

## Cofield, Alex A.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 11:52 AM  
**To:** Palmer, Tierra L.  
**Cc:** Wilfong, Gary D.; Wayton, Daniel J.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RE: CORRECTION -- RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Sidewalk Design III

I approve of the recommended consultant for selection

---

**From:** Palmer, Tierra L.  
**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 10:36 AM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Wilfong, Gary D.; Wayton, Daniel J.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** CORRECTION -- RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Sidewalk Design III

Please note that the previous email regarding the outcome of Thursday's Evaluation Committee meeting contained a typographical error relative to the proposed use of subcontractors by Patrick Engineering. Below is the corrected table outlining the composition of each team, with the correction highlighted.

<b>CONSULTANT Sub-consultant</b>	<b>Business Enterprise Status</b>	<b>Contract Compliance Number</b>	<b>Active</b>	<b>% OF WORK</b>	<b>% MAJ. % OTH.</b>
<b>ADR &amp; ASSOCIATES</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>31-1499809</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>80%</b>	<b>80% MAJ 15% ? 5% OTH</b>
Smart Services, Inc.		31-1456994	Y	15%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	31-0716498	Y	5%	
<b>PATRICK ENGINEERING</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>36-3008281</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>65%</b>	<b>65% MAJ 35% OTH</b>
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	31-0716498	Y	35%	
<b>STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>11-2167170</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>80%</b>	<b>80% MAJ 20% OTH</b>
Resource International	FBE	31-0669793	Y	20%	

<b>STONE ENVIRONMENTAL</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>31-1262683</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>70% MAJ 30% OTH</b>
DHDC	ASN	32-0376762	Y	5%	
XYZ Survey Services	AFA	04-3846618	Y	25%	

**Tierra Palmer**

Management Analyst I  
City of Columbus  
Department of Public Service  
Office of Support Services  
109 N. Front St.  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 645-7348

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 18, 2013 3:00 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Wilfong, Gary D.; Wayton, Daniel J.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Sidewalk Design III

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service  
**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager  
**Date:** April 18, 2013  
**Subject:** Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Sidewalk Design III

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Sidewalk Design III contract. The contract shall be funded by DPS cash.

This project includes preliminary and final engineering for improvements to install sidewalk and curb ramps at two locations in the City of Columbus, McCutcheon Road from Sunbury Road to Oak Spring Street and Reed Road from Henderson Road to Bethel Road. The project will include ROW acquisition and improvements necessary to accommodate drainage, if needed.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from March 21, 2013, to April 11, 2013. The city received four (4) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on April 18, 2013. The responding firms were:

<b>CONSULTANT Sub-consultant</b>	<b>Business Enterprise Status</b>	<b>Contract Compliance Number</b>	<b>Active</b>	<b>% OF WORK</b>	<b>% MAJ. % OTH.</b>
<b>ADR &amp; ASSOCIATES</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>31-1499809</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>80%</b>	<b>80% MAJ</b>

					15% ? 5% OTH
Smart Services, Inc.		31-1456994	Y	15%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	31-0716498	Y	5%	
<b>PATRICK ENGINEERING</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>36-3008281</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>65%</b>	<b>65% MAJ</b> <b>35% OTH</b>
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	31-0716498	Y	5%	
<b>STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>11-2167170</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>80%</b>	<b>80% MAJ</b> <b>20% OTH</b>
Resource International	FBE	31-0669793	Y	20%	
<b>STONE ENVIRONMENTAL</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>31-1262683</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>70% MAJ</b> <b>30% OTH</b>
DHDC	ASN	32-0376762	Y	5%	
XYZ Survey Services	AFA	04-3846618	Y	25%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman. Non-voting members, but attendees, included, Alex Cofield and Tierra Palmer. Duane Parks, a representative from EBOCO, also attended.

ADR & Associates received 85.67 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. with 82.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the four evaluated proposals for your final selection.

ADR & Associates	85.67
Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	82.67
Patrick Engineering	80.67
Stone Environmental	63.67

The Committee would like to submit ADR & Associates for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that ADR & Associates submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. ADR & Associates possesses significant sidewalk project experience.
2. ADR & Associates outlined site specific issues and solutions in its proposal.
3. ADR & Associates referenced the Columbus Pedestrian Thoroughfare Plan Handbook.
4. ADR & Associates presented a good philosophy of sidewalk design.
5. ADR & Associates understood public involvement is important to the project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, ADR & Associates
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other