

From: [Kelsey, Mark](#)
To: [Cofield, Alex A.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Ludwig, Rachel D.](#); [Lundine, Mark A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Robinson, Valuise E.](#); [Steege, Jerry K.](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Intersection Improvements - Roberts Road at Spindler Rd.
Date: Friday, January 11, 2013 3:18:37 PM

I approve of the recommended consultant for selection

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Friday, January 11, 2013 1:25 PM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; Ludwig, Rachel D.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Intersection Improvements - Roberts Road at Spindler Rd.

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: January 11, 2013

Subject: Intersection Improvements – Roberts Road at Spindler Rd.

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Intersection Improvements – Roberts Road at Spindler Road Contract. The budget is \$450,000 funded by the 2012 CIB.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus preliminary and final engineering for improvements to the intersection of Roberts Road at Spindler Road. Design will proceed in two parts. The specific scope of work for Part 2 will be developed upon completion of Part 1. It is anticipated that the constructed project will install a traffic signal at the intersection of Roberts Road at Spindler Road and widen Roberts Road at this intersection to install a westbound left turn lane. Additional improvements will be determined upon completion of a traffic study of both the Roberts at Spindler intersection and the Roberts at Frazell intersection. Alternatives will be developed with considerations to complete street improvements and to the recently completed Franklin County Engineer and ODOT projects in the area. Part 1 will determine the major project elements. The remaining Preliminary Engineering and Final Engineering will be performed in Part 2.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from November 29, 2012, to December 20, 2012. The city received six (6) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on January 10, 2013. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/

Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY	% OTHER
HDR Engineering, Inc.	PHC 470680568	Y	70.00%	70.00%	PHC	30.00% OTH
Resource International	FBE 310669793	Y	15.00%			
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE 311167506	Y	5.00%			
Dynotec	AFA 311319961	Y	10.00%			
ADR & Associates, Ltd.	MAJ 311499809	Y	50.00%	60.00%	MAJ	40.00% OTH
Smart services, Inc.	Not on System 311456994	N	5.00%			
CEC, Inc.	AS1 310716498	Y	20.00%			
CTL Engineering	AS1 310680767	Y	5.00%			
Lawhon & Associates	FBE 311153141	Y	6.00%			
Advanced Engineering Cons.	ASN 311612308	Y	4.00%			
Traffic Engineering Services	MAJ 311178383	Y	10.00%			
OHM - Advisors	MAJ 381691323	Y	55.00%	80.00%	MAJ	20.00% OTH
Burgess & Niple	MAJ 310885550	Y	25.00%			
Lawhon & Associates	FBE 311153141	Y	10.00%			
Resource International	FBE 310669793	Y	10.00%			
Michael Baker Jr., Inc.	MAJ 251228638	N	60.00%	60.00%	MAJ	20.00% PHC 20.00% OTH
RW Armstrong	PHC 351062227	Y	20.00%			
Resource International	FBE 310669793	Y	8.00%			
XYZ Professional	AFA 043846618	Y	10.00%			
Advanced Engineering Cons.	ASN 311612308	Y	2.00%			
Patrick Engineering, Inc.	MAJ 363008281	Y	58.00%	93.00%	MAJ	7.00% OTH
EMH&T	MAJ 310685594	Y	35.00%			
DHDC Engineering	AS1 320376762	Y	7.00%			
W.E. Stilson	MAJ 311702689	Y	70.00%	70.00%	MAJ	30.00% OTH
DHDC Engineering	AS1 320376762	Y	5.00%			
Lawhon & Associates	FBE 311153141	Y	5.00%			

PRIME Engineering	ASN	311373357	Y	12.00%
MTJ Engineering, LLC	Not on System	NONE	N	8.00%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran, and Patti Austin. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Alex Cofield, Rachel Ludwig, and a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined.

HDR Engineering, Inc. received 89.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Michael Baker Jr., Inc. with 84.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the six evaluated proposals for your final selection.

HDR Engineering, Inc. 89.00

Michael Baker Jr., Inc. 84.33

OHM – Advisors 84.00

W.E. Stilson 83.00

ADR & Associates, Inc. 79.33

Patrick Engineering 77.33

The Committee would like to submit HDR Engineering, Inc. for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that HDR Engineering, Inc. submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. HDR Engineering has a good Project Manager and the team compliments each other well.
2. HDR Engineering has a good overall understanding of the project.
3. HDR Engineering gave a detailed description of their approach and provided solutions with layouts.
4. HDR Engineering mentioned a multi-modal approach describing bike and pedestrian use of the roadway
5. HDR Engineering demonstrated knowledge of the work site by conducting a site visit and preliminary traffic counts.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying

to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, HDR Engineering, Inc.
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager

City of Columbus

Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services

109 N. Front St. Ground Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov