

**BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Water

CIP Number: 690236-100045
Project Name: Johnstown Rd. Area WL Imp's
Funding Source: Water Bonds
Bid Opening Date: 10/23/13
Engineer's Estimate: \$2,127,500.00

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,296,930.08

Vendor Name:	Darby Creek	John Eramo	Kenmore	Double Z	Complete General	Shelly & Sands
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,296,930.08	\$2,379,531.64	\$2,393,785.95 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.	\$2,415,697.76	\$2,539,790.19 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.	\$2,599,648.60 ***Didn't submit notarized statement of HDD experience.

FACTORS		Darby Creek	John Eramo	Kenmore	Double Z	Complete General	Shelly & Sands
<i>(Pgs. 8-9) & Form 1 (Pg. 34) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
<i>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	-1
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:							
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):						
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	yes	no	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:							
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	no	yes	no	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	-1	0	-1
Form 5 - Debarment							
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce							
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%	82.0%	80.0%	35.0%	59.0%	50.0%
	Negative Factors:						
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs							
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER-58% - EE-42%	ER: 80% - 20%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	"varies"	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs							
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0	0	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED							
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	(blank)	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED							
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	"TBD"	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	"none"	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control							
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	see comment	see comment	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability							
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates							
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no	yes	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0075	SW0004	SW0230	no City license # listed	SW0018	SW0059, G5463
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,296,930.08					
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.00%	3.60%	4.22%	5.17%	10.57%	13.18%

Vendor Name:	Darby Creek	John Eramo	Kenmore	Double Z	Complete General	Shelly & Sands
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,296,930.08	\$2,379,531.64	\$2,393,785.95	\$2,415,697.76	\$2,539,790.19	\$2,599,648.60
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no
Pg. 52 - Environmental Preference						
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k	did not evaluate since not within 5% or \$20k
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	0.00%	3.60%	4.22%	5.17%	10.57%	13.18%
Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$82,601.56	\$96,855.87	\$118,767.68	\$242,860.11	\$302,718.52
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no	no	no	no
If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Pgs. 53-56 - Statements and Affidavits						
Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes; but not dated	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes; but not dated	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes; but not dated	yes	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pg. 56 - Addenda Ackntent.						
Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Proposal (Pg. 65) - Proposal Signature						
Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pg. 66 - Proposal Bond						
Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-3	-1	-1	0	-2
Division's Recommendation:	Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.					
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.						
1) Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
2) Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
3) Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
4) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	????; no notarized statement of HDD experience.	yes	????; no notarized statement of HDD experience.	????; no notarized statement of HDD experience.
5) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
6) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
7) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0