

From: [Davies, Tracie R.](#)
To: [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Gallagher, Jennifer L.](#); [Bauman, Max A.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#); [Stargell, Reynaldo A.](#); [Wasosky, Steven S.](#); [Hines, Jud M.](#); [Lorenz, Matthew L.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION -- Arterial Street Rehabilitation - Hamilton Road Phase B (S Curve) project
Date: Friday, May 29, 2015 3:24:50 PM

Tom, I approve the committee's recommendation, Stantec.

Thanks,

Tracie

From: Crawford, Thomas L.

Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2015 1:09 PM

To: Davies, Tracie R.

Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Cofield, Alex A.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Mackey, David B.; Moran, Alan P.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Bauman, Max A.; Sexton, Michael E.; Stargell, Reynaldo A.; Wasosky, Steven S.; Hines, Jud M.; Lorenz, Matthew L.

Subject: RECOMMENDATION -- Arterial Street Rehabilitation - Hamilton Road Phase B (S Curve) project

To: Tracie Davies, Director

Department of Public Service

From: Tom Crawford

Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: May 28, 2015

Subject: Arterial Street Rehabilitation – Hamilton Road Phase B (S Curve)

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Arterial Street Rehabilitation – Hamilton Road Phase B (S Curve) project. The recommendation is to award Stantec, the consultant that was scored the highest by the selection committee. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommended consultant or approving another consultant. If you approve another

consultant please provide an explanation.

TC

This project includes completion of final engineering for Phase B of improvements to the N. Hamilton Road corridor from Morse Road to SR-161 and intersecting arterial roadways, Morse Road and Dublin-Granville Road, to increase vehicular capacity, extend bikeway facilities, and complete gaps in the pedestrian system.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from April 30, 2015, to May 21, 2015. The city received ten (10) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on May 28, 2015. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT

Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract	Compliance	Number	
Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ.			
% OTH.					
GANNETT FLEMING ENGINEERS AND ARCHITECTS, P.C.	MAJ	23-2935505	Y	75%	
80% MAJ 20% OTH					
Resource International Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	20%	
American Structurepoint Inc.	MAJ	35-1127317	Y	5%	
EVANS MECHWART HAMBLETON & TILTON INC. (EMH&T)	MAJ	31-0685594	Y		
80% 90% MAJ 10% OTH					
Carpenter Marty Transportation Inc.	MAJ	46-0918246	Y	10%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	MBE	32-0376762	Y	5%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	5%	
AMERICAN STRUCTUREPOINT INC.	MAJ	35-1127317	Y	58%	80% MAJ 20%
OTH					
OHM Advisors	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	20%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	MBE	31-0718498	Y	18%	
GPD Group	MAJ	34-1134715	N	2%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	2%	
DLZ OHIO INC.	MBE	31-1268980	Y	70%	2% MAJ 98% OTH
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	2%	
CAD Concepts, Inc. dba CCI Engineering	FBE	31-1390280	Y	7%	
Resource International Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	9%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	4%	
Chester Engineers (Ohio), Inc.	MBE	20-2401674	Y	6%	
E.P. Ferris & Associates, Inc.	MAJ	31-1194974	Y	2%	
AECOM TECHNICAL SERVICES, INC.	MAJ	95-2661922	Y	60%	64% MAJ

16% OTH 20% PHC

HDR Engineering Inc.	PHC	47-0680568	Y	20%	
Resource International Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	2%	
Lanham Engineering, LLC	FBE	46-1240018	Y	2%	
MKSK	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	2%	
S&ME, Inc.	MAJ	56-0791580	Y	2%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	2%	
HDR ENGINEERING INC.	PHC	47-0680568	Y	60%	17% MAJ

23% OTH 60% PHC

AECOM Technical Services, Inc.	MAJ	95-2661922	Y	15%	
TERRADON Corporation	FBE	55-0687626	Y	14%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	1%	
CW Design Group, LLC	MAJ	06-1648088	Y	2%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	MBE	31-0680767	Y	4%	
Smart Services, Inc.	FBE	31-1456994	Y	2%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants, Inc.	MBE	31-0718498	Y	2%	
STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.	MAJ	11-2167170	Y	51%	75% MAJ

15% OTH 10% PHC

E.L. Robinson Engineering of Ohio	MAJ	31-1725058	Y	23%	
TranSystems Corporation	PHC	43-0839859	Y	10%	
DHDC Engineering Consulting Services	MBE	32-0376762	Y	5%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	5%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5%	
E.P. Ferris & Associates, Inc.	MAJ	31-1194974	Y	1%	
OHM ADVISORS	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	55%	80% MAJ

20% OTH

American Structurepoint Inc.	MAJ	35-1127317	Y	20%	
Resource International Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	12%	
Eggeman Engineering & Consulting, LLC	MAJ	26-0002226	Y	5%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	5%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	3%	
IBI GROUP	MAJ	31-1442777	Y	63%	65% MAJ

35% OTH

PRIME AE Group, Inc.	MBE	26-0546656	Y	25%
DLZ Ohio Inc.	MBE	31-1268980	Y	8%
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	2%
Surveying and Mapping, LLC	MAJ	74-2704974	Y	2%

CRAWFORD, MURPHY & TILLY, INC.	MAJ	37-0844662	Y	51%	79% MAJ 21%
OTH					
AECOM Technical Services, Inc.	MAJ	95-2661922	Y	20%	
Resource International Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
Advanced Engineering Consultants	FBE	31-1612308	Y	5%	
Patrick Engineering Inc.	MAJ	36-3008281	Y	5%	
Carpenter Marty Transportation Inc.	MAJ	46-0918246	Y	3%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	3%	
Edsall & Associates LLC	FBE	31-1022019	Y	3%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service: Reynaldo Stargall, Hassan Zahran, and James Young. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer and Duane Parks, a representative from EBOCO.

Stantec received 90.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firms were American Structurepoint and EMH&T, each with 87.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the 10 evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Stantec	90.00
American Structurepoint	87.33
EMH&T	87.33
Gannett Fleming	85.33
OHM Advisors	85.33
DLZ Ohio	83.00
AECOM Technical Services	82.33
HDR Engineering	82.33
Crawford, Murphy & Tilly	80.00
IBI Group	79.67

The Committee would like to submit Stantec for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Stantec submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Stantec put together a very strong team, including three major firms that can deliver

this project within the time allotted.

2. Their proposed team will be led by a strong project manager and co-project manager with expertise in drainage and BMPs.
3. Stantec mentioned utilizing "over-the-shoulder" review to expedite the completion of this project.
4. Stantec also prepared a very detailed schedule showing how they will deliver this project and promised to deliver final plans within 7 months.
5. Stantec proposed an innovative plan for right-of-way acquisition that has never been attempted by the City.

Per City Code 329, please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Stantec
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Tom Crawford

Fiscal Manager

<< OLE Object: Picture (Device Independent Bitmap) >>

50 W. Gay Street, 5th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Direct: 614.645.1687

Fax: 614.645.7549

www.columbus.gov