

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Thursday, December 22, 2011 1:51 PM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Traffic Signal Installation - General Engineering Signals

I approve of the recommended consultant for award

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Thursday, December 22, 2011 1:29 PM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Traffic Signal Installation - General Engineering Signals

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: December 22, 2011

Subject: Traffic Signal Installation – General Engineering Signals

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Traffic Signal Installation – General Engineering Signals project. The budget is \$500,000; amount of the contract shall be \$500,000 funded by 2011 Bonds funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Planning and Operations, additional resources to perform design of signal projects. The projects developed under this program are typically small to moderate size improvements, and frequently include performing a traffic study to determine if a signal is warranted, designing roadway improvements such as turn lanes, designing a new signal, designing a replacement signal, or modifying an existing signal. In addition, existing underground conduit shall be identified to determine feasibility of re-use. The designs will include ensuring that ADA requirements are met with each project.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from November 9, 2011, to December 14, 2011. The city received six (6) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on December 22, 2011. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY % OTHER
------------------------------	----------------------------------	-------------------------------	--------	--------------	-----------------------

E.P. Ferris & Assoc.	MAJ	311194974	Yes	65.00%	75.00% MAJ 25.00% OTH
WD Transportation	MAJ	311451869	Yes	10.00%	
Resource Intl.	FBE	310669793	Yes	15.00%	
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	311268980	Yes	10.00%	
EMH&T	MAJ	310685594	Yes	77.00%	85.00% MAJ 15.00% OTH
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	311268980	Yes	15.00%	
WM Engineering	MAJ	301409153	Yes	5.00%	
Ohio Geomatics, Ltd.	MAJ	223899748	Yes	3.00%	
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	311268980	Yes	80.00%	10.00% MAJ 90.00% OTH
E.P. Ferris & Assoc.	MAJ	311194974	Yes	10.00%	
CEC, Inc.	AS1	310716498	Yes	10.00%	
MS Consultants, Inc.	MAJ	346546916	Yes	90.00%	90.00% MAJ 10.00% OTH
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	311268980	Yes	5.00%	
CEC, Inc.	AS1	310716498	Yes	5.00%	
HDR Engineering	PHC	470680568	Yes	58.00%	37.00% MAJ 63.00% OTH
URS	MAJ	340939859	Yes	15.00%	
Burgess & Niple	MAJ	310885550	Yes	20.00%	
Dynotec	AFA	311319961	Yes	5.00%	
So-Deep US, P.C.	MAJ	541618441	Yes	2.00%	
Trans Associates	MAJ	251634385	Yes	65.00%	65.00% MAJ 35.00% OTH
DLZ Ohio, Inc.	ASN	311268980	Yes	15.00%	
Resource Intl.	FBE	310669793	Yes	20.00%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran and Patti Austin – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

E.P. Ferris and Associates, Inc. received 86.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was EMH&T, Inc. with 83.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the six evaluated proposals for your final selection.

E.P. Ferris	86.33
EMH&T	83.33
DLZ Ohio	82.00
MS Consultants	77.67
HDR Engineering	72.67
Trans Associates	72.33

The Committee would like to submit E.P. Ferris for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that E.P. Ferris submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. E.P. Ferris presented a very experienced project team in traffic signal design.
2. E.P. Ferris demonstrated a good understanding of the nature of projects with the RFP.
3. E.P. Ferris mentioned experience with the sensitivity of removing traffic signals.
4. The E.P. Ferris' proposal discussed the details of the maintaining signals during construction.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, E.P. Ferris
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager
City of Columbus
Department of Public Service
Office of Support Services
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov