			BID EVALUATION FOR R CONTRACTS OVER \$				
	Department:	Public Utilities	CONTRACTS OVER \$	320,000)	CIP Number:	690236	
Division:		Water			Project Name: Funding Source:	Johnstown Rd. Area WL Imp's Water Bonds	
Lo	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,296,930.08			Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate:	10/23/13 \$2,127,500.00	
	<u>Vendor Name:</u> Bid Tab Amount:	<u>Darby Creek</u> \$2,296,930.08	<b>John Eramo</b> \$2,379,531.64	Kenmore \$2,393,785.95 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.	<u>Double Z</u> \$2,415,697.76	Complete General \$2,539,790.19 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.	Shelly & Sands \$2,599,648.60 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.
	<u>FACTORS</u>						
(Pgs. 8-9) & Form 1 (Pg. 34) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)  Negative Factors:	no 0	no 0	no 0	no 0	no	
	regauve ractors.	U	0	U	U	v	
Form 3 - Con Regulations:	npliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &						
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):						
	Fair Labor Standards Act     Prevailing Wage Laws	no no	no vec	no no	no no	no no	I
	Prevaining wage Laws     Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	yes no	no	no	no	I
	Workers' Compensation Laws     Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any	no	no	no	no	no	I
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	1
	(E.F.Y)  6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation  EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yı
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	y
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	0	0	,
Form 4 - Stat	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:						
	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	no	yes	no	y
	Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current		,		7		,
	OSHA standards (Y/N)  3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	y y
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)	•	-	-	•		-
	(Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	у
	years (Y/N) Negative Factors:	no 0	no -1	0	no -1	0	I
<u>Form 5 - </u>	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years						
<u>Debarment</u>	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	no 0	0	0	no 0	0	I
	<u> </u>						
Local Workforce	What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties     Negative Factors:	100.0%	82.0%	80.0%	35.0%	59.0%	50.0
F 7 W							
<u>r orm 7 - Hea</u>	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	V
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER-58% - EE-42%	ER: 80% - 20%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100
	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)      If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes "varies"	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 100%	ER: 100
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0		ER. 100
Form 8 - Apprenticeship							
Programs	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)     Negative Factors:	yes 0	no -1	yes 0	yes 0	yes	У
			-1	0			
Form 9 - Exp	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	y
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project						
Form 10 - Ex	(Y/N)  perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED  (X/N)	yes	yes	yes	(blank)	yes	у
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes yes	"TBD" yes	yes yes	yes yes	yes "none"	y y
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	see comment	see comment	see comment	see comme
Form 12 - Av	ailability  Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	у
Form 13 - Tre	ade Licenses and Certificates	•		-	•		-
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N) Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	У
	requirements (Y/N) License and/or Certificate No:	no SW0075		no SW0230	yes no City license # listed	no SW0018	SW0059, G54
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0 0	0	0	5 11 0035, 034
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,296,930.08					
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.00%	3.60%	4.22%	5.17%	10.57%	13.189

## ORD# 2589-2013

Pg. 52 - Environm Does book Diffe bidd Diffe bidd Diffe bidd Does 'Yes lowe If aw Mus Pgs. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Affidavit (Y/N)	es bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid k? (Y/N)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable det (%)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable det (\$)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable det (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark se bidder versus lowest environmentally preference did.  warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita seser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	\$2,296,930.08  yes  no  0.00%  \$0.00  no  n/a  yes  yes  yes  yes	\$2,379,531.64  yes  did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k  3.60%  \$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated	\$2,393,785.95  yes  did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k  4.22%  \$96,855.87  no  n/a	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 5.17% \$118,767.68  no	\$2,539,790.19  no  did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k  10.57%  \$242,860.11	\$2,599,648.60  no  did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k  13.18%  \$302,718.52
Pg. 52 - Environm Does book Diffe bidd Diffe bidd Does Yes lowe If aw Mus  Pgs. 53-56 - Staten Statement 1: Bide Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Prop Affidavit  Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemt Proposal	tental Preference es bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid k? (Y/N)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (%) ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (S) es bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) poscal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	no 0.00% \$0.00  no n/a  yes yes yes yes	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 3.60% \$82,601.56  no n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 4.22% \$96,855.87	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 5.17% \$118,767.68  no	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 10.57% \$242,860.11	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k 13.18% \$302,718.52
Does book Diffic bidd Diffic bidd Does 'Yes lowe If aw Mus Mus Pgs. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Nor Statement 3: Affidavit Pgs. 56 - Addenda Ackniemt Yroposal	es bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid k? (Y/N)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (%)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-environmentally preferred bid.  warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	0.00% \$0.00  no  n/a  yes yes yes yes	within 5% or \$20k  3.60%  \$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	within 5% or \$20k 4,22% \$96,855.87  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 5.17% \$118,767.68  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 10.57% \$242,860.11	within 5% or \$20k 13.18% \$302,718.52
Does book Diffic bidd Diffic bidd Does 'Yes lowe If aw Mus  Pgs. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Nor Statement 3: Affidavit  Pgs. 56 - Addenda Acknlemt (Y/N Proposal	es bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid k? (Y/N)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (%)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-environmentally preferred bid.  warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	0.00% \$0.00  no  n/a  yes yes yes yes	within 5% or \$20k  3.60%  \$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	within 5% or \$20k 4,22% \$96,855.87  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 5.17% \$118,767.68  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 10.57% \$242,860.11	within 5% or \$20k 13.18% \$302,718.52
book Difft bidd Difft bidd Does "Yes lowe If aw Mus  Pgs. 53-56 - Staten Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affia Prop Affidavit  Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemt, (Y/N Proposal	k? (Y/N)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (%)  der (%)  der (%)  se bidder receive environmental preferrable der (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark se' if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-environmentally preferred bid.  warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  poscal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	0.00% \$0.00  no  n/a  yes yes yes yes	within 5% or \$20k  3.60%  \$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	within 5% or \$20k 4,22% \$96,855.87  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 5.17% \$118,767.68  no n/a	within 5% or \$20k 10.57% \$242,860.11	within 5% or \$20k 13.18% \$302,718.52
Diffic bidd Diffic bidd Diffic bidd Diffic bidd Doe: Yes lowe If aw Mus Fgs. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Nofic Statement 2: Nofic Statement 3: Affidavit Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemi, Proposal	ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (%) ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$) es bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) poscal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	0.00% \$0.00  no  n/a  yes yes yes yes	3.60% \$82,601.56  no n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	4.22% \$96,855.87 no n/a	5.17% \$118,767.68 no n/a	10.57% \$242,860.11	13.18% \$302,718.52
bidd Diffication Does "Yes lowe If aw Mus  Pes. 53-56 - Statem Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Affidavit  Peg. 56 - Addenda Adkniemi Proposal	der (%)  ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	\$0.00  no  n/a  yes  yes  yes  yes	\$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	\$96,855.87 no n/a	\$118,767.68 no n/a	\$242,860.11	\$302,718.52
Difficition bidd Does "Yes lowe If aw Mus Pgs. 53-56 - Staten Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Afficition Prop Affidavit Pg. 56 - Addenda Acknight, Proposal	ference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable der (\$) set idder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark so bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark so bidder receive environmental preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	\$0.00  no  n/a  yes  yes  yes  yes	\$82,601.56  no  n/a  yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	\$96,855.87 no n/a	\$118,767.68 no n/a	\$242,860.11	\$302,718.52
bidd Does "Yes lowe If aw Mus  Pgs. 53-56 - Staten Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affia Prop Affidavit  Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemt, Proposal	der (\$)  se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark se' if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-environmentally preferred bid.  warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized  N)	no n/a yes yes yes	no n/a yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	no n/a	no n/a	no	no
Pes. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affidavit  Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackulemi, Proposal	se bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark se" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	no n/a yes yes yes	no n/a yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	no n/a	no n/a	no	no
Yes   low	s" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	n/a yes yes yes yes	yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	n/a	n/a		no n/a
Iowe   If aw   Mus	est non-envionmentally preferred bid. warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	n/a yes yes yes yes	yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	n/a	n/a		no n/a
If aw Mus	warded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita sser been notified?  ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	n/a yes yes yes yes	yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	n/a	n/a		no n/a
Mus   Pgs. 53-56 - Statem   Statement 1: Bidd   Statement 2: Non   Statement 3: Afficiavit   Prop. 56 - Addenda   Ackulemi,   Proposal   Ackulemi,   Proposal   Pro	ments and Affidavits der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes yes	yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	yes	yes	n/a	n/a
Pgs. 53-56 - Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Prop Affidavit (Y/N Pg. 56 - Addenda Acknigant, (Y/N	ments and Affidavits  der is current on City income taxes (Y/N)  n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)  ant Signature has been completed (Y/N)  posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized  N)	yes yes yes	yes; but not dated yes; but not dated	yes	yes	n/a	n/a
Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Prop Affidavit (Y/N Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemi. (Y/N Proposal	der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes	yes; but not dated				
Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Prop Affidavit (Y/N Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackniemi. (Y/N Proposal	der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes	yes; but not dated				
Statement 1: Bidd Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affic Prop Affidavit (Y/N Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackallemi, (Y/N Proposal	der is current on City income taxes (Y/N) n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes	yes; but not dated				
Statement 2: Non Statement 3: Affice Prop Affidavit  Pg. 56 - Addenda Acknignt. Proposal	n-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N) ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes	yes; but not dated			yes	yes
Statement 3: Affia Prop Affidavit (Y/N Pg. 56 - Addenda Acknigmt. (Y/N Proposal	ant Signature has been completed (Y/N) posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes yes			yes	yes	yes
Prop Affidavit (Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N Y/N	posal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized N)	yes		yes	yes	yes	yes
Pg. 56 - Addenda Bidd Acknlgmt. (Y/N							
Pg. 56 - Addenda Bidd Acknlgmt. (Y/N	Negative Factors:		yes	ves	ves	ves	ves
Addenda Bidd Acknlgmt. (Y/N Proposal		0	0	0		0	0
Addenda Bidd Acknlgmt. (Y/N Proposal							
Addenda Bidd Acknlgmt. (Y/N Proposal							
Proposal	der has acknowledged any addendums issued on project					į	
	N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
(Pa 65)							
						į	
Proposal							
Signature Bidd	der has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pg. 66 - Proposal I							
	der has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name					į	
(Y/N		yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	der has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	der has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	der has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of						
Com	mpliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-3	-1	-1	0	-2
	Division's Recommendation:			Darby Creek I	Excavating, Inc.		
I							
	ation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section	102.08, not covered abo	ove in RED.				
	s the bidder submitted more than one proposal under						
	same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
Doe:	es the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not						
	vided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	es the proposal respond to the bid documents in all	_		????; no notarized		????; no notarized	????; no notarized
mat	terial respects, and does not contain irregularities or			statement of HDD		statement of HDD	statement of HDD
	iations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	experience.	yes	experience.	experience.
Did	the bidder add any provision reserving the right to	•	· ·				
	ept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract						
	n listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	nc
6) item	the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where	110	110	110			
		no	no	no	no	no	n.c
Did	uired? (Y/N)			0			• 110

2

4969efa3-2e79-4531-8c58-9f5454dd69cb.xlsx