal Signature		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Page 49 - Proposal Bond		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	no
	Negative Factors:	-1
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-5
	Division's Recommendation:	