

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Monday, February 13, 2012 3:20 PM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** Westall, Bradley; Wilfong, Gary D.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: Bridge and Trail Improvements - West Fifth Avenue from McKinley Avenue to Dublin Road

I approve of the recommended consultant for award

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Monday, February 13, 2012 1:12 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Westall, Bradley; Wilfong, Gary D.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Bridge and Trail Improvements - West Fifth Avenue from McKinley Avenue to Dublin Road

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** February 13, 2012

**Subject:** Bridge and Trail Improvements – West Fifth Avenue from McKinley Avenue to Dublin Road

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Bridge and Trail Improvements – West Fifth Avenue from McKinley Avenue to Dublin Road Contract. The budget is \$500,000. The final, to be determined, amount of the contract shall be funded by 2011 Bonds Funds and Recreation and Parks.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Department of Public Service, Division of Planning and Operations and Department of Recreation and Parks additional resources to complete preliminary and final engineering for a wider Fifth Avenue bridge over the Scioto River and an extension of the Scioto Trail between Dublin Road and McKinley Avenue. In addition to the above improvements, incidental or complete street improvements will be required or considered. These include the following: pavement, curb and gutter, curb ramps, sidewalk, street lighting, street trees, public and private utility work as needed, and stormwater improvements. This is a joint project between the Department of Public Service and the Department of Recreation and Parks that will receive FY2014 construction funding from ODOT Municipal Bridge Program and MORPC Transportation Enhancements.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from December 22, 2011, to January 26, 2012. The city received six (6) responses. A proposal from Jones-Stuckey, Ltd. was deemed non-responsive due to their not meeting all required ODOT pre-qualification categories.

The remaining proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on February 13, 2012. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY % OTHER
<b>Glaus, Pyle, Schomer, Burns &amp; Dehaven, Inc. (GPD Group)</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>341134715</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>75.0%</b>	<b>79.0% MAJ 21.0% OTH</b>
Resource Int., Inc.	FBE	310669793	YES	19.0%	
MSI/KKG	MAJ	453413259	YES	2.0%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Ltd.	FBE	311612308	YES	1.0%	
Strategic Environmental & Ecological Services	MAJ	311735334	YES	1.0%	
Ohio Valley Archaeology, Inc.	ASN	202023164	NO	1.0%	
Burgess & Niple	MAJ	310885550	YES	1.0%	
<b>Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.</b>	<b>PHC</b>	<b>111531569</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>60.0%</b>	<b>14.0% MAJ 86.0% OTH</b>
Advanced Engineering Consultants, Ltd.	FBE	311612308	YES	5.0%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	YES	5.0%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	AS1	310680767	YES	8.0%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	311153141	YES	8.0%	
Korda/Nemeth Engineering, Inc.	MAJ	310922991	YES	14.0%	
<b>Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>112167170</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>90.0%</b>	<b>95.0% MAJ 5.0% OTH</b>
ASC Group, Inc.	MAJ	311167506	YES	5.0%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	YES	5.0%	
<b>E.L. Robinson Engineering of Ohio Co.</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>311725058</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>65.0%</b>	<b>90.5% MAJ 9.5% OTH</b>
Stilson Consulting Group, LLC	MAJ	311702689	YES	25.0%	
DHDC, Inc.	MBE	311227692	YES	5.0%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	311153141	YES	4.5%	

Burton Planning Services, LLC	MAJ	263803465	YES	0.5%	
<b>Columbus Engineering Consultants</b>	<b>AS1</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>65.0%</b>	<b>95.0% MAJ 5.0% OTH</b>
W.E. Stilson Consulting Group, LLC	MAJ	311702689	YES	20.0%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	AS1	310680767	YES	5.0%	
ASC Group, Inc.	MAJ	311167506	YES	10.0%	
MSI Design Group	MAJ	311310090	YES	"If required"	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included four (4) voting members from the Department of Public Service (Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman), one (1) voting member from the Department of Recreation and Parks (Brad Westall), a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

GPD Group received 89.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Parsons Brinkerhoff with 83.20 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the five evaluated proposals for your final selection.

GPD Group	89.00
Parsons Brinkerhoff	83.20
Stantec	79.00
E.L. Robinson	77.40
CEC	71.80

The Committee would like to submit GPD Group for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that GPD Group submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. GPD Group’s proposal demonstrated that they had done extensive homework on preliminary traffic and bridge analysis and maintenance of traffic.
2. GPD Group offered innovative and more detailed approaches to handling work in the Scioto River.
3. GPD noted the importance of the quality of the stream.
4. GPD Group offered one of the better discussions on public involvement.
5. GPD’s proposal included a good bikeway resume that is appropriate for this project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee’s recommendation, GPD Group
2. Reject the committee’s recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

**Alex Cofield**  
Capital Fiscal Manager  
City of Columbus  
Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services  
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557  
(f) 614-645-7549  
aacofield@columbus.gov