

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-10000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Beaver Excavating Co. 2000 Beaver Pl. Ave. S.W., Canton, Oh 44706		Ames Construction Inc. 2000 Ames Dr., Burnsville, MN 55306	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
1	General Construction	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$55,357,710.00	XXXX	\$42,951,885.00	XXXX	\$57,350,000.00
2	Construction Dewatering & Groundwater Monitoring	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,240,772.00	XXXX	\$2,588,000.00	XXXX	\$6,100,000.00
3	Reservoir Geotextile	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$7,077,091.00	XXXX	\$7,349,000.00	XXXX	\$5,600,000.00
4	Reservoir Geomembrane Supply & Installation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$20,820,000.00	XXXX	\$16,914,000.00	XXXX	\$16,534,000.00
5	Geomembrane System Leak Location Survey	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$1,388,000.00	XXXX	\$689,500.00	XXXX	\$615,000.00
6	I&C Security Devices and Cameras	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$90,000.00	XXXX	\$80,800.00	XXXX	\$90,000.00
7	ACM Abatement (Transite Siding & Linoleum Flooring)	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$85,810.00	XXXX	\$8,000.00	XXXX	\$80,000.00
8	Overexcavation	100,000	CY	\$5.00	\$500,000.00	\$4.46	\$446,000.00	\$8.00	\$800,000.00
9	Remove Agricultural Tile & Replace with Zone 1 Structural Fill	80,000	LF	\$2.00	\$160,000.00	\$2.06	\$164,800.00	\$4.00	\$320,000.00
10	Replace and/or Provide 4-inch, 6-inch, & 8-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	2,300	LF	\$37.00	\$85,100.00	\$35.34	\$81,282.00	\$40.00	\$92,000.00
11	Replace and/or Provide 12-inch & 18-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	3,900	LF	\$57.50	\$224,250.00	\$31.39	\$122,421.00	\$40.00	\$156,000.00
12	Replace and/or Provide 24-inch & 36-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	6,200	LF	\$68.00	\$421,600.00	\$44.00	\$272,800.00	\$50.00	\$310,000.00
13	ALLOWANCE - Union County Haul Road Inspection and Permits	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000.00
14	ALLOWANCE - Water Well Repair & Replacement	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00
15	ALLOWANCE - Sinkhole Remediation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00
16	ALLOWANCE - Electrical Service to Site	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000.00
	SUBTOTAL				\$92,755,333.00		\$72,973,488.00		\$89,352,000.00
	Construction Contingency (5% of subtotal)				\$4,637,766.65		\$3,648,674.40		\$4,467,600.00
	BIDDER'S TOTAL				\$97,393,099.65		\$76,622,162.40		\$93,819,600.00

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-100000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Beaver Excavating Co. 2000 Beaver Pl. Ave. S.W., Canton, Oh 44706		Ames Construction Inc. 2000 Ames Dr., Burnsville, MN 55306	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
	% DIFFERENCE FROM ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE						-21.33%		-3.67%
	Contract Compliance No. (Pg. P-9)						34-0905531 (exp. 6/23/12, majority)		41-0871375 (exp. 1/12/13, majority)
	(3) Addendum Ackldgmnts. Completed? (Pg. P-5)						yes		yes
	Local Vendor? (Pg. P-8)						no		no
	Proposed Subs C.C.? (Pg. P-32, 33)						all are C.C. now (1/31/11)		Knight Electric not C.C.; other aps. Incl.
	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-30/31)						yes		yes
	Bonding Company (Pg. P-2)						Hartford Fire Insurance Co.		Travelers Casual & Surety
	Bond Amount (Pg. P-2)						"Ten Percent of Bid + Alternates..."		"Ten Percent of Total Amount of Bid"
	Proposal Bond Amount Required (10%)						\$7,662,216.24		\$9,381,960.00
	Proposal Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-28/29)						yes		yes
							Corrected rounding errors		

