

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities
 Division: Water

CIP Number:
 Project Name:
 Funding Source:
 Bid Opening Date:
 Engineer's Estimate

Lowest Bidder: \$21,146,620.00

	Kokosing	Kenmore	Dugan & Mevers
Bid Tab Amount:	\$21,146,620.00	\$21,956,990.00	\$22,717,200.00

FACTORS				
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 2-3) & Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u>				
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	12.8%	80.0%	10.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	50%-50%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	100%-ER	100%-ER	100%-EE
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0

		Kokosing	Kenmore	Dugan & Meyers
Bid Tab Amount:		\$21,146,620.00	\$21,956,990.00	\$22,717,200.00
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	"N/A"	yes	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>				
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes; see comments
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	Sewer # not given	SW0230, P1879	SW303
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar Amount	\$21,146,620.00		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0%	4%	7%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 29) - Environmental Preference</u>				
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	3.83%	7.43%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$810,370.00	\$1,570,580.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	n/a	no	no
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. 30-33) - Statements and Affidavits</u>				
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Proposal (Pg. 8 {11}) - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Proposal (Pg. 9 {12}) - Proposal Signature</u>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 34 {35}) - Proposal Bond</u>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-1	0
	Division's Recommendation:	KOKOSING CONS		

(
Department:	<u>690428-10002</u>
Division:	<u>DRWP Treatment Capacity Increase</u> <u>Water Works Enlargement Voted Bonds</u> <u>12/19/12</u>
Lowest Bidder:	<u>\$35,519,550.00</u>
Bid Tab Amount:	Walsh \$23,085,700.00 Shook Walbridge JV \$24,547,600.00

FACTORS			
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 2-3) & Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u>			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	60.0%	60.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	85%-ER/15%-EE	see comment
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	4%-ER/4%-EE	see comment
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0

		Walsh	Shook Walbridge JV
Bid Tab Amount:		\$23,085,700.00	\$24,547,600.00
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes; see comments	yes; see comments
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u>			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	see comment
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	see comment
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0293	see comment
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar Amount			
Percent Over Low Bid:		9%	16%
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	no
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 29) - Environmental Preference</u>			
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	9.17%	16.08%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$1,939,080.00	\$3,400,980.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. 30-33) - Statements and Affidavits</u>			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Proposal (Pg. 8 {11}) - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u>			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Proposal (Pg. 9 {12}) - Proposal Signature</u>			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 34 {35}) - Proposal Bond</u>			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	no	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	-1	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-2	-1
Division's Recommendation:		TRUCTION CO., INC.	

(
Department: Division:		
Lowest Bidder:		
Bid Tab Amount:		Adams Robinson \$24,872,100.00
FACTORS		
<u>Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 2-3) & Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	no
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:</u>		
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):	
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>		
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	50.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	70%/30%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	35%/65%
Negative Factors:		0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	no
Negative Factors:		-1

		Adams Robinson
		Bid Tab Amount: \$24,872,100.00
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED		
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control		
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes; see comments
Form 12 - Availability		
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates		
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	yes
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0329
	Negative Factors:	0
		Lowest Bid Dollar Amount
		Percent Over Low Bid: 18%
		Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid) no
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 29) - Environmental Preference		
	Has last sentence regarding local credit been omitted (Y/N)	yes
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	see comment
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	17.62%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$3,725,480.00
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no
Bid Supp Forms (Pgs. 30-33) - Statements and Affidavits		
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Proposal (Pg. 8 {11}) - Addenda Acknlgmt.		
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes
Proposal (Pg. 9 {12}) - Proposal Signature		
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
Bid Supp Forms (Pg. 34 {35}) - Proposal Bond		
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes
	Negative Factors:	0
		Grand Total Negative Factors: -3
		Division's Recommendation: