

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 11, 2011 12:20 PM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Popa, Nicholas J.; Stewart, Terry L.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan

I approve of the recommended consultant for award

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 09, 2011 2:59 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Popa, Nicholas J.; Stewart, Terry L.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** August 9, 2011

**Subject:** Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan. The budget is \$135,000; amount of the contract shall be \$135,000 funded by a 2011 bonds.

The intent of this project is to provide the Department of Public Service, Division of Mobility Options, additional resources for engineering services to preliminary engineer and design recommendations from the Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan (WPCMP). Work will include detailed design of several features throughout the Weinland Park area, in addition to the 4th Street and Summit Street corridors. Designs are to conform to the Weinland Park Community Mobility Plan unless specified otherwise.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from June 20, 2011, to July 21, 2011. The city received six (6) responses. A proposal from RW Armstrong and Associates was deemed non-responsive due to their not meeting all required ODOT pre-qualification categories. The remaining five (5) proposals were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on August 9, 2011. The responding firms were:

<b>CONSULTANT Sub-consultant</b>	<b>Business Enterprise Status</b>	<b>Contract Compliance Number</b>	<b>Active</b>	<b>% OF WORK</b>	<b>% MAJ. % OTH.</b>
<b>MOODY NOLAN</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>310807948</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>45 or 50%</b>	<b>45% MAJ 55% OTH</b>
W.E. Stillson Consulting Group	Majority	311702689	Y	40%	
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	5 or 10%	
BBC&M Engineering	Majority	311166709	Y	5%	
<b>STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>112167170</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>75%</b>	<b>90% MAJ 10% OTH</b>
EMH&T	Majority	310685594	Y	15%	
ENGAGE Public Affairs	FBE	201593274	Y	10%	
<b>COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS, INC.</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>3% MAJ 97% OTH</b>
Traffic Engineering Services, Inc.	MBE	311178383	Y	6%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	MBE	3100680767	Y	5%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	311167506	Y	3%	
MSI Design Group	Majority	31310090	Y	3%	
<b>SHAFFER POMEROY, LTD.</b>	<b>Unknown</b>	<b>202996708</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>80%</b>	<b>15% MAJ 5% OTH 80% Unknown</b>
Trans Associates	Majority	251634385	Y	10%	
BBC&M Engineering	Majority	311166709	Y	5%	
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	5%	
<b>KABIL ASSOCIATES</b>	<b>AS1</b>	<b>311401720</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>60%</b>	<b>20% MAJ 80% OTH</b>
GPD Group	Majority	341134715	Y	10%	
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	5%	
CTL Engineering, Inc.	MBE	3100680767	Y	10%	
Hardlines Design Company	ASN	311688928	Y	5%	

Bauer, Davidson & Merchant, Inc.	Majority	310807948	N	10%	
----------------------------------	----------	-----------	---	-----	--

**Proposal Findings:**

Section A of Moody Nolan’s proposal lists Moody Nolan’s percentage of work as 50% and Lawhon & Associates as 5%, while Section B lists 45% for Moody Nolan and 10% for Lawhon & Associates.

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Hassan Zahran and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

Moody-Nolan received 85.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. with 83.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the five evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Moody Nolan	85.33
Stantec	83.33
Columbus Engineering Consultants	80.00
Shaffer Pomeroy	78.33
Kabil Associates	68.33

The Committee would like to submit Moody Nolan for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Moody Nolan submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Moody Nolan demonstrated a solid team approach throughout the proposal.
2. Moody Nolan showed experience with incorporating students into the design, which is important as college students and an elementary school are both within the area.
3. Moody Nolan has multiple past projects that are similar in nature.
4. Moody Nolan offered strong Ohio experience.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee’s recommendation, Moody Nolan
2. Reject the committee’s recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

**Alex Cofield**

Capital Fiscal Manager  
City of Columbus  
Department of Public Service  
Office of Support Services  
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557  
(f) 614-645-7549  
aacobfield@columbus.gov