

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Tuesday, November 22, 2011 9:07 AM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: Re: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Creative Campus

I approve of the recommended consultant for award
Mark Kelsey sent from my blackberry

From: Cofield, Alex A.
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Sent: Fri Nov 18 10:42:52 2011
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Creative Campus

To: Mark Kelsey, Director

Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: November 18, 2011

Subject: Roadway Improvements – Creative Campus

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway Improvements – Creative Campus Contract. The budget is \$500,000. The final, to be negotiated dollar amount, shall be funded by 2011 Department of Development Bond Funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Planning and Operations, additional resources for the preparation of a Preliminary Engineering document to recommend roadway and streetscape improvements to N. Washington Avenue from E. Broad Street to E. Long Street, N. 9th Street from E. Broad Street to E. Long Street, and E. Gay Street from Cleveland Avenue to N. Washington Avenue in the area known as Creative Campus. The project may involve final engineering and construction plan preparation of the recommended improvements.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from October 5, 2011, to November 3, 2011. The city received three (3) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on November 17, 2011.

The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/

Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF
	WORK	% MAJORITY	% OTHER	

**DLZ OHIO, INC. ASN 311268980 Y 50% 30% Majority
70% Other**

TranSystems PHC 430839725 Y 20%
Kinzelman Kline

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 10%

Dynotec MBE 311319961 Y 20%

Columbus
Engineering

Consultants AS1 310716498 Y Unknown*

(Listed as sub for Dynotec)
Lawhon &

Associates FBE 311153141 Y TBD*

(Not provided in proposal)

**MS CONSULTANTS, INC. Majority 346546916 Y 50% 90% Majority
10% Other**

Resource

International FBE 310669793 Y 8%

Kinzelman Kline

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 35%

Policyworks, LLC MBE 300193496 Y 1%

Ralph & Curl

Engineers Majority 311067613 Y 5%

ASC Group FBE 311167506 Y 1%

**WD TRANSPORTATION Majority 311451869 Y 38% 93% Majority
7% Other**

URS Corporation Majority 340939859 Y 19%

CTL Engineering AS1 310680767 Y 3%

Columbus

Engineering

Consultants AS1 310716498 Y 4%

Kinzelman Kline

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 36%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

DLZ Ohio, Inc. Companies received 85.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was MS Consultants, Inc. with 83.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the three evaluated proposals for your final selection.

DLZ Ohio 85.33

MS Consultants 83.67

WD Transportation 78.00

The Committee would like to submit DLZ Ohio for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that DLZ Ohio submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. DLZ presented the best quality written proposal.
2. DLZ presented the most detailed and realistic schedule of 11 months.
3. DLZ's proposal talked about more of a pavement analysis on Cleveland Avenue and suggested two conceptual designs for each street.
4. DLZ had a strong project manager and good suggestions for public involvement.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, DLZ Ohio
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager

City of Columbus

Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services

109 N. Front St. Ground Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov