

ORD#

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)				
Department:	Public Utilities	CIP Number:	690500-100000	
Division:	Water	Project Name:	HCWP Roof Restoration	
		Funding Source:	Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds Fund & Water Permanent Improvements Fund	
Lowest Bidder:	\$63,224.00	Bid Opening Date:	8/22/12	
Non-Local Lowest Bidder:	\$73,025.00	Engineer's Estimate:	\$54,625.00	
	Re-Construction Industries	Kalkreuth Roofing & Sheet Metal, Inc.		
Bid Tab Amount:	\$64,224.00	\$73,025.00		
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	Yes	No		
FACTORS				
Tier I - Mandatory Factors				
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	no	yes	
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	yes	yes	
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	yes	yes	
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	no	no	
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	yes	
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes	
	Proceed to Tier II?	no	yes	
Tier II - Creditable Factors				
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification)	yes	no	
	If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-			
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation that meets guidelines in bid book, bid must not exceed 5% of the			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	no	Yes	
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	NA	
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	NA	
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	
	Total Local Credit	NA	FALSE	
	Dollar Value of Credits	NA	\$0.00	
	Evaluated Bid Total:	NA	\$73,025.00	
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$0.00	\$73,025.00	
	Percent Over Low Bid:	#VALUE!	#DIV/0!	
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credit)	#VALUE!	#DIV/0!	
	Proceed to Tier III?	#VALUE!	#DIV/0!	
Tier III - Employer & History Factors				
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	yes	yes	
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	yes	
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes	
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	no	yes	
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion.	no	no	
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following	no	no	
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	
	D. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	N/A	yes	
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	N/A	yes	
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-2	-1	
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.			
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes	
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes	
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)				
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).				
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., eqpt.)	yes	yes	
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	
R-3	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	
Division's Recommendation:				