

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Department of Public Utilities		Project: East Columbus Area Water Improvements	
Division: Power & Water		Funding Source: Water Works Enlargement Voted 1991 Bonds Fund	
Low Bid at Opening: \$ 1,715,969.65		Bid Opening Date: 9-May-2007	
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:		Engineer's Estimate: \$1,937,099.10	
		COMPANY NAME	
		Complete General	Darby Creek
Original Bid Amount: \$		1,937,698.71	\$ 1,715,969.65
Local Company?		yes	no
FACTORS			
Tier I - Mandatory Factors			
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes
Proceed to Tier II?		yes	yes
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)			
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes
		<i>% of insurance provided by company</i>	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes
		<i>% of retirement or pension plan provided by company</i>	100.00%
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)		5.00%	4.00%
Dollar Value of Credits		68,639	68,639
Bid Total:		1,869,059.92	1,647,330.86
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits		\$ 1,647,330.86	
Percent Over Low Bid:		13.460%	0.000%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)		no	yes
Proceed to Tier III?		no	yes
Tier III - History Experience Factors			
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs		no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs		no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds		no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years		no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.		no
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years		no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:		no
A. Fair Labor Standards Act			no
B. Prevailing Wage Laws			no
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws			no
D. Worker's Compensation Laws			no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years		no
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation		yes
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR		yes
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years		no
HE12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable		no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:			0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited			
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)			
Proceed to Tier IV?		no	no
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)			
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).			
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)		yes
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project		yes
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project		yes
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project		yes
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project		yes
Total Number of "Yes" Answers		0	5
Division's Recommendation: Darby Creek			

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)												
Department: _____			Project: <u>East Columbus Area Water Main Improvements</u>									
Division: <u>Power & Water</u>			Funding Source: _____									
Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>500,000.00</u>			Bid Opening Date: <u>9-May-07</u>									
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>490,000.00</u>			Engineer's Estimate: \$ <u>1,937,099.10</u>									
			COMPANY NAME									
			Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5	Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5
Original Bid Amount: \$			\$ 500,000.00	\$ 490,000.00	\$ 525,000.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 490,000.00	\$ 525,000.00	\$ -	\$ -
Local Company?			yes	no	yes	-	-	yes	no	yes	-	-
FACTORS												
Tier I - Mandatory Factors												
M-1	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any gov. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	yes	yes	yes	no	no
Proceed to Tier II?												
Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)												
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no	yes	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-2	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no	yes	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no	yes	no	no	no
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of insurance provided by company	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	4.00%	3.00%	4.00%	NA	NA	NA	4.00%	3.00%	4.00%	NA	NA
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)												
Dollar Value of Credits		19,900	15,000	19,900	NA	NA	NA	19,900	15,000	19,900	NA	NA
Bid Total:		480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00	NA	NA	NA	480,100.00	475,000.00	505,100.00	NA	NA
Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits		\$ 475,000.00						\$ 475,000.00				
Percent Over Low Bid:		1.074%	0.000%	6.337%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	1.074%	0.000%	6.337%	#####	#####
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)		yes	yes	yes	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	yes	yes	yes	#####	#####
Proceed to Tier III?		yes	yes	yes	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	yes	yes	yes	#####	#####
Tier III - History Experience Factors												
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no	yes	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with gov. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	yes	yes	no	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	no
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-8	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-9	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no	no
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no
HE-11	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-12	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:		0	-1	-3	0	0	0	0	-1	-3	0	0
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited		yes	yes	no	no	no	no	yes	yes	no	no	no
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)		yes	yes	no	no	no	no	yes	yes	no	no	no
Proceed to Tier IV?		yes	yes	no	no	no	no	yes	yes	no	no	no
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)												
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).												
R1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Total Number of "Yes" Answers		5	5	5	0	0	0	5	5	5	0	0
Division's Recommendation: _____												

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience