

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities

CIP Number:

Division: Water

Project Name:

Funding Source:

Bid Opening Date:

Engineer's Estimate

Lowest Bidder: \$32,430,000.00

	<b>Kokosing</b>	<b>Shook Walbridge JV</b>	<b>Kenmore</b>
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$32,430,000.00	\$33,039,500.00	\$33,489,150.00

<b>FACTORS</b>				
<b><u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 2-3) &amp; Form 1 - Contract Compliance</u></b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
<b><u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u></b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</u></b>				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation E	yes	yes	no
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u></b>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> )	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 5 - Debarment</u></b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u></b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	12.8%	60.0%	80.0%
<b><u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u></b>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	see comment	100%-ER
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	see comment	100%-ER
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u></b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

		Kokosing	Shook Walbridge JV	Kenmore
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$32,430,000.00	\$33,039,500.00	\$33,489,150.00
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comments	see comments
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	see comment	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	see comment	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW# not given	see comment	SW0230, P1879
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		0	0	0
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>		\$32,430,000.00		
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		0%	2%	3%
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>		yes	yes	yes
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 23) - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	see comment	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	1.88%	3.27%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$609,500.00	\$1,059,150.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	n/a	no	no
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. 24-27) - Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		0	0	0
<b>Proposal (Pg. 9) - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Proposal (Pg. 10) - Proposal Signature</b>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		0	0	0
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 28) - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		0	0	0
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>		-1	-1	-2
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		KOKOSING CONST		

<b>Department:</b>	<u>690428-10003</u>		
<b>Division:</b>	<u>DRWP Treatment Capacity Increase - Filter Building Rehab / I&amp;C Backbone</u>		
	<u>Water Bonds</u>		
	<u>1/23/13</u>		
<b>Lowest Bidder:</b>	<u>\$40,488,625.00</u>		
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	<u>Danis</u>	<u>Building Crafts</u>	<u>Adams Robinson</u>
	\$34,413,750.00	\$35,731,188.85	\$37,010,450.00

<b>FACTORS</b>				
<b><u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 2-3) &amp; Form 1 - Contract Compliance</u></b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	see comment	no	yes
<b><u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u></b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regs</u></b>				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation E	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u></b>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> )	no	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b><u>Form 5 - Debarment</u></b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u></b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	8.4%	70.0%	50.0%
<b><u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u></b>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	60% / 40%	89% / 11%	70% / 30%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	401k Profit Sharing	"variable"	35% / 65%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b><u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u></b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	yes	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>

		Danis	Building Crafts	Adams Robinson
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$34,413,750.00	\$35,731,188.85	\$37,010,450.00
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	see comment	"Not applicable"	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comments	see comments
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	see comment	(blank)	SW0329
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar Amount</b>				
<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>		<b>6%</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>14%</b>
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>		<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 23) - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	see comment
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	6.12%	10.18%	14.12%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$1,983,750.00	\$3,301,188.85	\$4,580,450.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. 24-27) - Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Proposal (Pg. 9) - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Proposal (Pg. 10) - Proposal Signature</b>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 28) - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Coverage (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>-4</b>	<b>-2</b>
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		RUCTION CO., INC.		