

Steege, Jerry K.

From: Kelsey, Mark
Sent: Thursday, April 12, 2012 2:59 PM
To: Cofield, Alex A.
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Popa, Nicholas J.
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Sidewalk Design and Crosswalk Improvements

[I approve of the recommended consultant for award](#)

From: Cofield, Alex A.
Sent: Thursday, April 12, 2012 10:10 AM
To: Kelsey, Mark
Cc: Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Popa, Nicholas J.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Sidewalk Design and Crosswalk Improvements

To: Mark Kelsey, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: April 11, 2012

Subject: Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Sidewalk Design and Crosswalk Improvements

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Sidewalk Design and Crosswalk Improvements project. The budget is \$439,000; amount of the contract shall be \$439,000 funded by 2012 Bonds Funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Mobility Options, additional resources to produce preliminary engineering documents and construction drawings for new sidewalk construction and crosswalk improvements projects, including Godown Road from Francisco Road to Bethel Road and Waggoner Road from Broad Street to Chapel Stone Road. The improvements to Godown Road shall include sidewalk construction on both sides and curb ramps. The improvements to Waggoner Road shall include new sidewalk on both sides or shared use path construction on one side, including curb ramps. The consultant shall also produce construction drawings for crosswalk improvement projects and spot improvements. Examples of work may include raised crosswalks, curb ramps, sidewalk, curb extensions, pedestrian refuge islands, street lighting, basic signal design, pavement marking and signing and drainage improvements.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from March 8, 2012, to April 5, 2012. The city received eight (8) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on April 11, 2012. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY % OTHER
Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	MAJ	112167170	Y	80.00%	80.0 Maj. 20.0% Other
Resource International, Inc.	ASN	310669793	Y	17.00%	
Triple –e Strategies	FBE	261946578	Y	3.00%	
EMH&T	MAJ	310685594	Y	65.00%	65.0% Maj. 35.0% Other
Prime Engineering	ASN	311373357	Y	25.00%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	310680767	Y	10.00%	
Crawford Murphy & Tilley	MAJ	370844662	Y	75.00%	75.0% Maj. 25.0% Other
Resource International, Inc.	ASN	310669793	Y	20.00%	
Edsall & Associates	FBE	311022019	Y	5.00%	
Parsons Brinckerhoff	PHC	111531569	Y	90.00%	90.0% Maj. 10.0% Other
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	310680767	Y	5.00%	
Canter Surveying	FBE	300161572	Y	5.00%	
Strand Associates	MAJ	391020418	Y	65.00%	65.0% Maj. 35.0% Other
Resource International, Inc.	ASN	310669793	Y	35.00%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	ASN	310716498	Y	64.00%	8.0% Maj. 92.0% Other
Traffic Engineering Services, Inc.	AFA	311178383	N	10.00%	
Ralph and Curl, Engineers	MAJ	311067613	Y	8.00%	
Edsall & Associates	FBE	311022019	Y	8.00%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	ASN	310680767	Y	5.00%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	311167506	Y	5.00%	

Jones Stuckey	MAJ	310723296	Y	72.00%	80.0% Maj. 20.0% Other
W.E. Stilson Consulting Group	MAJ	311702689	Y	8.00%	
Resource International, Inc.	ASN	310669793	Y	20.00%	
Ribway Engineering Group, Inc.,	AFA	311406579	Y	75.00%	5.0% Maj. 94.0% Other
Gannett Fleming, Inc.	MAJ	232935505	Y	5.00%	
DLZ, Inc	ASN	311268980	Y	10.00%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	311167506	Y	5.00%	
Edsall & Associates	FBE	311022019	Y	5.00%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran and Randall Bowman. Non-voting members, include a representative from EBOCO, who was invited to attend but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

Stantec Consulting Services received 92.00 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was EMH&T, Inc. with 87.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the eight evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Stantec	92.00
EMH&T	87.67
CMT	86.00
Parsons-Brinckerhoff	86.00
Strand	85.67
CEC	82.00
Jones-Stuckey	81.33
Ribway	80.67

The Committee would like to submit Stantec Consulting Services for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Stantec submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Stantec provided a very strong Project Manager.
2. Stantec put significant effort into their proposal and demonstrated an investment in project.
3. Their proposal offered pros and cons to suggestions provided by the City and discussed alternatives with examples.
4. Their proposal demonstrated extensive field investigations and discussed the importance of working with stakeholders.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee’s recommendation, Stantec Consulting Services
2. Reject the committee’s recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Alex Cofield

Capital Fiscal Manager
City of Columbus
Department of Public Service
Office of Support Services
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

aacofield@columbus.gov