	(FOI	CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM R CONTRACTS OVER \$20	000)			
-	Department:	Donartment of Bublic Utili	tion			
-	Division:	Department of Public Utili Power & Water	ties	Project:	Fast Columbus Area	Water Improvements
	DIVISION.	1 Ower & Water				t Voted 1991 Bonds Fund
				Bid Opening Date:		/-2007
	Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 1,715,969.65		Engineer's Estimate:		,099.10
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	, ,		J		
			COMPA	NY NAME		
		Complete General	Darby Creek			
	Original Bid Amount:		\$ 1,715,969.65			
	Local Company?	yes	no			
	FACTORS					
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors					
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes			
	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes			
	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes			
	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no			
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes			
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes			
├ ─	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes			
-	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)					
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no			
	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes			
_	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes			
	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes			
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	58.00%			
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes			
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%	varies			
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	5.00%	4.00%			
	Dollar Value of Credits	68,639	68,639			
-	Bid Total:	1,869,059.92	1,647,330.86			
-	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 1,647,330.86				
	Percent Over Low Bid:	\$ 1,647,330.86 13.460%	0.000%			
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	no	yes			
	Proceed to Tier III?	no	yes			
			•			
	Tier III - History Experience Factors					
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs		no			
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs		no			
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds		no			
	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years		no			
	Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years		no no			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:		no			
r <u></u> -	A. Fair Labor Standards Act		no			
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws		no			
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no			
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws		no		-	
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years		no			
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation		yes			
	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR		yes			
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable		no no			
TIC 12	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:		0			
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited		<u> </u>			
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)					
	Proceed to Tier IV?	no	no			
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)					
	Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited					
	gh application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be	conducted, tollowing which,		ctor (s).		
R-1 R-2	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project		yes			
R-2	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to ensure completion or project		yes yes			
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project		yes			
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project		yes			
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	0	5			
					•	
	Division's Recommendation:	Darby Creek				

BID EV	OF COLUMBUS 'ALUATION FORM RACTS OVER \$20,000)								
Department:									
	ower & Water		Project: East Columbus Area Water Main Improvements						
			Funding Source: Bid Opening Date: 9-May-07						
Low Bid at Opening: \$	500,000.00	E	ngineer's Estimate: \$	1,937,099.10					
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$	490,000.00		COMPANY NAME						
	Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5	Company A	Company B	Company C mpany	
Original Bid Amount: \$ Local Company?	500,000.00 \$ ves	490,000.00 \$	525,000.00 \$ yes \$	- \$ - \$	- \$	500,000.00 \$	490,000.00 \$	525,000.00 \$ - yes \$ -	
	yes	110	yes \$	- •	-	yes	110	yes 🗘 -	•
FACTORS Tier I - Mandatory Factors									
M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes			yes	yes	yes	
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes			yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no			no	no	no	
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes			yes	yes	yes	
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one Proceed to Tier II?	ves ves	yes yes	ves ves	no	no	ves ves	ves ves	yes	no no
	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes n	no no
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)									
C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes yes	no no	ves ves	no	no	ves ves	no no	yes r yes	no no
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes	no			no	ves	no	
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes			yes	yes	yes	
% of insurance provided by company C-5 Bidder is eliqible for retirement or pension plan credit	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%			50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	yes	yes	yes			yes	yes	yes	
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)	4.00%	3.00%	4.00%	NA	NA	4.00%	3.00%		IA NA
Dollar Value of Credits	19,900	15,000	19,900	NA	NA	19,900	15,000	19,900 N/	
Bid Total:	480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00	NA	NA	480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00 N	IA NA
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits \$	475,000.00				\$	475,000.00			
Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	1.074%	0.000%	6.337%	#VALUE! #VALUE!	#VALUE!	1.074%	0.000%	6.337% ##### yes #####	#######
Proceed to Tier III?	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	yes yes	yes yes	yes #####	# #####
Tier III - History Experience Factors HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no			no	no	no	
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no			no	no	no	
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no			no	no	no	
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years HE-5 Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no no	no no	yes no			no no	no no	yes no	
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no			no	no	no	
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	yes	yes			no	yes	yes	
A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no no	no no	no			no	no	no	
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws							no		
	no	no	no no			no no	no no	no no	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no no	no no			no no no	no no	no no no	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no no	no no no	no no no			no no no no	no no no	no no no no	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no no	no no			no no no	no no	no no no	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of 'willful or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation HE-11 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no no yes yes no	no no no no yes no	no no no no no			no no no yes yes no	no no no no yes no	no no no no no no	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willu or' serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a necond of "willu or' serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a neadquate health and safety plan and supporting documentation HE-11 Bidder parallifes for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no no yes yes no no	no no no yes no no	no no no no no no			no no no yes yes no	no no no yes no no	no no no no no no no	0 0