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-10000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Tully/Thalle Constr. 900 NC 86 North, Hillsborough, NC 27278		E.S. Wagner Co. 840 Patchen Rd., Oregon, Oh 43616	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
1	General Construction	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$55,357,710.00	XXXX	\$66,257,000.00	XXXX	\$53,331,200.00
2	Construction Dewatering & Groundwater Monitoring	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,240,772.00	XXXX	\$4,000,000.00	XXXX	\$20,000,000.00
3	Reservoir Geotextile	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$7,077,091.00	XXXX	\$5,775,000.00	XXXX	\$10,000,000.00
4	Reservoir Geomembrane Supply & Installation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$20,820,000.00	XXXX	\$16,555,000.00	XXXX	\$16,500,000.00
5	Geomembrane System Leak Location Survey	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$1,388,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$555,475.00
6	I&C Security Devices and Cameras	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$90,000.00	XXXX	\$64,000.00	XXXX	\$100,000.00
7	ACM Abatement (Transite Siding & Linoleum Flooring)	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$85,810.00	XXXX	\$16,000.00	XXXX	\$20,000.00
8	Overexcavation	100,000	CY	\$5.00	\$500,000.00	\$6.00	\$600,000.00	\$6.25	\$625,000.00
9	Remove Agricultural Tile & Replace with Zone 1 Structural Fill	80,000	LF	\$2.00	\$160,000.00	\$7.00	\$560,000.00	\$1.70	\$136,000.00
10	Replace and/or Provide 4-inch, 6-inch, & 8-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	2,300	LF	\$37.00	\$85,100.00	\$15.00	\$34,500.00	\$30.00	\$69,000.00
11	Replace and/or Provide 12-inch & 18-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	3,900	LF	\$57.50	\$224,250.00	\$23.00	\$89,700.00	\$29.00	\$113,100.00
12	Replace and/or Provide 24-inch & 36-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	6,200	LF	\$68.00	\$421,600.00	\$31.00	\$192,200.00	\$37.50	\$232,500.00
13	ALLOWANCE - Union County Haul Road Inspection and Permits	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000.00
14	ALLOWANCE - Water Well Repair & Replacement	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00
15	ALLOWANCE - Sinkhole Remediation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00
16	ALLOWANCE - Electrical Service to Site	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000.00
	SUBTOTAL				\$92,755,333.00		\$95,948,400.00		\$102,987,275.00
	Construction Contingency (5% of subtotal)				\$4,637,766.65		\$4,797,420.00		\$5,149,363.75
	BIDDER'S TOTAL				\$97,393,099.65		\$100,745,820.00		\$108,136,638.75

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-100000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Tully/Thalle Constr. 900 NC 86 North, Hillsborough, NC 27278		E.S. Wagner Co. 840 Patchen Rd., Oregon, Oh 43616	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
	% DIFFERENCE FROM ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE						3.44%		11.03%
	Contract Compliance No. (Pg. P-9)						no joint application included		34-0907180 (exp. 1/10/13, majority)
	(3) Addendum Ackldgmnts. Completed? (Pg. P-5)						yes		yes
	Local Vendor? (Pg. P-8)						no		no
	Proposed Subs C.C.? (Pg. P-32, 33)						Allied Fence not C.C.; other aps. Incl.		1 apl. Included; 7 not C.C.
	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-30/31)						yes		yes
	Bonding Company (Pg. P-2)						Federal Insurance & Liberty Mutual		Hartford Fire Insurance Co.
	Bond Amount (Pg. P-2)						"Ten Percent of the Attached Bid"		"Ten Percent of Total Amount Bid"
	Proposal Bond Amount Required (10%)						\$10,074,582.00		\$10,813,663.88
	Proposal Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-28/29)						no		yes
							Corporation Bid Affidavit not compl City Atty says not necessary.		Corrected rounding errors

