

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|----------------------|--------------------------|----------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| Department: | Public Utilities | CIP Number: | 690474 Part 2 | | | |
| Division: | (Power &) WATER | Project Name: | Morse Rd. 36" Water Main | | | |
| | | Funding Source: | Voted Water | | | |
| | | Bid Opening Date: | 9/24/08 | | | |
| Low Bid at Opening: | \$2,463,327.90 | Engineer's Estimate: | \$3,889,349.20 | | | |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: | \$2,690,327.64 | | | | | |
| | COMPANY NAME | | | | | |
| | John Eramo & Sons | Stover & Turner | Elite Excavating Co. | Igel & Co. | Nickolas Savko & Sons | Trucco Construction |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$2,463,327.90 | \$2,498,830.13 | \$2,690,327.64 | \$2,735,700.00 | \$2,885,631.32 | \$2,939,273.65 |
| Local Company? | yes | yes | no | yes | yes | no |
| FACTORS | | | | | | |
| Tier I - Mandatory Factors | | | | | | |
| M-1 | Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | no | no |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit) | | | | | | |
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | yes | no | yes | yes |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | yes | no | yes | yes |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | yes | no | no | yes | yes |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of insurance provided by company | 80.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 60.00% | 75.00% |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company | 100.00% | 4.00% | 4.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| C-6 | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference | yes | no | yes | yes | yes |
| | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) | 10.00% | 4.00% | 7.00% | 10.00% | 8.00% |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | \$120,000.00 | \$80,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$120,000.00 | \$80,000.00 |
| | Bid Total: | \$2,343,327.90 | \$2,418,830.13 | \$2,630,327.64 | \$2,615,700.00 | \$2,859,273.65 |
| | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits | \$2,343,327.90 | | | | |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | 0.000% | 3.222% | 12.248% | 11.623% | 18.022% |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | yes | no | no | no |
| | Proceed to Tier III? | yes | yes | no | no | no |
| Tier III - History Experience Factors | | | | | | |
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-6 | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | | | | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | no | no |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | no | no |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-8 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) | no | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-9 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | no | no | no |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | -1 | -1 | 0 | -1 |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | | | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) | | | | | | |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | | | | |
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Division's Recommendation: | | | | | | |

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Sewerage and Drainage

CIP Number: 610744
Project Name: Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp
Funding Source: Storm Sewer Bond Fund
Bid Opening Date: 08/31/2005
Engineer's Estimate: 1,998,675.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 554,187.00
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 883,207.20

| Original Bid Amount: Local Company? | COMPANY NAME | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|
| | <u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u> | <u>Double Z Constr Co.</u> | <u>Complete General</u> | <u>Nickolas Savko</u> | <u>Trucco Construction</u> |
| \$ 554,187.00 | \$ 671,967.00 | \$ 677,561.40 | \$ 869,980.56 | \$ 883,207.20 | \$ 671,967.00 |
| Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes |
| | | | | | \$ 671,967.00 |
| | | | | | Yes |
| | | | | | \$ 671,967.00 |
| | | | | | Yes |
| | | | | | \$ 671,967.00 |
| | | | | | Yes |

FACTORS

Tier I - Mandatory Factors

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| M-1 | Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |

Proceed to Tier II?

Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | yes | yes | yes | no | no | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | no | no | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of insurance provided by company | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 60.00% | 75.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company | 3.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 50.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% |
| C-6 | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference | no | yes | no | yes | no | no | no | no | no |
| | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) | 5.00% | 10.00% | 5.00% | 9.00% | 3.00% | 5.00% | 5.00% | 5.00% | 5.00% |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | 31,000 | 51,000 | 31,000 | 45,458 | 16,626 | 31,000 | 31,000 | 31,000 | 31,000 |
| | Bid Total: | 523,187.45 | 620,967.45 | 646,561.85 | 824,522.88 | 866,581.59 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 |

Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits

\$ 523,187.45

Percent Over Low Bid:

0.000%

18.689%

23.581%

57.596%

65.635%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

22.512%

Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)

Proceed to Tier III?

Tier III - History Experience Factors

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------|---|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-6 | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | | | | | | | | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-8 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-9 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | no |

Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Division's Recommendation: Storts Excavation, Inc.