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of 'willful or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation HE-11 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no no yes yes no	no no no no yes no	no no no no no	0	0	no no no yes yes no	no no no no yes no	no no no no no no no	0 0
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willut or 'serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid Investigated with safshactory outcome? (Requires user input)	no no yes yes no no o	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no yes yes no no 0	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Blüder has a record of "willt or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Blüder has a record of "willt or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-18 Blüder past of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Blüder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Blüder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in itself imay result in further investigation of bid, if merited	no no yes yes no no	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no	0	0	no no no yes yes no no	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no -3	0 0
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "will or' serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a necknot of will under serious of SHA proporting documentation HE-11 Bidder parallies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable HE12 The results of Bidder's references are discharged to the properties of the serious of the seri	no yes yes no no o yes	no no no yes no no -1 yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no yes yes no no 0	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "Willu or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "Willu or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-10 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tire III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid Investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (ves answers desirable) Note: Tier IV Ventalis examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field	no no yes yes no no o o yes yes at of eligible bidders will be d	no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no yes yes no no 0	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "will or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a neodiquate health and safety plan and supporting documentation HE-11 Bidder pass of the HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier Ilm syresult in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier V - Resource Factors (was answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The first frough application of Tiers I through application of Tiers II through application of Tiers	no no yes yes no no o o yes yes at of eligible bidders will be d	no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no yes yes no no 0	no no no yes no no -1	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "will or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "will for 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of EPA violations and specific years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in it ell may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (ses answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entalls examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The filed through application of Tiers It Involph application of Tiers It morph. III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project for services and the sufficient experience to ensure completion of project for the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for which the bid was solicited. The file of the project for the pro	no no yes yes yes no no o o yes yes to following which, the City wes yes yes	no no no no no yes no no no -1 yes yes etermined all select a contractor (s).	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no yes yes no no o yes yes	no no no yes no no -1 yes yes	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willt or 'serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "willt or 'serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factor investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (was answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project R3 Bidder's worldcore has sufficient experience to complete this project	no no yes yes no no no o yes yes no no o o yes	no no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes yes etermined ill select a contractor (s). yes yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no no no yes yes no no no yes	no no no no no yes no no no -1 yes yes yes yes yes	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "will or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "will for 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of EPA violations and specific years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in it elli may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (ves answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entalis examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The fleict through application of Tiers It Involph Bill. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to complete this project Bidder's management has sufficient experience to complete this project Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience proposed for the project Bidder's adequate qualified and experience proposed for the project Bidder's adequate qualified and experience proposed for the project	no no yes yes yes no no o o o yes yes to following which, the City wyes yes yes yes yes yes yes	no no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes yes select a contractor (s). yes yes yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no no yes yes yes o o yes yes yes yes yes	no no no no yes no	no no no no no no no -3	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willt or 'serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "willt or 'serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factor investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV? Tier IV - Resource Factors (was answers desirable) Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project R3 Bidder's worldcore has sufficient experience to complete this project	no no yes yes no no no o yes yes no no o o yes	no no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes yes etermined ill select a contractor (s). yes yes	no no no no no no no no	v		no no no no no yes yes no no no yes	no no no no no yes no no no -1 yes yes yes yes yes	no n	
D. Worker's Compensation Laws HE-8 Bidder has a record of "will do "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of "will do "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years HE-9 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tire III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid Investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tire IV? Text IV - Resource Factors (see answers desirable) Note: Text V entalls examining resources factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field through apile as sufficient polysical resources factors with the resonably complete his project (e.g., equipment) Bidder has sufficient polysical resources to resonably complete his project (e.g., equipment) Bidder management has sufficient experience to complete his project (e.g., equipment) Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete his project (e.g., equipment) Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	no no yes yes yes no no no o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o	no no no no no yes no no -1 yes yes yes select a contractor (s). yes yes yes	no no no no no no no no no	no		no no no no no yes yes no no no o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o	no no no no yes no	no n	no no