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-10000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Kenmore Construction Co. 700 Home Ave., Akron, Oh 44310		Barnard Construction Co. 701 Gold Ave., Bozeman, MT 59715	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
1	General Construction	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$55,357,710.00	XXXX	\$74,950,000.00	XXXX	\$77,625,000
2	Construction Dewatering & Groundwater Monitoring	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,240,772.00	XXXX	\$2,500,000.00	XXXX	\$5,500,000
3	Reservoir Geotextile	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$7,077,091.00	XXXX	\$6,200,000.00	XXXX	\$9,250,000
4	Reservoir Geomembrane Supply & Installation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$20,820,000.00	XXXX	\$17,000,000.00	XXXX	\$15,100,000
5	Geomembrane System Leak Location Survey	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$1,388,000.00	XXXX	\$650,000.00	XXXX	\$515,000
6	I&C Security Devices and Cameras	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$90,000.00	XXXX	\$75,000.00	XXXX	\$65,000
7	ACM Abatement (Transite Siding & Linoleum Flooring)	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$85,810.00	XXXX	\$25,000.00	XXXX	\$230,000
8	Overexcavation	100,000	CY	\$5.00	\$500,000.00	\$6.50	\$650,000.00	\$6.00	\$600,000
9	Remove Agricultural Tile & Replace with Zone 1 Structural Fill	80,000	LF	\$2.00	\$160,000.00	\$5.00	\$400,000.00	\$4.25	\$340,000
10	Replace and/or Provide 4-inch, 6-inch, & 8-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	2,300	LF	\$37.00	\$85,100.00	\$30.00	\$69,000.00	\$24.00	\$55,200
11	Replace and/or Provide 12-inch & 18-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	3,900	LF	\$57.50	\$224,250.00	\$50.00	\$195,000.00	\$45.00	\$175,500
12	Replace and/or Provide 24-inch & 36-inch Agricultural Tile with Manholes, Cleanouts, and other Incidentals, as required	6,200	LF	\$68.00	\$421,600.00	\$65.00	\$403,000.00	\$50.00	\$310,000
13	ALLOWANCE - Union County Haul Road Inspection and Permits	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000.00	XXXX	\$5,000
14	ALLOWANCE - Water Well Repair & Replacement	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000
15	ALLOWANCE - Sinkhole Remediation	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000.00	XXXX	\$500,000
16	ALLOWANCE - Electrical Service to Site	1	L.S.	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000.00	XXXX	\$300,000
	SUBTOTAL				\$92,755,333.00		\$104,422,000.00		\$111,070,700.00
	Construction Contingency (5% of subtotal)				\$4,637,766.65		\$5,221,100.00		\$5,553,535.00
	BIDDER'S TOTAL				\$97,393,099.65		\$109,643,100.00		\$116,624,235.00

BID TABULATION
COLUMBUS UPGROUND RESERVOIRS PROJECT
RESERVOIR SITE NO. 2
CIP NO. 690370-100000, CT No. 1032-Part 1

Pay Item	Description	Est. Qty	Unit	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Kenmore Construction Co. 700 Home Ave., Akron, Oh 44310		Barnard Construction Co. 701 Gold Ave., Bozeman, MT 59715	
				Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total	Cost per Unit	Extended Total
	% DIFFERENCE FROM ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE						12.58%		19.75%
	Contract Compliance No. (Pg. P-9)					34-0802152 (exp. 8/4/11, majority)		81-0384712 (exp. 1/14/13, majority)	
	(3) Addendum Ackldgmnts. Completed? (Pg. P-5)						yes		yes
	Local Vendor? (Pg. P-8)						no		no
	Proposed Subs C.C.? (Pg. P-32, 33)						yes		apls. Included
	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-30/31)						yes		yes
	Bonding Company (Pg. P-2)						Ohio Farmers Insurance		Federal Insurance Co.
	Bond Amount (Pg. P-2)						"Ten Percent +Alternates..."		"Ten Percent of the Total Amount Bid"
	Proposal Bond Amount Required (10%)						\$10,964,310.00		\$11,662,423.50
	Proposal Affidavit Completed? (Pg. P-28/29)						yes		yes