

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

|   |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|---|---|----------------------------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Department:   |   | Public Utilities           |                  | CIP Number:             |                         | 690236                             |                             |                      |             |
| Division:   |   | Power & Water (Water)      |                  | Project Name:           |                         | Mt. Vernon Ave. Water Main Improv. |                             |                      |             |
|   |   |                            |                  | Funding Source:         |                         | OWDA Loan                          |                             |                      |             |
|   |   |                            |                  | Bid Opening Date:       |                         | 6/24/09                            |                             |                      |             |
| Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$ 601,541.22              |                  | Engineer's Estimate:    |                         | \$941,514.75                       |                             |                      |             |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$ 685,766.50              |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>COMPANY NAME</b>   |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|   |   | Conie Construction Co.     | Complete General | Fields Excavating, Inc. | Columbus Asphalt Paving | John Eramo & Sons, Inc.            | George J. Igel, & Co., Inc. | McDaniels Const. Co. |             |
| Original Bid Amount:  |   | \$ 601,541.22              | \$ 684,153.25    | \$ 685,766.50           | \$ 710,212.86           | \$ 740,428.26                      | \$ 806,146.77               | \$ 855,855.70        |             |
| Local Company?  |   | Yes                        | Yes              | No                      | Yes                     | Yes                                | Yes                         | Yes                  |             |
| <b>FACTORS</b>  |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>   |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive   | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                                  | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                    | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency                          | no                         | no               | no                      | no                      | no                                 | no                          | no                   | no          |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses   | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                           | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| Proceed to Tier II?   |   | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| <b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (possible percentage credits listed below)</b>  |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) (If yes = 1%)             | yes                        | yes              | no                      | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (If yes = 1%)                                     | yes                        | yes              | no                      | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (If yes = 1%)                         | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (If yes = 1%)                                    | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| % of insurance provided by company  |   | 100.00%                    | 100.00%          | 100.00%                 | 100.00%                 | 100.00%                            | 80.00%                      | 100.00%              | 75.00%      |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (If yes = 1%)                          | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   |   | 3.00%                      | 100.00%          | 100.00%                 | 100.00%                 | 100.00%                            | 100.00%                     | 100.00%              | 75.00%      |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference (If yes = 1%-5%)                                | yes                        | yes              | yes                     | yes                     | yes                                | yes                         | yes                  | yes         |
| <b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)</b>  |   | 10.00%                     | 10.00%           | 8.00%                   | 10.00%                  | 10.00%                             | 9.00%                       | 9.00%                | 5.00%       |
| <b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>  |   | \$50,919.31                | \$50,919.31      | \$38,046.24             | \$50,919.31             | \$50,919.31                        | \$44,903.90                 | \$44,903.90          | \$30,919.31 |
| <b>Bid Total:</b>   |   | 550,621.91                 | 633,233.94       | 647,720.26              | 659,293.55              | 689,508.95                         | 761,242.87                  | 761,242.87           | 824,936.39  |
| <b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>  |   | \$ 550,621.91              |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>  |   | 0.000%                     | 15.003%          | 17.634%                 | 19.736%                 | 25.224%                            | 38.251%                     | 38.251%              | 49.819%     |
| <b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>   |   | yes                        | no               | no                      | no                      | no                                 | no                          | no                   | no          |
| <b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>   |   | yes                        | no               | no                      | no                      | no                                 | no                          | no                   | no          |
| <b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>  |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no                         |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>   |   | -1                         | 0                | 0                       | 0                       | 0                                  | 0                           | 0                    | 0           |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited   |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>  |   | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>  |   | yes                        | no               | no                      | no                      | no                                 | no                          | no                   | no          |
| <b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>   |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |   |                            |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                   | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                           | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                        | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                          | yes                        |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |
| <b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>  |   | 5                          | 0                | 0                       | 0                       | 0                                  | 0                           | 0                    | 0           |
| <b>Division's Recommendation:</b>   |   | Conie Construction Company |                  |                         |                         |                                    |                             |                      |             |