

**BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department:	<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	<u>690291-100001</u>
Division:	<u>Water</u>	Project Name:	<u>PAWP Fiber Optics Installation</u>
		Funding Source:	<u>Water Bonds</u>
		Bid Opening Date:	<u>3/5/14</u>
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$315,653.94</u>	Engineer's Estimate	<u>\$632,000.00</u>

Vendor Name:	<u>Gudenauf</u>	<u>Fishe</u>	<u>Thaver</u>	<u>Jess Howard</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	<u>\$315,653.94</u>	<u>\$387,273.14</u>	<u>\$409,132.05</u>	<u>\$504,941.99</u>

<b>FACTORS</b>					
<i>(Pgs. 8-9) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 20) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	no
<i>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations</b>					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EM	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<i>Form 5 - Debarment</i>	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<i>Form 6 - Local Workforce</i>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	5.6%	8.9%	40.0%	95.0%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>				
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 70% / EE: 30%	ER: 20% / EE: 80%	ER: 100%	ER: 68% / EE: 32%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	EE: 100%	see comment	ER: 4%	ER: 3% / EE: 3%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<i>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</i>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no	no	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	(blank)	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	(blank)	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects	yes	yes	see comment	see comment
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>					

Vendor Name:		Gudenkauf	Fishel	Thaver	Jess Howard
Bid Tab Amount:		\$315,653.94	\$387,273.14	\$409,132.05	\$504,941.99
Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requi		no	no	no	no
License and/or Certificate No:		no City license # listed	no City license # listed	no City license # listed	E00045, G00220
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		\$315,653.94			
Percent Over Low Bid:		0%	23%	30%	60%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	no	no	no
<b>Pg. 38 - Environmental Preference</b>					
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		0.00%	22.69%	29.61%	59.97%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		\$0.00	\$71,619.19	\$93,478.11	\$189,288.05
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		no	no	no	no
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?			n/a		
<b>Pgs. 39-42 - Statements and Affidavits</b>					
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		yes	yes	no	yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		yes	yes	no	yes
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized		yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	-2	0
<b>Pg. 46 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>					
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Proposal (Pg. 47) - Proposal Signature</b>					
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
<b>Pg. 48 - Proposal Bond</b>					
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Co		yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:		-1	-3	-2	-1
Division's Recommendation:		Gudenkauf Corporation			
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.</b>					
1) Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
2) Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
3) Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
4) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)		yes	yes	no	yes
5) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
6) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
7) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1	0